



**HISTORIC LANDMARK COMMISSION MEETING MINUTES
1st FLOOR, CITY COUNCIL CHAMBERS
CITY HALL BUILDING, 300 N. CAMPBELL
APRIL 7, 2014
4:00 P.M.**

The El Paso Historic Landmark Commission held a public hearing in the City Council Chambers, 1st Floor, City Hall Building, April 7, 4:00 p.m.

The following commissioners were present:

Chairman David Berchelmann
Vice-Chairman Edgar Lopez
Commissioner Beatriz Lucero
Commissioner Cesar Gomez
Commissioner William C. Helm II
Commissioner John L. Moses

The following commissioner was not present:

Commissioner Ricardo Fernandez

The following City staff members were present:

Ms. Providencia Velázquez, Historic Preservation Officer, Economic Development
Ms. Kristen Hamilton, Assistant City Attorney, Legal
Ms. Nickole Heater, Economic Development Liaison, Economic Development

CALL TO ORDER

Chairman Berchelmann called the meeting to order at 4:08 p.m., quorum present.

CHANGES TO THE AGENDA

None.

I. CALL TO THE PUBLIC – PUBLIC COMMENT

None.

Mayor
Oscar Leeser

City Council

District 1
Ann Morgan Lilly

District 2
Larry Romero

District 3
Emma Acosta

District 4
Carl L. Robinson

District 5
Dr. Michiel R. Noe

District 6
Eddie Holguin Jr.

District 7
Lilia B. Limon

District 8
Cortney C. Niland

City Manager
Joyce A. Wilson



II. REGULAR AGENDA – DISCUSSION AND ACTION

Certificate of Appropriateness

- 1. **PHAP14-00006:** Being 2 Radford Terrace Lot 22 (7366.12 Sq. Ft.), City of El Paso, El Paso County, Texas
- Location: 4601 King Arthur Court
- Historic District: Austin Terrace
- Property Owner: Martha Yee
- Representative: David Holguin
- Representative District: 2
- Existing Zoning: R-4/H (Residential/Historic)
- Year Built: 1996
- Historic Status: Non-Contributing
- Request: Certificate of Appropriateness for the enclosure of a pergola at the rear façade.
- Application Filed: 3/10/14
- 45 Day Expiration: 4/24/14

Ms. Velázquez gave a presentation and noted the property owner sought approval for a Certificate of Appropriateness for the enclosure of a pergola at the rear façade. The property is located on a corner lot in the northern portion of the Austin Terrace Historic District. Ms. Velázquez explained this request was presented to commissioners at the March 24th HLC meeting. At that time, the property owner proposed an enclosure consisting of surrounding walls (*siding*) with no windows, two garage doors on opposite facades and a small entrance leading to the rear of the home. Commissioners suggested design, construction material, and color alternatives and postponed the request to today’s meeting.

Via the presentation photos, Ms. Velázquez noted the wooden structure was somewhat visible, *above the rock wall*, from the public right-of-way. Additionally, this structure is not attached to the rear façade of the house.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION:

The Historic Preservation Office recommends **APPROVAL WITH MODIFICATIONS*** of the proposed scope of work based on the following recommendations:

Mayor
Oscar Leeser

City Council

District 1
Ann Morgan Lilly

District 2
Larry Romero

District 3
Emma Acosta

District 4
Carl L. Robinson

District 5
Dr. Michiel R. Noe

District 6
Eddie Holguin Jr.

District 7
Lilia B. Limon

District 8
Cortney C. Niland

City Manager
Joyce A. Wilson



The Design Guidelines for El Paso's Historic Districts, Sites, and Properties recommend the following:

- Site features that may exist on a property are swimming pools, pergolas, terraces and gardens and every effort should be made to retain those features that remain.
- Place non-traditional site features such as swimming pools, playground equipment, concrete pads and basketball goals, tree houses, dumpsters, and trash receptacles only in areas such as rear yards, where they are not visible from the street.

The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation recommend the following:

- New work should be compatible with the character of the setting in terms of size, scale design, material, color, and texture.
- Designing new work to be compatible in materials, size, scale, and texture.
- New construction will not destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property.

