



**HISTORIC LANDMARK COMMISSION MEETING MINUTES
10TH FLOOR – MAYOR’S BOARD ROOM
JANUARY 10, 2011
4:00 P.M.**

The El Paso Historic Landmark Commission held a public hearing in the City Council Chambers, 2nd Floor, City Hall Building, January 10, 2011, 4:00 p.m.

The following Commissioners answered roll call:

Mr. Joe Riccillo, Chair
Ms. Stephanie Fernandez
Mr. Joel Guzman
Mr. Ricardo Gonzalez
Mr. Randy Brock
Mr. Jim Booher

The following City Staff were present:

Ms. Cynthia Osborn, City Attorney’s Office, Assistant City Attorney
Ms. Providencia Velazquez, Planning and Economic Development, Historic Preservation Officer
Mr. Tony De La Cruz, Planning and Economic Development, Planner

Chair Riccillo called the meeting to order.

I. CALL TO THE PUBLIC – PUBLIC COMMENT

Mr. Fred Morales, El Paso/Juarez Historian, commented on the unsightly property conditions of The Belgian Bakery, the site of one of the earliest major bakeries in El Paso. He noted El Paso Laundry Supply later acquired the property and built a water tower; however, the water tower was subsequently demolished. Remnants of the poorly demolished water tower are still visible. Additionally, Mr. Morales stated the property located next door, 910 S. Chihuahua, is also an eyesore – the property is littered with trash and weeds, the structure has no windows and part of the roof is missing. Mr. Morales felt the house could be refurbished; however, if not, he thought the structure should be demolished.

He requested Staff research whether or not the structure can/can not be refurbished and/or if the structure should be demolished. He would like to see some improvements.

Chair Riccillo requested Staff update the condition of the properties on the next HLC agenda.

Mayor
John F. Cook

City Council

District 1
Ann Morgan Lilly

District 2
Susannah M. Byrd

District 3
Emma Acosta

District 4
Carl L. Robinson

District 5
Rachel Quintana

District 6
Eddie Holguin Jr.

District 7
Steve Ortega

District 8
Beto O'Rourke

City Manager
Joyce A. Wilson



CHANGES TO THE AGENDA

There were no changes.

MOTION:

Motion made by Chair Riccillo, seconded by Commissioner Guzman and **UNANIMOUSLY CARRIED TO APPROVE THE AGENDA AS IT STANDS.**

II. REGULAR AGENDA – DISCUSSION AND ACTION

Certificate of Appropriateness

1. **HPC11-00001** Lots 17 to 21 and the West 9 feet of 22, Block 16, Franklin Heights Addition, City of El Paso, El Paso County, Texas.
- Location: 1101 Magoffin Avenue
Historic District: Magoffin
Property Owner: Texas Historical Commission
Representative: Leslie Bergloff
Representative District: #8
Existing Zoning: A-3/H (Apartment/Historic)
Year Built: N/A
Historic Status: N/A
Request: Applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for the construction of an off-site parking lot for the Magoffin Home.
Application Filed: 12/20/2010
45 Day Expiration: 2/3/2011

Ms. Velazquez gave a PowerPoint presentation and explained the applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for the construction of an off-site parking lot for the Magoffin Home State Park. Ms. Velazquez explained Staff felt it best to get the Historic Landmark Commission's recommendation first. Furthermore, the State has always had a good working relationship with the City regarding consultations, meeting requirements, applying for permits, etc. Staff recommends **APPROVAL** of the proposed scope of work based on the following:

Magoffin Historic District guidelines recommendations

- *Place the parking area where it will have minimal visual impact on the area;*
- *Parking areas should be screened with compatible fencing materials and/or landscaping;*
- *The combination of vegetation with fencing materials will enhance the quality of the site.*

Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation recommendation

- *Designing required new parking so that it is as unobtrusive as possible, thus minimizing the effect on the historic character of the setting. "Shared" parking should also be planned so that several businesses can utilize one parking area as opposed to introducing random, multiple lots.*



Chair Riccillo commented on and/or asked Staff:

1. Historic Landmark Commission does not have purview on rezoning cases;
2. Whether or not the property(ies) should be rezoned prior to presentation before Historic Landmark Commission; and
3. Does the State require approval from the Historic Landmark Commission on their properties?

