



Economic & International Development Department

**HISTORIC LANDMARK COMMISSION MEETING MINUTES
FIRST FLOOR, COUNCIL CHAMBERS
CITY 1 BUILDING, 300 N. CAMPBELL STREET
FEBRUARY 22, 2016 4:00 P.M.**

Mayor

Oscar Leeser

City Council

District 1

Peter Svarzbein

District 2

Larry Romero

District 3

Emma Acosta

District 4

Carl L. Robinson

District 5

Dr. Michiel R. Noe

District 6

Claudia Ordaz

District 7

Lily Limón

District 8

Cortney C. Niland

City Manager

Tommy Gonzalez

The El Paso Historic Landmark Commission held a public hearing in the Council Chambers, City 1 Building, 300 N. Campbell Street, February 22, 2016, 4:00 p.m.

The following commissioners were present:

- Chairman William Helm
- Commissioner Joseph Longo
- Commissioner Beatriz Lucero
- Commissioner Edgar Lopez
- Commissioner George Córdova

The following commissioners were not present:

- Commissioner Randy Brock
- Commissioner Melinda Skillern

The following City staff members were present:

- Ms. Providencia Velázquez, Historic Preservation Officer, Economic & International Development
- Mr. Juan Gonzalez, Assistant City Attorney, City Attorney’s Office

The following City staff and members of the public commented:

1. Mr. Alan Shubert, Vice-President, EPWU-PSB
2. Mr. James Wolff, Utility Planner, EPWU-PSB
3. Mr. Harold Kutz, Engineering Division Manager, Streets and Maintenance
4. Ms. Julie Rutledge, resident, Manhattan Heights Historic District
5. Ms. Jackie Stagen, resident, Manhattan Heights Historic District
6. Mr. Ray Rutledge, resident, Manhattan Heights Historic District

CALL TO ORDER

Chairman Helm called the meeting to order at 4:07 p.m., quorum present.

PUBLIC COMMENT

Chairman Helm asked if anyone present would like to address the Commission on issues not posted on the agenda. There was none.



Economic & International Development Department

Mayor

Oscar Leeser

City Council

District 1

Peter Svarzbein

District 2

Larry Romero

District 3

Emma Acosta

District 4

Carl L. Robinson

District 5

Dr. Michiel R. Noe

District 6

Claudia Ordaz

District 7

Lily Limón

District 8

Cortney C. Niland

City Manager

Tommy Gonzalez

Certificate of Appropriateness

1. PHAP16-00004:	33 Manhattan Heights 8 to 10, City of El Paso, El Paso County, Texas
Location:	1500 Elm Street
Historic District:	Manhattan Heights
Property Owner:	Gus and Flora Sambrano
Representative:	James, Wolff, El Paso Water Utilities
Representative District:	2
Existing Zoning:	R-3/H (Residential/Historic)
Year Built:	1918
Historic Status:	Contributing
Request:	Certificate of Appropriateness for the paving of the parkways after-the-fact
Application Filed:	2.8.16
45 Day Expiration:	3.24.16

Ms. Velázquez stated the property owner is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for the paving of the parkways after-the-fact. The property is located at the corner of Elm Street and Gold Avenue.

Photo of property from 2000 Historic District survey



Condition of parkway landscaping at 1500 Elm prior to improvements (2014)



Condition of parkway landscaping at 1500 Elm prior to improvements.



Economic & International Development Department

After parkway improvements (EPWU-PSB)



Mayor
Oscar Leeser

City Council

District 1
Peter Svarzbein

District 2
Larry Romero

District 3
Emma Acosta

District 4
Carl L. Robinson

District 5
Dr. Michiel R. Noe

District 6
Claudia Ordaz

District 7
Lily Limón

District 8
Cortney C. Niland

City Manager
Tommy Gonzalez

The work was done without City approval or through the Historic Preservation Office. Since this is a corner property there are parkways located on both sides, both of which are mostly paved with the exception of the trees. There are adjacent properties with grass and/or gravel in the parkways. It is historically appropriate for properties to have grass in the parkways. Due to the high cost of water and maintenance of the grass parkways, property owners prefer the paved and/or gravel parkways.