***THE MODIFICATIONS ARE THAT FRENCH DOORS BE USED INSTEAD OF GARAGE DOORS AND THAT THE SIDING BE HARDIE BOARD PAINTED IN A COMPATIBLE COLOR.**

Ms. Velázquez noted the property owner applied for and was authorized permits to construct the pergola; however, the Historic Preservation Office was not notified. It was brought to her attention, now that the property owner is requesting to enclose the structure, that the property is located in a historic district and requires the Commission's review and/or approval.

Chairman Berchelmann wondered what the height was of the existing pergola.

Mr. David Holguin, representing the property owner, responded the height of the existing pergola is 13 feet.

Basically, Vice-Chairman Lopez explained, the property owner is requesting to cover the pergola. He asked Ms. Velázquez if the property owner was required to apply for a permit to enclose the pergola.

Ms. Velázquez responded yes and clarified the property owner was granted a permit to construct the pergola; however, at that time city staff was not aware the property was located in a historic district.

Mayor
Oscar Leoser

City Council

District 1
Ann Morgan Lilly

District 2
Larry Romero

District 3
Emma Acosta

District 4
Carl L. Robinson

District 5
Dr. Michiel R. Noe

District 6
Eddie Holguin Jr.

District 7
Lilia B. Limon

District 8
Cortney C. Niland

City Manager
Joyce A. Wilson



Chairman Berchelmann asked commissioners if they were satisfied with the proposed modifications.

Vice-Chairman Lopez responded the design is the same as before except for the brick band on the corners and surrounding the garage doors. The brick element will now tie the home in the front. He felt the French doors would look much better than the garage doors proposed by the property owner.

Mr. David Holguin, representing the property owner, explained the property owner wanted garage doors for now but would probably have them installed at a later date. The idea of the garage doors was protection from the wind.

Chairman Berchelmann asked if the property owner would be agreeable to the modifications, French doors and Hardie board, painted in a compatible color, for siding.

Mr. Holguin responded he was not aware of the French door recommendation; however, the property owner would not be opposed to Hardie board. He reiterated the installation of the doors would take place at a later date, in phases, as noted on the site and elevation plans.

Vice-Chairman Lopez asked what the color of the metal roof will be and what is the color of the existing shingles on the house.

Mr. Holguin responded the metal roof will be white and the existing shingles are red.

From the beginning, Vice-Chairman Lopez stated, it is obvious the property owner intended to enclose the structure. Should commissioners approve the request, he was concerned that the Planning staff would not approve the request due to the setbacks.

Mr. Holguin responded the setbacks are in compliance with the code regarding detached structures.

Regarding the paint color for the siding, Ms. Velázquez asked Vice-Chairman Lopez what he might suggest.

Vice-Chairman Lopez did not have a recommendation for the color of the siding; however, he did recommend that the property owner try to match the new brick with the existing brick, as much as possible.

Mayor

Oscar Leeser

City Council

District 1

Ann Morgan Lilly

District 2

Larry Romero

District 3

Emma Acosta

District 4

Carl L. Robinson

District 5

Dr. Michiel R. Noe

District 6

Eddie Holguin Jr.

District 7

Lilia B. Limon

District 8

Cortney C. Niland

City Manager

Joyce A. Wilson



Mr. Holguin responded this was a recent construction; therefore, matching the brick color should not be an issue.

Regarding the recommendation for French doors, Mr. Moses noted there was no mention of French doors in the March 24, 2014 meeting minutes.

Ms. Velázquez responded no, commissioners did not recommend French doors at the previous meeting; however, with the addition of the brick, she thought the design needed to be softened somewhat.

Mr. Holguin did not perceive any issues with the French doors; however, he reiterated the doors will be installed, in phases, at a later date. Should the property owner not agree with the French doors, Mr. Holguin asked commissioners if they would allow the property owner to modify the garage doors to glass.

Mr. Helm commented on the staff recommendation.

FOR THE RECORD

For the record, Ms. Velázquez asked Mr. Helm to clarify his comment.

Mr. Helm stated the modification to the staff recommendation is to allow glass garage doors.

