

ITEM 1

## MINUTES

FOR A REGULAR MEETING OF THE CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION TO BE HELD AT  
6:00 P.M., THURSDAY EVENING, OCTOBER 13, 2016, CITY COUNCIL CHAMBERS  
300 NORTH CAMPBELL – 1ST FLOOR

All matters listed under the Consent Agenda below will be considered by the Commission to be routine and will be enacted by one motion in the form listed below. There will be no separate discussion of these items unless members of the Commission or persons in the audience request specific items be removed from the Consent agenda to the Regular Agenda for discussion prior to the time the Commission votes on the motion to adopt the Consent Agenda.

Members Present: Williams, Antonio – Vice-Chair  
Barde, Jacob  
Brannon, Bob R.  
De Los Santos, Dalia  
Devine, Michael  
Monteros, Abraham  
Ramirez, Terry  
Ross, Amy

Members Absent: Bowling IV, Robert – Chair

Meeting convened at 6:03 p.m. with seven Commissioners present and Vice Chair Williams presiding. Vice Chair Williams asked if there were any changes to Agenda or order of items. Secretary Ross stated no changes.

### CONSENT AGENDA

1. Approval of Minutes:

September 8, 2016 Civil Service Commission Meeting

**MOTION MADE BY COMMISSIONER BRANNON AND SECONDED BY COMMISSIONER RAMIREZ TO APPROVE THE MINUTES; MOTION PASSED UNANIMOUSLY.**

2. Notation: Assignment of Hearing Officers to the Following Appeals

- A. Jesus Jimenez – Environmental – Termination – Patricia Palafox
- B. Armando Pena – Public Health - Suspension - William Ellis
- C. Michael Bolanos – Sun Metro – Termination – Robert Blumenfeld

**MOTION MADE BY COMMISSIONER BRANNON AND SECONDED BY COMMISSIONER RAMIREZ TO APPROVE CONSENT AGENDA; MOTION PASSED UNANIMOUSLY.**

### REGULAR AGENDA

3. Discussion and Action on Hearing Officer's Reports and Recommendations:

- A. Miguel A. Castaneda-El Paso Water Utilities-Suspension

Discussion by Assistant City Attorney Anelisa Benavides, Vice Chair Williams, HR Utility Manager Ana Sanchez, Commissioners Brannon, Ross, and CSC Legal Advisor Elizabeth Ruhmann.

**MOTION MADE BY COMMISSIONER BRANNON AND SECONDED BY COMMISSIONER DEVINE TO POSTPONE ITEM 3A UNTIL NEXT MEETING IN ORDER TO HAVE AN INTERPRETER PRESENT FOR THE APPELLANT; MOTION PASSED UNANIMOUSLY.**

**B. Juan Olavez-Sun Metro-Termination**

Discussion by Assistant City Attorney Anelisa Benavides, Appellant's Representative David Guzman, Vice Chair Williams, Commissioners Ramirez, Brannon, Ross, Devine, De Los Santos, Barde, CSC Legal Advisor Elizabeth Ruhmann, Sun Metro Director Jay Banasiak, Appellant Juan Olavez.

**MOTION MADE BY COMMISSIONER DEVINE AND SECONDED BY COMMISSIONER BRANNON TO APPROVE HEARING OFFICER'S RECOMMENDATION AND THAT APPEAL BE DENIED; MOTION PASSED UNANIMOUSLY.**

4. Discussion and Action on proposed amendment to Rule 8; Section 8 (Formal Counseling), as submitted by David Guzman, AFSCME Local 59 at the CSC meeting of September 8, 2016. (Per Commissioner Williams)

Discussion by Vice Chair Williams, AFSCME Local 59 Representative David Guzman, Commissioners Brannon, Ross, Barde, De Los Santos, Ramirez, Devine, HR Director Linda Ball Thomas, and Chief Performance Officer Nancy Bartlett and CSC Legal Advisor Elizabeth Ruhmann. Speakers: Jaime A. Arellano, Jr., David Ochoa, Martha Castro, and Alex Lugo. Suspension of rules for additional speaker: Louie Munoz.