Ms. Leslie Bergloff, Director, Magoffin Home State Park, explained there is no existing on-site visitors' parking. Due to increasing numbers in visitors coming to the Magoffin Home, it is imperative that we provide visitors safe parking and easy access.

Mr. Todd Jones, landscape architect, explained the ponds are approximately 2 to 2.5 feet deep with gradual side slopes.

Mr. De La Cruz explained any lighting request must meet code (dark sky ordinance) requirements. He noted there will be a six foot, cinder block/stucco wall separating the alley from the parking lot. He commented on a possible on-site Magoffin State Home Visitor's Center.

Chair Riccillo asked if Commissioners had any questions for Staff or the applicant. There being none.

Prior to the vote, Ms. Bergloff clarified, even if the zoning changes this will be the design of the parking lot/landscaping.

MOTION:

Motion made by Commissioner Guzman, seconded by Commissioner Brock and **UNANIMOUSLY CARRIED TO APPROVE AS RECOMMENDED BY STAFF.**

Following the vote, Chair Riccillo discussed zoning changes impacting historic neighborhoods.

Chair Riccillo requested the following be posted on the next HLC agenda:

- Revisiting/rewriting the code including Historic Landmark Commission recommendations for rezoning applications.

2. **HPC11-00002** Lots 25 to 27, All of Blocks, Manhattan Heights Addition, City of El Paso, El Paso County, Texas.
- Location: 3200 Copper Avenue
- Historic District: Manhattan Heights
- Property Owner: City of El Paso
- Representative: Sam Rodriguez/Fred Perez
- Representative District: #2
- Existing Zoning: R-3/H (Residential/Historic)
- Year Built: 1995
- Historic Status: Non-Contributing



Request: Applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for the construction of additions to Memorial Park library.

Application Filed: 12/20/2010

45 Day Expiration: 2/3/2011

Ms. Velazquez gave a PowerPoint presentation and explained the applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for the construction of additions to Memorial Park library. Staff recommends **APPROVAL WITH MODIFICATIONS** of the proposed scope of work based on the following:

- Existing structure is a non-contributing property constructed in 1995 and located within the Manhattan Heights Historic District.
- The building does not possess any historically significant details that will be damaged or destroyed by the construction of the new additions.
- Proposed location of construction required minimal disturbance of the terrain and landscaping.

Additionally, Staff recommends:

- That the proposed wrought iron enclosure at the rear of the structure eliminate the metal mesh currently attached to the metal pickets;
- Distinguishing between new/old construction;

The *Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation* recommends:

- *Designing and constructing new additions to buildings when required by the use. New work should be compatible with the character of the setting in terms of size, scale design, material, color, and texture.*
- *Designing new exterior additions to buildings or adjacent new construction which is compatible with the historic character of the site and which preserves the historic relationship between the building or buildings and the landscape*
- *Minimizing disturbance of terrain around buildings or elsewhere on the site, thus reducing the possibility of destroying or damaging important landscape features or archeological resources.*
- *Designing new work to be compatible in materials, size, scale, and texture.*

Mr. Fred Lopez, AIA, ARTchitecture, suggested a reveal to distinguish between the new/old construction. He noted the mesh between the wrought iron was there to prevent vandalism.

Chair Riccillo asked if Commissioners had any questions for Staff or the applicant. There being none.

MOTION:

Motion made by Chair Riccillo, seconded by Commissioner Booher and **UNANIMOUSLY CARRIED TO APPROVE THE CASE WITH MODIFICATIONS:**

1. **A REVEAL TO DISTINGUISH THE NEW CONSTRUCTION 100 YEARS FROM NOW;**
2. **THAT THE WROUGHT IRON ENCLOSURE NOT BE DONE WITH MESH; AND**
3. **FOR AESTHETIC PURPOSES, THE WROUGHT IRON BARS BE CLOSER TOGETHER**



3. Addresses of property HLC Commissioners have requested that HLC staff review or investigate and provide a report to the HLC. If no addresses are submitted in advance and listed under this agenda item, Commissioners may announce such addresses under this agenda item. Discussion on property announced at this meeting will take place during the next regularly scheduled meeting. January 10, 2011 deadline for HLC members to request for agenda items to be scheduled for the January 24, 2011 meeting. January 24, 2011 deadline for HLC members to request for agenda items to be scheduled for the February 14, 2011 meeting.

A. Magoffin Villas at 915, 917, 1001 Magoffin Avenue and 1000, 1008, 1010 Myrtle Avenue

Ms. Velazquez gave a PowerPoint presentation and noted the photos were taken approximately one week ago. Regarding the plans, no changes have been made

B. 215 N. Mesa Street (new information)

No new information

C. 1725 Arizona Avenue (Fall Mansion)

Engineering and Construction Management Staff sent bids out; Engineering Staff will update Commissioners when available.

Chair Riccillo requested Staff leave the item on for the future agendas.

D. 111 N. Oregon Street (formerly the First National Bank building)

Ms. Velazquez gave a PowerPoint presentation and noted the structure was designed by Trost & Trost. She noted there are actually two buildings; the addition was constructed in the 1920s. Renovations to the structure included removing the cornices and applying stucco to the exterior; however, the structure can be brought back to its original state. The structure is part of the Downtown Historic District; however, the structure has been determined ineligible for listing in the National Register.

Commissioner Guzman thought there might be a Code Compliance case regarding 111 N. Oregon Street.

Mr. De La Cruz will research and provide information for Commissioners at the next meeting.

Chair Riccillo explained Commissioners are always interested in discussing properties, not located within historic districts; that might be possible nominations for H-Overlay, contribute to the culture of the City, etc.



Commissioner Gonzalez requested the old Labor Temple located on Oregon Street, formerly known as the El Paso Times Building, be added to the next HLC agenda.

HLC Staff Reports

4. Update on Administrative Review Cases since last HLC meeting for the properties listed on the attachment posted with this agenda. (See Attachment "A")

Commissioner Guzman asked if there were any other type of shingle other than the three dimensional shingle.

Mr. De La Cruz explained Owens-Corning has phased out the pre-tab shingles.

Planning & Economic Development Department Report

5. No updates to report.

Visionaries in Preservation Report

6. Discussion and action regarding VIP issues

Ms. Velazquez explained Staff is review the VIP committees and reconfiguring some of them, no repeats. Staff will bring the newly revised committees to Commissioners at the next HLC meeting.

Other Business

7. Approval of Historic Landmark Commission Meeting Minutes.
December 20, 2010

Chair Riccillo asked if Commissioners had any additions/changes/corrections/revisions. There was none.

MOTION:

Motion made by Chair Riccillo, seconded by Commissioner Guzman and **UNANIMOUSLY CARRIED TO APPROVE THE DECEMBER 20, 2010 MINUTES.**

FUTURE HLC AGENDA ITEM REQUESTS

1. 907 S. Chihuahua
2. Old Labor Temple
3. Discussion on the process of the Historic Landmark Commission's input going forth with rezoning cases, returning to the rezoning process prior to a specific case.
4. Methods and mechanisms of rewriting the ordinance regarding the Historic Landmark Commission's input for rezoning cases.
5. Changes regarding demolition to include viewing/photographing the structure prior to demolition.
6. Vacant Building Ordinance
7. Commissioner Villanueva, Jr. requested Staff provide Commissioners information regarding the American Furniture building.



Before adjourning, Chair Riccillo requested Commissioners inform Staff whether they will/will not be able to attend the next HLC meeting. He noted it is becoming difficult whether or not to expect a quorum.

No further business.

MOTION:

Motion made by Chair Riccillo, seconded by Commissioner Guzman and **UNANIMOUSLY CARRIED TO ADJOURN THE MEETING AT 5:14 P.M.**

