



**HISTORIC LANDMARK COMMISSION MEETING MINUTES
1st FLOOR, AUDITORIUM
EL PASO MAIN LIBRARY, 501 N. OREGON
MAY 6, 2013
4:00 P.M.**

The El Paso Historic Landmark Commission held a public hearing in the Auditorium, 1st Floor, El Paso Main Library, May 6, 2013, 4:00 p.m.

The following commissioners were present:

Chairman David Berchelmann
Commissioner Cesar Gomez
Commissioner Beatriz Lucero
Commissioner Edgar Lopez
Commissioner Randy Brock

Commissioners Ricardo Fernandez, John Moses, and William Helm II were not present:

The following City staff members were present:

Ms. Providencia Velázquez, Historic Preservation Officer, City Development Department, Planning Division
Ms. Sol Cortez, Assistant City Attorney, City Attorney's Office

Chairman David Berchelmann called the meeting to order at 4:09 p.m., quorum present.

CHANGES TO THE AGENDA

None.

I. CALL TO THE PUBLIC – PUBLIC COMMENT

None.

II. REGULAR AGENDA – DISCUSSION AND ACTION

City Development Department
P.O. Box 1890 · El Paso, Texas 79950-1890
Phone (915) 541-4027 · Fax (915) 541-4725

Mayor
John F. Cook

City Council

District 1
Ann Morgan Lilly

District 2
Susie Byrd

District 3
Emma Acosta

District 4
Carl L. Robinson

District 5
Dr. Michiel R. Noe

District 6
Eddie Holguin Jr.

District 7
Steve Ortega

District 8
Cortney Carlisle Niland

City Manager
Joyce A. Wilson



Certificate of Appropriateness

1. PHAP13-00007: Lots 23 Mills, 63 ft. on Stanton, 120 ft. on Franklin SW corner, City of El Paso, El Paso County, Texas.
- Location: 311 Franklin Avenue
- Historic District: Listed on the El Paso Inventory of Historic Sites
- Property Owner: Joseph M. Nebhan
- Representative: Marilyn Del Rio, DRS Architecture
- Representative District: 8
- Existing Zoning: C-5 (Commercial)
- Year Built: 1921
- Historic Status: El Paso Inventory of Historic Sites
- Request: Certificate of Appropriateness for the installation of glass block in a storefront on Stanton Street in opposition to the submitted tax exemption application.
- Application Filed: 04/01/13
- 45 Day Expiration: 05/16/13

Ms. Velázquez gave a presentation and noted the applicant seeks approval for a Certificate of Appropriateness for the installation of glass block in a storefront on Stanton Street in opposition to the submitted tax exemption application. Ms. Velázquez reminded commissioners that Commissioner Helm had recommended a ballistic film be placed on the window which might tint the glass. However, it would protect it from damage, which was a concern by the property owner, because the storefront is very vulnerable to vandalism. The property owner wanted to try installing some type of glass or window type which wouldn't be easily destroyed. The property owner thought glass block was the solution. Staff researched and found out that glass block can be broken and cannot recommend it as an alternative to regular storefront glass.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

The Historic Preservation Office recommends DENIAL of the proposed scope of work based on the following recommendations:

The Design Guidelines for El Paso's Historic Districts, Sites, and Properties recommend the following:

City Development Department
P.O. Box 1890 · El Paso, Texas 79950-1890
Phone (915) 541-4027 · Fax (915) 541-4725

Mayor

John F. Cook

City Council

District 1

Ann Morgan Lilly

District 2

Susie Byrd

District 3

Emma Acosta

District 4

Carl L. Robinson

District 5

Dr. Michiel R. Noe

District 6

Eddie Holguin Jr.

District 7

Steve Ortega

District 8

Cortney Carlisle Niland

City Manager

Joyce A. Wilson



- *Retain and preserve storefronts that contribute to the overall historic character of a building, including such functional and decorative features as transoms, display windows, doors, entablatures, pilasters, recessed entries, and signs.*
- *Protect and maintain historic storefront features and materials through appropriate methods.*
- *Repair historic storefront features using recognized preservation methods for patching, consolidating splicing, and reinforcing.*
- *If replacement of a deteriorated detail or element of a storefront feature is necessary, replace only the deteriorated detail or element in kind rather than the entire feature. If replacement of an entire storefront feature is necessary, replace it in kind, matching the original feature in design, dimension, detail, texture, color, and material. Consider compatible substitute materials only if using the original material is not technically feasible.*
- *If a store front feature or an entire storefront is missing, replace it with a new feature or storefront based on accurate documentation. If accurate documentation is not available, then utilize a new design compatible with the building in scale, size, material, and color.*
- *It is appropriate to remove objects and later renovations to reveal original storefront openings obscured by the changes.*
- *It is not appropriate to introduce storefront features or details to a historic building in an attempt to create a false historical appearance.*
- *It is appropriate to mount security grilles, tracks and roll down shutters on the interior.*
- *All storefront glass shall be clear and un-tinted or un-mirrored.*

Mayor

John F. Cook

City Council

District 1

Ann Morgan Lilly

District 2

Susie Byrd

District 3

Emma Acosta

District 4

Carl L. Robinson

District 5

Dr. Michiel R. Noe

District 6

Eddie Holguin Jr.

District 7

Steve Ortega

District 8

Cortney Carlisle Niland

City Manager

Joyce A. Wilson

City Development Department

P.O. Box 1890 · El Paso, Texas 79950-1890

Phone (915) 541-4027 · Fax (915) 541-4725



The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation recommend the following:

- New construction will not destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property.

Neither Ms. Marilyn Del Rio, representative, nor Mr. Joseph M. Nebhan, owner, were present to respond to questions and comments from commissioners and staff.

MOTION:

Motion made by Commissioner Gomez, seconded by Commissioner Lopez AND UNANIMOUSLY CARRIED TO DENY AS PROPOSED BY STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION.

2. PHAP13-00009: 44 Ysleta Tract 2-A (6.978 Acres), Tract 2-B (0.066 Acres) (7.0440 Acres), City of El Paso, El Paso County, Texas.
- Location: 131 S. Zaragoza Road
Historic District: Ysleta
Property Owner: Catholic Diocese of El Paso
Representative: David Holguin
Representative District: 6
Existing Zoning: R-4/H (Residential/Historic)
Year Built: Unknown
Historic Status: Non-Contributing
Request: Certificate of Appropriateness for the alteration of the main façade and entrance on Parish Hall and construction of a stage, breezeway, and sidewalks.
- Application Filed: 04/24/13
45 Day Expiration: 06/08/13

Ms. Velázquez gave a presentation and noted the applicant seeks approval for a Certificate of Appropriateness for the alteration of the main façade and entrance on Parish Hall and construction of a stage, breezeway, and sidewalks.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

City Development Department
P.O. Box 1890 · El Paso, Texas 79950-1890
Phone (915) 541-4027 · Fax (915) 541-4725

Mayor
John F. Cook

City Council

District 1
Ann Morgan Lilly

District 2
Susie Byrd

District 3
Emma Acosta

District 4
Carl L. Robinson

District 5
Dr. Michiel R. Noe

District 6
Eddie Holguin Jr.

District 7
Steve Ortega

District 8
Cortney Carlisle Niland

City Manager
Joyce A. Wilson



The Historic Preservation Office recommends APPROVAL of the proposed scope of work based on the following recommendations:

The Ysleta Historic District Design Guidelines recommend the following:

- *The character of the Ysleta Historic District should be preserved through proper design and construction practices.*
- *Appropriate masonry for the Ysleta Historic District includes brick, stone, terra cotta, stucco finishes or synthetic coatings, and adobe.*
- *Metal, vinyl, asbestos and other synthetic materials are inappropriate, although some of these may be considered on an individual basis.*
- *Very little exterior metal has been used for construction within the Ysleta Historic District.*
- *Any new construction must be compatible in size, texture, color, design, proportion and detail to adjacent buildings and streetscapes; and must follow the specific architectural styles designated appropriate for that particular zone. Incorporating existing architectural features with new design elements can contribute added interest and compatibility.*
- *New structures should respect the integrity of existing buildings. Existing historic structures and streetscape need be taken into consideration before designing new infill construction. Setbacks, proportion, rhythm, and building elements should all be addressed.*
- *Almost all of the sidewalks in El Paso are made of concrete; however, other alternatives exist. For example, brick and stone pavers are available in a wide assortment of colors and patterns and can contribute to the overall enhancement of an area.*

The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation recommend the following:

City Development Department
P.O. Box 1890 · El Paso, Texas 79950-1890
Phone (915) 541-4027 · Fax (915) 541-4725

Mayor

John F. Cook

City Council

District 1

Ann Morgan Lilly

District 2

Susie Byrd

District 3

Emma Acosta

District 4

Carl L. