



## Economic & International Development Department

### HISTORIC LANDMARK COMMISSION MEETING MINUTES FIRST FLOOR, COUNCIL CHAMBERS CITY 1 BUILDING, 300 N. CAMPBELL STREET AUGUST 8, 2016, 4:00 P.M.

#### Mayor

Oscar Leeser

#### City Council

##### District 1

Peter Svarzbein

##### District 2

Jim Tolbert

##### District 3

Emma Acosta

##### District 4

Carl L. Robinson

##### District 5

Dr. Michiel R. Noe

##### District 6

Claudia Ordaz

##### District 7

Lily Limón

##### District 8

Cortney C. Niland

#### City Manager

Tommy Gonzalez

The El Paso Historic Landmark Commission held a public hearing in the Council Chambers, City 1 Building, 300 N. Campbell Street, August 8, 2016, 4:13 p.m.

The following commissioners were present:

Chairman Edgar Lopez  
Commissioner Joseph Longo  
Commissioner Randy Brock  
Commissioner Charles Stapler

The following commissioners were not present:

Chairman William Helm  
Commissioner Melinda Becker Skillern

The following City staff members were present:

Ms. Providencia Velázquez, Historic Preservation Officer, Economic & International Development  
Mr. Juan Gonzalez, Assistant City Attorney, City Attorney's Office  
Mr. Adam Train, Planner, Historic Preservation Office, Economic & International Development

#### CALL TO ORDER

Chairman Lopez called the meeting to order at 4:00 p.m., quorum present.

#### PUBLIC COMMENT

Chairman Lopez asked if anyone present would like to address the Commission on issues not posted on the agenda. *There was no response.*

#### CHANGES TO THE AGENDA

Staff requested items 1. and 2. be discussed simultaneously



## Economic & International Development Department

**Mayor**  
Oscar Leeser

**City Council**

*District 1*  
Peter Svarzbein

*District 2*  
Jim Tolbert

*District 3*  
Emma Acosta

*District 4*  
Carl L. Robinson

*District 5*  
Dr. Michiel R. Noe

*District 6*  
Claudia Ordaz

*District 7*  
Lily Limón

*District 8*  
Cortney C. Niland

**City Manager**  
Tommy Gonzalez

Ms. Velázquez requested items 1. and 2. be discussed simultaneously.

- 1. **PHDM16-00003:** 46 Ysleta Tr 10-C-2, City of El Paso, El Paso County, Texas
  - Location: 9129 Valdiviez Street
  - Historic District: Ysleta
  - Property Owner: Imelda and Carlos Christensen
  - Representative: Sotero Ramirez
  - Representative District: 6
  - Existing Zoning: R-4/H (Residential/Historic)
  - Year Built: 1943
  - Historic Status: Non-Contributing
  - Request: Certificate of Appropriateness for the demolition of the existing structure
  - Application Filed: 7.25.16
  - 45 Day Expiration: 9.8.16

Ms. Velázquez gave a presentation and explained the property owner requests a Certificate of Demolition for the demolition of the existing structure. Photographs of the interior demonstrate issues regarding the structure and why the property owners are proposing demolition rather than repair or renovation. Ms. Velázquez thought this was an adobe structure. The property owners are proposing demolition and construction of a new structure. The new construction plans show a walkway and carport.





## Economic & International Development Department

### Mayor

Oscar Leeser

### City Council

#### District 1

Peter Svarzbein

#### District 2

Jim Tolbert

#### District 3

Emma Acosta

#### District 4

Carl L. Robinson

#### District 5

Dr. Michiel R. Noe

#### District 6

Claudia Ordaz

#### District 7

Lily Limón

#### District 8

Cortney C. Niland

### City Manager

Tommy Gonzalez



Mr. Sotero Ramirez, Housing Construction Specialist, Community and Human Development Department, commented on the extremely poor condition of the interior and exterior of the structure. After further reviewing the foundation and walls, he said it would be fiscally responsible to demolish the existing structure and construct a new one in its place.

Code Compliance staff did find the structure in violation of the city code and cited the property owners. Building inspectors visited the site and found numerous issues such as an unsafe structure, unsafe electrical, gas and plumbing issues. Texas Gas Service removed the gas meter from the property due to a number of underground leaks. Additionally, El Paso Water Utilities removed the water meter due to underground leaks beneath the slab which has caused issues regarding the settling.

Mr. Ramirez explained the home is currently occupied and due to the many violations of the code, city inspectors have given the occupants 30 days to comply. The Department of Community and Human Development is working with the property owners to find alternate means of housing until the situation is remedied.

Chairman Lopez does not want to destroy this adobe structure; however, he understands this is a health and safety issue. He wants to see a structural report.

*The Historic Preservation Office recommends that **THIS ITEM BE POSTPONED** until either a structural report from an engineer or a determination from the Building and Standards Commission is provided documenting the condition of the building and recommendation for demolition or repair.*

Chairman Lopez asked if anyone in the audience wished to speak in favor of or opposition to the request. *There was no response.*



## Economic & International Development Department

**Mayor**  
Oscar Leeser

Chairman Lopez asked commissioners if they had any comments and/or questions for property owner and/or representative. *No response from commissioners.*

**City Council**

**MOTION:**

*Motion made by Commissioner Stapler seconded by Commissioner Brock AND UNANIMOUSLY CARRIED TO FOLLOW THE RECOMMENDATIONS OF STAFF.*

*District 1*  
Peter Svarzbein

- |                          |   |
|--------------------------|---|
| 2. <b>PHAP16-00021:</b>  | 46 Ysleta, Tr 10-C-2, City of El Paso, El Paso County, Texas                |
| Location:                | 9129 Valdiviez Street   |
| Historic District:       | Ysleta  |
| Property Owner:          | Imelda and Carlos Christensen   |
| Representative:          | Sotero Ramirez  |
| Representative District: | 6   |
| Existing Zoning:         | R-4/H (Residential/Historic)  |
| Year Built:              | 1943  |
| Historic Status:         | Non-Contributing  |
| Request:                 | Certificate of Appropriateness for the construction of a one-story dwelling |
| Application Filed:       | 7.25.16   |
| 45 Day Expiration:       | 9.8.16  |

*For comments, see Item 1.*

*District 2*  
Jim Tolbert

*District 3*  
Emma Acosta

*District 4*  
Carl L. Robinson

*District 5*  
Dr. Michiel R. Noe

*District 6*  
Claudia Ordaz

*District 7*  
Lily Limón

- |                          |  |
|--------------------------|--|
| 3. <b>PHAP16-00022:</b>  | 33 Sunset Heights 12 & E 20 Ft of 11, City of El Paso, El Paso County, Texas             |
| Location:                | 914 W. Missouri Avenue   |
| Historic District:       | Sunset Heights   |
| Property Owner:          | Gabriela Arellano  |
| Representative:          | Gabriela Arellano  |
| Representative District: | 8  |
| Existing Zoning:         | R-4/H (Residential/Historic)   |
| Year Built:              | 1931   |
| Historic Status:         | Contributing   |
| Request:                 | Certificate of Appropriateness for the removal and replacement of windows after-the-fact |
| Application Filed:       | 8.3.16   |
| 45 Day Expiration:       | 9.17.16  |

*District 8*  
Cortney C. Niland

**City Manager**  
Tommy Gonzalez



## Economic & International Development Department

**Mayor**  
Oscar Leeser

**City Council**

*District 1*  
Peter Svarzbein

*District 2*  
Jim Tolbert

*District 3*  
Emma Acosta

*District 4*  
Carl L. Robinson

*District 5*  
Dr. Michiel R. Noe

*District 6*  
Claudia Ordaz

*District 7*  
Lily Limón

*District 8*  
Cortney C. Niland

**City Manager**  
Tommy Gonzalez

Ms. Velázquez, Historic Preservation Officer, gave a presentation and stated the applicant seeks approval of a Certificate of Appropriateness for the removal and replacement of windows after-the-fact. She explained that, had the property owner changed the windows to vinyl windows with an exterior applied grid, the request would have been approved administratively; however, the new windows have flat, interior applied grids which require commissioners' approval. The new windows are vinyl and operational but different than the original windows.



The Historic Preservation Office recommends **APPROVAL WITH A MODIFICATION** of the proposed scope of work based on the following recommendations:

*The Design Guidelines for El Paso's Historic Districts, Sites, and Properties recommend the following:*

- *Doors and windows are considered important character-defining features because of significant detailing.*
- *When windows are involved in the construction process it is recommended to repair rather than replace.*

Economic & International Development  
City 3 | 801 Texas Avenue | El Paso, Texas 79901 | (915) 212-0094  
ED@elpasotexas.gov

*Dedicated to Outstanding Customer Service for a Better Community*



## Economic & International Development Department

**Mayor**  
Oscar Leeser

### City Council

*District 1*  
Peter Svarzbein

*District 2*  
Jim Tolbert

*District 3*  
Emma Acosta

*District 4*  
Carl L. Robinson

*District 5*  
Dr. Michiel R. Noe

*District 6*  
Claudia Ordaz

*District 7*  
Lily Limón

*District 8*  
Cortney C. Niland

**City Manager**  
Tommy Gonzalez

- *However, if windows are damaged beyond repair, replacement windows should match the type (such as double hung), style (for example six panes over six panes), and finish (paint).*
- *Installation of windows similar to the original in appearance and structural purpose, regardless of construction materials is permitted. Windows in secondary facades shall be reviewed on a case by case basis.*
- *Retain and preserve original doors and windows, including such elements as sash, glass, sills, lintels, casings, muntins, trim, frames, thresholds, hardware and shutters. If repair of an original window or door element is necessary, repair only the deteriorated element to match the original in size, composition, material, dimension, and detail by patching, splicing, consolidating, or otherwise reinforcing the deteriorated section. The removal of historic materials should be avoided.*
- *When repair is not feasible, door and window products will be reviewed on an individual basis using the following criteria:*
  - a. Architectural and historical compatibility*
  - b. Comparison to original profile*
  - c. Level of significance of original doors and windows to the architectural style of the building.*
  - d. Three dimensional exterior applied muntins that simulate or match the original muntins may be approved. Single dimension interior applied muntins are not appropriate.*

*The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation recommend the following:*

- *When the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature will match the old in design, color, texture, and where possible materials.*

*The modification is that three dimensional exterior applied muntins be placed on the windows at the front, east and west facades.*

Ms. Gabriela Arellano, property owner, gave background and timeframe information regarding the window situation and responded to comments and questions from commissioners and Ms. Velázquez.

In summary, Chairman Lopez concurs with staff recommendations to retrofit the newly installed windows with aluminum or PVC exterior muntins.

Chairman Lopez asked if there was anyone from the neighborhood who wished to speak concerning this item. *There were no responses.*

Chairman Lopez asked commissioners if they had any comments and/or questions for property owner and/or representative. *No response from commissioners.*

Economic & International Development  
City 3 | 801 Texas Avenue | El Paso, Texas 79901 | (915) 212-0094  
ED@elpasotexas.gov

*Dedicated to Outstanding Customer Service for a Better Community*



## Economic & International Development Department

### Mayor

Oscar Leeser

### City Council

#### District 1

Peter Svarzbein

#### District 2

Jim Tolbert

#### District 3

Emma Acosta

#### District 4

Carl L. Robinson

#### District 5

Dr. Michiel R. Noe

#### District 6

Claudia Ordaz

#### District 7

Lily Limón

#### District 8

Cortney C. Niland

### City Manager

Tommy Gonzalez

#### **MOTION:**

*Motion made by Chairman Lopez, seconded by Commissioner Brock AND UNANIMOUSLY CARRIED TO APPROVE CASE NUMBER THREE WITH THE MODIFICATIONS AS RECOMMENDED BY STAFF, ADDING MUNTINS TO ALL THE WINDOWS FROM THE EXTERIOR SIDE.*

- Addresses of property HLC commissioners have requested that HLC staff review or investigate and provide a report to the HLC. If no addresses are submitted in advance and listed under this agenda item, commissioners may announce such addresses under this agenda item. Discussion on property announced at this meeting will take place during the next regularly scheduled meeting. August 8<sup>th</sup>, 2016 deadline for HLC members to request for agenda items to be scheduled for the August 22<sup>nd</sup>, 2016 meeting. August 22<sup>nd</sup>, 2016 deadline for HLC members to request for agenda items to be scheduled for the September 12<sup>th</sup>, 2016 meeting.

*No address requests from commissioners.*

#### **HLC Staff Report**

- Update on Administrative Review Cases since last HLC meeting for the properties listed on the attachment posted with this agenda. (See Attachment "A.")

*No comment from commissioners.*

#### **MOTION:**

*Motion made by Commissioner Brock, seconded by Commissioner Longo AND UNANIMOUSLY CARRIED TO APPROVE THE AUGUST 8<sup>TH</sup> STAFF REPORT.*

#### **Other Business – Discussion and Action**

- Presentation of estimates for 1401 Randolph Drive

Ms. Velázquez explained this request was presented to commissioners at the July 25<sup>th</sup> meeting for a Certificate of Appropriateness for the alteration of the rock wall at the rear property line after-the-fact and a Certificate of Demolition for the demolition of a rear yard structure after-the-fact. The property owner is present today to present his estimate for new construction.



## Economic & International Development Department

**Mayor**  
Oscar Leeser

**City Council**

*District 1*  
Peter Svarzbein

*District 2*  
Jim Tolbert

*District 3*  
Emma Acosta

*District 4*  
Carl L. Robinson

*District 5*  
Dr. Michiel R. Noe

*District 6*  
Claudia Ordaz

*District 7*  
Lily Limón

*District 8*  
Cortney C. Niland

**City Manager**  
Tommy Gonzalez



Mr. Raymundo Ramos, property owner, presented his estimate to reconstruct the rear yard structure. (Mr. Ramos will provide copies of the estimate to staff.) He understood the reconstruction would include as much material from the original structure as possible. He asked commissioners if he could use brick veneer rather than the original rock material.

Chairman Lopez reiterated the reconstruction project will include as much of the original rock material as possible. Brick veneer will change the look of the structure, Chairman Lopez suggested Mr. Ramos use rock veneer in the same style as the original rock material.

Mr. Gonzalez recommended commissioners make a motion to accept the estimate citing **Section 20.20.140.– Penalty for demolition or alteration without a Permit Subsection C.** If the structural, physical or visual integrity of the historic landmark is adversely affected to the extent that it may not feasibly be substantially restored to its original level of historic significance, damages are equal to the cost of constructing, using as many of the original materials as possible, a new structure that is a reasonable facsimile of the historic landmark as well as the cost of attorney's, architect's and appraiser's fees and other costs related to the enforcement of this section. If it is feasible to restore the structural, physical or visual integrity of the historic landmark substantially to its former level, the damages are equal to the cost of the restoration, using as many of the original materials as possible and the cost of attorney's, architect's and appraiser's fees and other costs related to the enforcement of this section.

**MOTION:**

***Motion made by Chairman Lopez, seconded by Commissioner Stapler AND UNANIMOUSLY CARRIED TO APPROVE THE ESTIMATE PRESENTED AND TO RECOMMEND THE USE OF EXISTING MATERIAL AS POSSIBLE WITH THE LOOK AS IT PREVIOUSLY WAS DONE AND THE APPROVAL TO USE ROCK VENEER INSTEAD OF BEING***

Economic & International Development  
City 3 | 801 Texas Avenue | El Paso, Texas 79901 | (915) 212-0094  
ED@elpasotexas.gov

*Dedicated to Outstanding Customer Service for a Better Community*



## Economic & International Development Department

**Mayor**  
Oscar Leeser

### City Council

*District 1*  
Peter Svarzbein

*District 2*  
Jim Tolbert

*District 3*  
Emma Acosta

*District 4*  
Carl L. Robinson

*District 5*  
Dr. Michiel R. Noe

*District 6*  
Claudia Ordaz

*District 7*  
Lily Limón

*District 8*  
Cortney C. Niland

**City Manager**  
Tommy Gonzalez

*LOAD BEARING BUT WITH THE USE OF FRANKLIN MOUNTAIN ROCK NOT CULTURE STONE OR FAKE STONE.*

7. Discussion on revisions to the ordinance (Chapter 20.20)

*Item was postponed to a Special HLC meeting, Monday, August 15<sup>th</sup>, 2016, 4:00p.m., City 3 Building, 801 Texas Avenue, Muir Conference Room, second floor.*

8. Approval of Regular Meeting Minutes for July 11<sup>th</sup>, 2016

Chairman Lopez asked commissioners if they had any additions, corrections, and/or revisions. *There were none.*

**MOTION:**

*Motion made by Chairman Lopez, seconded by Commissioner Stapler AND UNANIMOUSLY CARRIED TO APPROVE THE REGULAR MEETING MINUTES FOR JULY 11<sup>th</sup>, 2016.*

-----

**MOTION:**

*Motion made by Chairman Lopez, seconded by Commissioner Brock AND UNANIMOUSLY CARRIED TO ADJOURN THE MEETING AT 4:58 P.M.*