In 2014, Ms. Velázquez was receiving emails regarding this property.

FOR THE RECORD

Ms. Velázquez read the following into the record:

1. Email from Ms. Julie Rutledge, Manhattan Heights Neighborhood Association

Wed 4/9/2014 8:23 AM

Good morning Provi,

It looks like they're concreting-in the parkway at 1500 Elm. A few years ago they took out the grass and put in huge rocks. Now the rocks are all taken out and there is poured concrete starting on the south side of the house -- corner house with parkway at front, facing west, and at side, facing south.

Hope all is well for you. Thanks for all of your work on that Wheeling house! -Julie

2. Email from Mr. Craig Peters, resident, Manhattan Heights Historic District

From: Craig Peters

Sent: Thursday, May 01, 2014 10:00 PM

To: Velazquez, Providencia

Hi Provi,

I know Julie has talked to you about the parkway on Elm right next door. I know the Sambronos were working with the city to try to re-mediate the situation and that the water authority was involved. Not sure about all the details and probably the water authority did not talk with you. It solved the problem regarding the rocks blocking traffic but it did not solve the Elm River problem. Take care, Craig



Economic & International Development Department

3. Addresses of properties with paved parkways installed before the new guidelines were passed.

Mayor
Oscar Leeser

City Council

District 1
Peter Svarzbein

District 2
Larry Romero

District 3
Emma Acosta

District 4
Carl L. Robinson

District 5
Dr. Michiel R. Noe

District 6
Claudia Ordaz

District 7
Lily Limón

District 8
Cortney C. Niland

City Manager
Tommy Gonzalez

Street #	Street Name	In District?	Installed prior to 2013 (before the new guidelines were passed)
2605	Wheeling	no	
2621	Wheeling	no	
2629	Wheeling	no	
2707	Wheeling	yes	yes
2705	Wheeling	yes	yes
2719	Wheeling	yes	yes
2721	Wheeling	yes	yes
2729	Wheeling	yes	yes
2735	Wheeling	yes	yes
2809	Wheeling	yes	yes
2700	Wheeling	yes	yes
2704	Wheeling	yes	yes
2706	Wheeling	yes	yes
2714	Wheeling	yes	yes
2718	Wheeling	yes	yes
2722	Wheeling	yes	yes
2726	Wheeling	yes	yes
2728	Wheeling	yes	yes
1718	Elm	yes	yes
1708	Elm	yes	yes
1700	Elm	yes	yes
1615	Elm	yes	yes
1601	Elm	yes	yes
1515	Elm	yes	yes
1416	Elm	yes	yes
1404	Elm	yes	yes * paving done between 2007 and 2013



Economic & International Development Department

4. Email from Michael Trujillo to Julie Rutledge

From: Michael E. Trujillo

Date: February 22, 2016 at 9:49:46 AM MST

To: "Julie Rutledge, MHNA"

Good morning Julie,

Here is an explanation of what is happening on the corner of Elm Street and Gold. I live at 1416 Elm (which is the corner of Elm Street and Gold, El Paso, Texas). As you are aware I have much flooding on the intersection of this corner of the street, as well as my backyard and pool area over the years. My pool has flooded at least a dozen times (over the past 2 years since the cement has been added to the Sambrano family residence curbside) and I have had to drain the pool and re fill it on each occasion the flooding has occurred, (the pool company charges me \$200.00 dollars each time this happens to clean and disinfect the cement in the pool). The house across the street on Elm and Gold (the Sambrano family residence) has modified there outside grass (and taken out the grass) and put in cement causing more rain to flow through and onto the corner of Elm and Gold. It seemed as though the grass and rock blocked a huge percentage of rain, however since the grass and cement are no longer there the rain runs right over the cement causing more flooding on the intersection which then causes more flooding to my house and pool. I love my home and the area I live in, however something needs to be done about this flooding on this intersection. Thank you, Michael E. Trujillo

Ms. Velázquez read the following staff recommendations into the record:

The Historic Preservation Office recommends **APPROVAL WITH MODIFICATIONS** of the proposed scope of work based on the following recommendations:

The Design Guidelines for El Paso's Historic Districts, Sites, and Properties recommend the following:

- *New and replacement portions of sidewalks and driveways shall be constructed in material, finish, color, scoring, grid pattern, and control joints to match existing or the surrounding original paving.*
- *Many of the parkways were landscaped originally and therefore landscaping is still recommended as the proper treatment for a parkway.*
- *However, in certain cases where issues such as water conservation and maintenance are applicable, some types of hard surface coverings for 100% coverage may be considered on an individual basis by the Historic Landmark Commission. These include materials such as Franklin Mountain stone, landscaping rock, brick and other pavers that might be appropriate to the area.*
- *Keeping the historic character of the landscaping creates a pedestrian-friendly environment and maintains continuity along the street frontage. A street with uniformity is historically appropriate and in keeping with the character defining features of the district.*
- *Grass and sod may be removed from parkways provided not more than 50% of the area is covered with gravel or other masonry that is made of impervious materials (brick pavers, gravel, and masonry pavers). The remaining 50% must be covered with trees and/or living plants that provide ground cover. Any hardscape must be pervious and laid directly on the soil or on pervious fabric to allow penetration.*

Mayor

Oscar Leeser

City Council

District 1

Peter Svarzbein

District 2

Larry Romero

District 3

Emma Acosta

District 4

Carl L. Robinson

District 5

Dr. Michiel R. Noe

District 6

Claudia Ordaz

District 7

Lily Limón

District 8

Cortney C. Niland

City Manager

Tommy Gonzalez



Economic & International Development Department

Mayor

Oscar Leeser

City Council

District 1

Peter Svarzbein

District 2

Larry Romero

District 3

Emma Acosta

District 4

Carl L. Robinson

District 5

Dr. Michiel R. Noe

District 6

Claudia Ordaz

District 7

Lily Limón

District 8

Cortney C. Niland

City Manager

Tommy Gonzalez

The Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation recommend the following:

- *The historic character of a property will be retained and preserved. The removal of distinctive materials or alteration of features, spaces, and spatial relationships that characterize a property will be avoided.*
- *Distinctive materials, features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property will be preserved.*
- *Deteriorated historic features will be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature will match the old in design, color, texture, and where possible, materials.*

THE MODIFICATIONS ARE THAT PORTIONS OF THE PAVING MATERIAL BE REMOVED SO THAT THE PAVING IS 50% OF THE PARKWAY AND THAT THE REMAINING AREA BE COVERED WITH NATIVE PLANTS.

Chairman Helm noted PHAP16-00004 and the following case, PHAP16-00005, 1815 Elm Street were similar and asked Ms. Velázquez if both cases should be heard simultaneously.

Ms. Velázquez agreed with Chairman Helm, both cases could be heard simultaneously.

Mr. Alan Shubert, Vice-President EPWU-PSB, clarified the Streets and Maintenance Department did the work for 1815 Elm Street (PHAP16-00005).

Commissioners had no questions regarding the property located at 1500 Elm Street. Ms. Velázquez proceeded to present the case for 1815 Elm Street.

Mr. James Wolff, Utility Planner, EPWU-PSB, stated the EPWU-PSB were responsible for both properties, 1500 Elm Street and 1815 Elm Street.

Following Ms. Velázquez’s presentation for the property located at 1815 Elm Street, Mr. Wolff gave a presentation for both properties, 1500 Elm Street and 1815 Elm Street.

Before and after photos of the property located at 1500 Elm Street (EPWU-PSB)



Prior to Storm Event



Storm Damage



Repair for Safety and Preventive Measures

**Mayor**

Oscar Leeser

City Council*District 1*

Peter Svarzbein

District 2

Larry Romero

District 3

Emma Acosta

District 4

Carl L. Robinson

District 5

Dr. Michiel R. Noe

District 6

Claudia Ordaz

District 7

Lily Limón

District 8

Cortney C. Niland

City Manager

Tommy Gonzalez

Economic & International Development Department

Mr. Wolff responded to comments and questions from Chairman Helm and Commissioner Lopez.

Commissioner Lopez explained that paving the parkways created more problems for other property owners. He explained had the EPWU-PSB and Streets and Maintenance Department used permeable materials instead of paving the parkways, the permeable materials would have allowed the water to seep down into the landscaping. The permeable materials would have slowed down the stormwater considerably. Additionally, other property owners on Elm Street will seek out the EPWU-PSB for assistance with the maintenance of their parkways. He asked if the EPWU-PSB would be paving the parkways for all properties located on Elm Street.

Mr. Shubert responded regarding permeable materials, Commissioner Lopez is correct. However, in high velocity areas permeable materials is not a solution. Should the EPWU-PSB remove 50% of the hardscape, the remaining landscaped area would be ripped up by the stormwater. The ultimate solution is to get some diversion and retention uphill. He disagreed that the paved parkway was adding to the problem for the property owners. The issue is that Elm Street is a very dangerous street during rainstorms. In order to create a diversion and retention uphill, the EPWU-PSB will have to purchase properties uphill in order to stop the water flow from creating dangerous situations.

Commissioner Lopez was perplexed in that the EPWU-PSB did not comply with city code requirements. He explained that he too is a resident of the area and he also has issues regarding stormwater. He wondered if he approached the EPWU-PSB would the Department fix his problem as well.

Mr. Shubert admitted the EPWU-PSB should have contacted Ms. Velázquez prior to paving the parkways, but the EPWU-PSB and Streets and Maintenance Department were trying to remedy the problem(s) as quickly as possible.

Commissioner Lopez reiterated the best way to absorb water and retain erosion is landscaping, the concrete parkways allow the stormwater runoff to flow faster.

Mr. Shubert explained the neighborhood design did not plan for drainage. Furthermore, Elm Street has always had a major flooding problem; it might be exacerbated by the paved parkway.

Regarding the property located at 1815 Elm Street, Mr. Kutz explained March and September 2014 rainstorms caused the sidewalk to collapse and expose the gas line. Mr. Kutz showed photos of 1815 Elm Street, March 2014 stormwater damage. Following the September 2014 rainstorm, EPWU-PSB removed the landscaping and installed the paved parkway.

**Mayor**

Oscar Leeser

City Council*District 1*

Peter Svarzbein

District 2

Larry Romero

District 3

Emma Acosta

District 4

Carl L. Robinson

District 5

Dr. Michiel R. Noe

District 6

Claudia Ordaz

District 7

Lily Limón

District 8

Cortney C. Niland

City Manager

Tommy Gonzalez

Economic & International Development Department

Commissioner Lopez suggested the EPWU-PSB raise the planter walls.

Mr. Shubert clarified the paved parkways are not the permanent solution for these problems. The permanent solution is to fix the problem upstream. At this time, the EPWU-PSB is working on a plan to correct these problems for the safety and welfare of the public.

For the property located at 1815 Elm, Chairman Helm noted removing 50% of the paved parkways and installing landscaping means the same flooding issues would continue. He recommended raising the planter walls.

Regarding the property located at 1815 Elm Street, Commissioner Lopez agreed the best solution is to raise the planter walls. For the property located at 1500 Elm Street, Commissioner Lopez thanked the EPWU-PSB for not removing the existing trees. Additionally, this is a corner lot with more parkway to cover. Property owners will continue emailing and sending letters to Ms. Velázquez regarding the constant flooding. He was concerned that other property owners on Elm Street will contact the EPWU-PSB to correct their stormwater flooding issues as well. Commissioner Lopez stated paving the parkways was not the correct solution to minimize the stormwater flooding concerns of the property owners.

Mr. Shubert commented that property owners would create additional problems by raising walls and using sand bags. He reiterated that paving the parkways was a temporary solution to a public safety problem while the Department finds a solution.

Chairman Helm asked Mr. Shubert if it was his recommendation that commissioners approve with the modifications or without.

Mr. Shubert respectfully requested commissioners approve the Certificate of Appropriateness without the modifications. He thought that the modifications would not correct the problems. Unless the EPWU-PSB raised planters which would require irrigation, due to budget constraints the Department was attempting to correct the problems until a permanent solution could be worked out.

The following Manhattan Heights Historic District homeowners commented:

1. Ms. Julie Rutledge, resident, Manhattan Heights Historic District, gave a presentation regarding the property located at 1717 Elm Street and responded to comments and questions from commissioners
2. Ms. Jackie Stagen, resident, Manhattan Heights Historic District
3. Mr. Ray Rutledge, resident, Manhattan Heights Historic District

**Mayor**

Oscar Leeser

City Council*District 1*

Peter Svarzbein

District 2

Larry Romero

District 3

Emma Acosta

District 4

Carl L. Robinson

District 5

Dr. Michiel R. Noe

District 6

Claudia Ordaz

District 7

Lily Limón

District 8

Cortney C. Niland

City Manager

Tommy Gonzalez

Economic & International Development Department

Chairman Helm asked Ms. Velázquez if she had received input from 1500 and 1815 Elm Street property owners and if they had expressed their wishes.

Ms. Velázquez replied no, she had not received input from the property owners. She imagined property owners for 1500 and 1815 Elm are very happy in that they no longer have to maintain them.

Chairman Helm asked Mr. Shubert if he had any contact from the property owners.

Mr. Shubert explained he has had contact with Mrs. Sambrano but she is elderly and has trouble maintaining her parkway.

Regarding the property at 1500 Elm Street, Ms. Velázquez explained she received phone calls and emails from surrounding neighbors asking why the paved parkways were permitted and if they could also have the same done to their properties.

Commissioner Lopez was concerned that the paved parkways would cause more problems and that the two City departments had not followed the city code.

MOTION:

Motion made by Commissioner Lopez, seconded by Commissioner Lucero TO APPROVE WITH THE STAFF RECOMMENDATIONS FOR BOTH PROPERTIES, 1500 ELM STREET AND 1815 ELM STREET WITH 50% PAVING MATERIAL ON THE PARKWAY.

Ms. Velázquez asked commissioners to set a timeline.

Commissioner Lopez requested a 60-day timeline.

Commissioner Lucero seconded the motion. She clarified the motion was for the property located 1815 Elm Street and 1500 Elm Street.

Ms. Velázquez requested separate motions for each property.

MOTION:

Motion made by Commissioner Lopez, seconded by Commissioner Lucero AND UNANIMOUSLY CARRIED TO FOLLOW STAFF RECOMMENDATIONS TO COVER 50% OF THE PARKWAY FOR PROPERTY LOCATED AT 1500 ELM STREET WITHIN TWO MONTHS FROM TODAY'S RESOLUTION.

**Mayor**

Oscar Leeser

City Council*District 1*

Peter Svarzbein

District 2

Larry Romero

District 3

Emma Acosta

District 4

Carl L. Robinson

District 5

Dr. Michiel R. Noe

District 6

Claudia Ordaz

District 7

Lily Limón

District 8

Cortney C. Niland

City Manager

Tommy Gonzalez

Economic & International Development Department

MOTION:

Motion made by Commissioner Lopez, seconded by Commissioner Lucero AND UNANIMOUSLY CARRIED TO FOLLOW STAFF RECOMMENDATIONS TO COVER 50% OF THE PARKWAY FOR PROPERTY LOCATED AT 1815 ELM STREET WITHIN TWO MONTHS FROM TODAY'S RESOLUTION.

- 2. PHAP16-00005:** 19 Manhattan Heights 20 to 22 & N. 5 ft. of 23, City of El Paso, El Paso County, Texas
- Location: 1815 Elm Street
- Historic District: Manhattan Heights
- Property Owner: Victor Damasco
- Representative: James Wolff, El Paso Water Utilities
- Representative District: 2
- Existing Zoning: R-3/H (Residential/Historic)
- Year Built: 1931
- Historic Status: Non-Contributing
- Request: Certificate of Appropriateness for the paving of the parkway after-the-fact
- Application Filed: 2.8.16
- 45 Day Expiration: 3.24.16

Ms. Velázquez stated the property owner is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for the paving of the parkway after-the-fact. The property is located at the corner of Wheeling Avenue and Elm Street. Although this is a corner property, there is just one parkway located on Wheeling Avenue. *(Please see comments from PHAP15-00004, 1500 Elm Street.)*

Photos of property from 2000 Historic District survey and prior to parkway improvements



Condition of parkway landscaping on Wheeling prior to improvements.
Physical address of subject property is 1815 Elm. Property is a corner lot.



Damage of parkway landscaping at 1815 Elm due to storm water runoff.

After parkway improvements (Streets and Maintenance Department)

Economic & International Development
City 3 | 801 Texas Avenue | El Paso, Texas 79901 | (915) 212-0094
ED@elpasotexas.gov

“Delivering Outstanding Services”



Mayor

Oscar Leeser

City Council

District 1

Peter Svarzbein

District 2

Larry Romero

District 3

Emma Acosta

District 4

Carl L. Robinson

District 5

Dr. Michiel R. Noe

District 6

Claudia Ordaz

District 7

Lily Limón

District 8

Cortney C. Niland

City Manager

Tommy Gonzalez

Economic & International Development Department



In 2013, the property owners contacted Ms. Velázquez and explained the parkway was difficult to maintain. The parkway was constantly collapsing and causing issues for the home. She requested the property owners come to her office to determine what solution(s) would be appropriate. However, much to Ms. Velázquez's surprise the parkway had been completely paved over without city approval or permits. There is no landscaping in this parkway, at all.

Chairman Helm noted the curb had been raised.

Ms. Velázquez thought the curb had been raised prior to the paving of the parkway. The photo taken in 2000 shows the raised curb. The properties on Wheeling Avenue show landscaping and open parkways. These landscaped and open parkways absorb some of the stormwater.

The Historic Preservation Office recommends **APPROVAL WITH MODIFICATIONS** of the proposed scope of work based on the following recommendations:

The Design Guidelines for El Paso's Historic Districts, Sites, and Properties recommend the following:

- *New and replacement portions of sidewalks and driveways shall be constructed in material, finish, color, scoring, grid pattern, and control joints to match existing or the surrounding original paving.*
- *Many of the parkways were landscaped originally and therefore landscaping is still recommended as the proper treatment for a parkway.*
- *However, in certain cases where issues such as water conservation and maintenance are applicable, some types of hard surface coverings for 100% coverage may be considered on an individual basis by the Historic Landmark Commission. These include materials such as Franklin Mountain stone, landscaping rock, brick and other pavers that might be appropriate to the area.*
- *Keeping the historic character of the landscaping creates a pedestrian-friendly environment and maintains continuity along the street frontage. A street with uniformity is historically appropriate and in keeping with the character defining features of the district.*
- *Grass and sod may be removed from parkways provided not more than 50% of the area is covered with gravel or other masonry that is made of impervious materials (brick pavers, gravel, and masonry pavers). The remaining 50% must be covered with trees and/or living plants that provide ground cover. Any hardscape must be pervious and laid directly on the soil or on pervious fabric to allow penetration.*

The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation recommend the following:

- *The historic character of a property will be retained and preserved. The removal of distinctive*

Economic & International Development
 City 3 | 801 Texas Avenue | El Paso, Texas 79901 | (915) 212-0094
ED@elpasotexas.gov

"Delivering Outstanding Services"

**Mayor**

Oscar Leeser

City Council*District 1*

Peter Svarzbein

District 2

Larry Romero

District 3

Emma Acosta

District 4

Carl L. Robinson

District 5

Dr. Michiel R. Noe

District 6

Claudia Ordaz

District 7

Lily Limón

District 8

Cortney C. Niland

City Manager

Tommy Gonzalez

Economic & International Development Department

materials or alteration of features, spaces, and spatial relationships that characterize a property will be avoided.

- *Distinctive materials, features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property will be preserved.*
- *Deteriorated historic features will be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature will match the old in design, color, texture, and where possible, materials.*

THE MODIFICATIONS ARE THAT PORTIONS OF THE PAVING MATERIAL BE REMOVED SO THAT THE PAVING IS 50% OF THE PARKWAY AND THAT THE REMAINING AREA BE COVERED WITH NATIVE PLANTS.

The property owners did contact Ms. Velázquez prior to EPWU-PSB paving the parkway; the property owners explained the parkway was very difficult for them to maintain.

MOTION:

Motion made by Commissioner Lopez, seconded by Commissioner Lucero AND UNANIMOUSLY CARRIED TO FOLLOW STAFF RECOMMENDATIONS TO COVER 50% OF THE PARKWAY FOR PROPERTY LOCATED AT 1815 ELM STREET WITHIN TWO MONTHS FROM TODAY'S RESOLUTION.

3. PHAP16-00006:	92 Government Hill 9 & 10, City of El Paso, El Paso County, Texas
Location:	4423 Hueco Avenue
Historic District:	Austin Terrace
Property Owner:	Alice Marquez
Representative:	Lorenzo Villanueva
Representative District:	2
Existing Zoning:	R-5/H (Residential/Historic)
Year Built:	1929
Historic Status:	Contributing
Request:	Certificate of Appropriateness for the removal of the roof and replacement with a new roof in a different color after-the-fact
Application Filed:	2.9.16
45 Day Expiration:	3.25.16

Ms. Velázquez stated the property owner is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for the removal of the roof and replacement with a new roof in a different color after-the-fact. She explained the contractor had removed the gray shingles and replaced with black shingles.



Economic & International Development Department

Mayor

Oscar Leeser

City Council

District 1

Peter Svarzbein

District 2

Larry Romero

District 3

Emma Acosta

District 4

Carl L. Robinson

District 5

Dr. Michiel R. Noe

District 6

Claudia Ordaz

District 7

Lily Limón

District 8

Cortney C. Niland

City Manager

Tommy Gonzalez

Photo of property from 2000 Historic District survey



Photo of old roof (gray) (2014)



Photo of new roof (black) (2016)



The Historic Preservation Office recommends **DENIAL** of the proposed scope of work based on the following recommendations:

The Design Guidelines for El Paso's Historic Districts, Sites, and Properties recommend the following:

- *The distinctive features of each roof type should be retained as they are character-defining elements.*
- *If a roof requires repair, the replacement materials must match the original or existing materials as closely as possible.*

The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation recommend the following:

- *The historic character of a property will be retained and preserved. The removal of distinctive materials or alteration of features, spaces, and spatial relationships that characterize a property will be avoided.*

Economic & International Development
 City 3 | 801 Texas Avenue | El Paso, Texas 79901 | (915) 212-0094
ED@elpasotexas.gov

"Delivering Outstanding Services"

**Mayor**

Oscar Leeser

City Council*District 1*

Peter Svarzbein

District 2

Larry Romero

District 3

Emma Acosta

District 4

Carl L. Robinson

District 5

Dr. Michiel R. Noe

District 6

Claudia Ordaz

District 7

Lily Limón

District 8

Cortney C. Niland

City Manager

Tommy Gonzalez

Economic & International Development Department

- *Distinctive materials, features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property will be preserved.*
- *Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature will match the old in design, color, texture, and where possible, materials.*

Ms. Velázquez recalled a property located in the Sunset Heights Historic District whereby the property owner had requested a new roof. After the contractor had removed layers and layers of existing roof, the original roof was green in color. Ms. Velázquez approved the installation of the green roof.

Ms. Velázquez explained had the contractor come to her office prior to the installation of the new roof, she would not have administratively approved the black shingles. She would have recommended the contractor appear before commissioners for the installation of the black shingles; additionally, she would have approved a Shasta White or Gray color shingle.

Commissioner Longo requested additional information.

Ms. Velázquez explained the circumstances why the request is before commissioners.

Commissioner Lopez asked if there were other properties with similar roof colors and he wondered if this color would set a precedent within the neighborhood.

Ms. Velázquez responded no, not that she was aware. She recommends property owners come to her office prior to any outside remodeling.

Lorenzo, HVC and general contractor, BMI Refrigeration, explained this was a hail damage insurance claim. Prior to removing the existing roof, Lorenzo noted he called city staff to verify if the property was within/without the historic district boundaries. He called city staff on Friday prior to the Martin Luther King, Jr. holiday. He was told by city staff member, Marco, that the property was NOT located in a historic district. The whole 400 block of Hueco was not in the historic district. Marco told Lorenzo to go ahead and do the work; Lorenzo could get his permit on Tuesday. This conversation took place on the telephone.

Chairman Helm asked if Lorenzo had received a re-roofing permit.

Lorenzo responded no, he did not receive a permit nor did he submit drawings to city staff for approval of the permit. Lorenzo added he did not receive a permit, over the phone, because the computer system was not working (Friday).

**Mayor**

Oscar Leeser

City Council*District 1*

Peter Svarzbein

District 2

Larry Romero

District 3

Emma Acosta

District 4

Carl L. Robinson

District 5

Dr. Michiel R. Noe

District 6

Claudia Ordaz

District 7

Lily Limón

District 8

Cortney C. Niland

City Manager

Tommy Gonzalez

Economic & International Development Department

Chairman Helm asked Lorenzo what the name of the shingle color is.

Lorenzo responded Onyx Black.

Ms. Velázquez explained her assistant, Mr. Adam Train, spoke with Marcos Soto regarding this case. Mr. Soto stated that the explanation from Lorenzo was untrue. He never told anyone the property was NOT located in a historic district; furthermore, the address is tagged in the computer as historic property. She would ask Mr. Soto to appear before commissioners at the next HLC meeting.

Commissioner Lopez asked Lorenzo if he knew of a paint or stain for roofs, light gray or brown.

Lorenzo did not know but he would inquire.

Lorenzo explained he works for the homeowner not the insurance company.

Commissioner Lopez stated he would like to hear from Marcos Soto and perhaps Lorenzo could come up with a solution prior to the next meeting.

Chairman Helm requested Lorenzo bring a sample of the existing shingle with him to the next HLC meeting.

Commissioner Lopez suggested Lorenzo find a dark, dark tone to paint or stain the existing shingle.

Ms. Velázquez requested commissioners ask Lorenzo to bring his permit receipt to the next HLC meeting.

Lorenzo explained he does not have a permit. He was told he had to appear before commissioners prior to receiving a permit. The work was done over the Martin Luther King, Jr. weekend.

MOTION:

Motion made by Chairman Helm, seconded by Commissioner Lopez AND UNANIMOUSLY CARRIED TO POSTPONE TO THE NEXT MEETING TO ALLOW BOTH PARTIES TO GATHER ADDITIONAL INFORMATION.



Economic & International Development Department

Mayor

Oscar Leeser

City Council

District 1

Peter Svarzbein

District 2

Larry Romero

District 3

Emma Acosta

District 4

Carl L. Robinson

District 5

Dr. Michiel R. Noe

District 6

Claudia Ordaz

District 7

Lily Limón

District 8

Cortney C. Niland

City Manager

Tommy Gonzalez

4. Addresses of property HLC commissioners have requested that HLC staff review or investigate and provide a report to the HLC. If no addresses are submitted in advance and listed under this agenda item, commissioners may announce such addresses under this agenda item. Discussion on property announced at this meeting will take place during the next regularly scheduled meeting. February 22, 2016 deadline for HLC members to request for agenda items to be scheduled for the March 7, 2016 meeting. March 7, 2016 deadline for HLC members to request for agenda items to be schedule for the March 21, 2016 meeting.

No address requests from commissioners for staff to review or investigate.

HLC Staff Report

5. Update on Administrative Review Cases since the last HLC meeting for the properties listed on the attachment posted with this agenda. (See Attachment "A")

No comments from commissioners.

MOTION:

Motion made by Commissioner Lucero, seconded by Commissioner Córdova AND UNANIMOUSLY CARRIED TO APPROVE THE HLC STAFF REPORT.

Other Business – Discussion and Action

6. Approval of Regular Meeting Minutes for February 8, 2016

Chairman Helm asked commissioners if they had any additions, corrections and/or revisions. There were none.

MOTION:

Motion made by Chairman Helm, seconded by Commissioner Lucero AND UNANIMOUSLY CARRIED TO APPROVE THE REGULAR MEETING MINUTES FOR FEBRUARY 8, 2016.

MOTION:

Motion made by Chairman Helm, seconded by Commissioner Lucero AND UNANIMOUSLY CARRIED TO ADJOURN THE HLC MEETING AT 5:22 P.M.