Mr. Holguin clarified the modification is to allow the property owner two options:

1. The French doors, as discussed; and
2. Glass garage doors.

Mr. Helm modified the staff recommendation to add *“a glass overhead door for the French door.”*

MOTION:

Motion made by Vice-Chairman Lopez, seconded by Commissioner Lucero AND UNANIMOUSLY CARRIED TO APPROVE WITH MODIFICATIONS AS STATED BY MR. HELM:

1. **FRENCH DOORS; OR**
2. **OVERHEAD GLASS DOORS**

AND THAT THE SIDING BE HARDIE BOARD, PAINTED IN A COMPATIBLE COLOR, AND THAT THE BRICK MATCH AS CLOSELY AS POSSIBLE TO THE CURRENT BRICK ON THE HOUSE.

Mayor
Oscar Leoser

City Council

District 1
Ann Morgan Lilly

District 2
Larry Romero

District 3
Emma Acosta

District 4
Carl L. Robinson

District 5
Dr. Michiel R. Noe

District 6
Eddie Holguin Jr.

District 7
Lilia B. Limon

District 8
Cortney C. Niland

City Manager
Joyce A. Wilson



- Addresses of property HLC commissioners have requested that HLC staff review or investigate and provide a report to the HLC. If no addresses are submitted in advance and listed under this agenda item, commissioners may announce such addresses under this agenda item. Discussion on property announced at this meeting will take place during the next regularly scheduled meeting. April 7, 2014 deadline for HLC members to request for agenda items to be scheduled for the April 21, 2014 meeting. April 21, 2014 deadline for HLC members to request for agenda items to be scheduled for the May 5, 2014 meeting.

Commissioner Gomez asked Ms. Velázquez what the status was for the properties located on Yandell and Prospect.

UPDATE REGARDING THE PROPERTY LOCATED ON PROSPECT

Ms. Velázquez stated she had sent an email to Code Compliance staff explaining that the construction was not in compliance. Code Compliance staff then sent an email to the property owners insisting the property owners meet with Code Compliance and discuss the ongoing construction. At this time, Ms. Velázquez had not heard from Code Compliance staff; however, she would send an email to Code Compliance staff requesting information.

UPDATE REGARDING THE PROPERTY LOCATED ON YANDELL

Ms. Velázquez explained she had sent an email to Code Compliance staff regarding the tile and steps not in compliance; however, at this time, she had not received a response. Ms. Velázquez will send an email to Code Compliance staff.

HLC Staff Report

- Update on Administrative Review Cases since the last HLC meeting for the properties listed on the attachment posted with this agenda.

Chairman Berchelmann asked commissioners if they had any comments and/or questions for staff. *There were none.*

MOTION:

Motion made by Commissioner Helm, seconded by Commissioner Moses AND UNANIMOUSLY CARRIED TO APPROVE THE HLC STAFF REPORT.

Mayor
Oscar Leeser

City Council

District 1
Ann Morgan Lilly

District 2
Larry Romero

District 3
Emma Acosta

District 4
Carl L. Robinson

District 5
Dr. Michiel R. Noe

District 6
Eddie Holguin Jr.

District 7
Lilia B. Limon

District 8
Cortney C. Niland

City Manager
Joyce A. Wilson



Other Business

4. Approval of Regular Meeting Minutes for March 24, 2014

Chairman Berchelmann asked commissioners if they had any additions, corrections, and/or revisions for staff.

At the bottom of page 3, Commissioner Moses requested the following revision:

Comment from the public (email)

An email sent to Ms. Velázquez from a member of the Manhattan Heights Neighborhood Association ~~purports~~ **supports** the use of Hardie board for the front porch enclosure as long as the Hardie board lines run horizontal to match the brick.

MOTION:

Motion made by Commissioner Lucero, seconded by Vice-Chairman Lopez AND UNANIMOUSLY CARRIED TO APPROVE THE REGULAR MEETING MINUTES FOR MARCH 24, 2014 WITH THE CHANGE SUBMITTED BY COMMISSIONER MOSES.

MOTION:

Motion made by Chairman Berchelmann, seconded by Commissioner Lucero AND UNANIMOUSLY CARRIED TO ADJOURN THE MEETING AT 4:27 P.M.

Mayor

Oscar Leoser

City Council

District 1

Ann Morgan Lilly

District 2

Larry Romero

District 3

Emma Acosta

District 4

Carl L. Robinson

District 5

Dr. Michiel R. Noe

District 6

Eddie Holguin Jr.

District 7

Lilia B. Limon

District 8

Cortney C. Niland

City Manager

Joyce A. Wilson