**MOTION MADE BY COMMISSIONER BARDE AND SECONDED BY COMMISSIONER RAMIREZ TO RECOMMEND TO CITY COUNCIL THE PROPOSED AMENDMENTS TO RULE 8 SECTION 8 WITH CHANGES; MOTION PASSED UNANIMOUSLY.**

**MOTION MADE BY SECRETARY ROSS AND SECONDED BY COMMISSIONER BARDE REQUESTING A FIVE MINUTE RECESS FROM 8:41 P.M. TO 8:47 P.M.**

5. Discussion and Analysis on Sun Metro's process for issuing formal counselings. (Submitted By Jaime A. Arellano, Jr.)

Discussion by Jaime A. Arellano, Jr., Vice Chair Williams, CSC Legal Advisor Elizabeth Ruhmann, Commissioners Barde, Ross, Ramirez, Sun Metro Director Jay Banasiak, and HR Departmental Manager Sun Metro Erica Salamanca.

Speakers: Eduardo Acosta and Alex Lugo.

**NO ACTION; DISCUSSION ONLY.**

6. Discussion and Action on Appeal of Disqualification to take Examination and/or Removal of Name from Eligible List in accordance with C.S.C. Rule 5.1.(a) and City's Application Policy:

**A. Elisa Gallegos – Recreation Program Supervisor**

Discussion by Appellant Elisa Gallegos, Vice Chair Williams, Commissioners Ross, Devine, Ramirez, De Los Santos, Brannon, Barde, and HR Departmental Manager Ada Hatten.

**MOTION MADE BY COMMISSIONER DEVINE AND SECONDED BY COMMISSIONER ROSS TO DENY APPEAL; MOTION FAILED BY A VOTE OF 3 TO 4 (APPEAL APPROVED).**

AYES TO DENY: DEVINE, ROSS, BARDE

NAYES TO DENY: BRANNON, MONTEROS, RAMIREZ, DE LOS SANTO

B. Jose L Lujan, Jr. – Recreation Program Supervisor

Discussion by Appellant Jose L. Lujan, Jr., Vice Chair Williams, Commissioners Brannon, Ross, De Los Santos, and Commissioner Barde.

**MOTION MADE BY COMMISSIONER DEVINE AND SECONDED BY COMMISSIONER RAMIREZ TO DENY APPEAL; MOTION PASSED UNANIMOUSLY.**

C. Alejandro Paz – Engineering Technician

Discussion by Appellant Alejandro Paz, HR Departmental Manager Nuria Valdez, and Commissioner Barde.

**MOTION MADE BY COMMISSIONER BARDE AND SECONDED BY COMMISSIONER RAMIREZ TO APPROVE APPEAL; MOTION PASSED UNANIMOUSLY.**

### **EXECUTIVE SESSION**

The Civil Service Commission may retire into Executive Session pursuant to Civil Service Commission Rule 1, Section 11(a) and the Texas Government Code, Section 551, Subchapter D to discuss any of the following: (The items listed below are matters of the sort routinely discussed in Executive Session, but the Commission may move to Executive Session any of the items on this agenda, consistent with the terms of the Open Meetings Act.). The Commission will return to open session to take any final action.

Section 551.071 CONSULTATION WITH ATTORNEY

Section 551.074 PERSONNEL MATTERS

**MOTION MADE BY COMMISSIONER ROSS AND SECONDED BY COMMISSIONER RAMIREZ TO ADJOURN; MOTION PASSED UNANIMOUSLY.**

**MEETING ADJOURNED AT 10:17 P.M.**

---

**Robert Bowling IV, Chair**

---

**Amy Ross, C.S.C. Secretary**

---

**Date Approved**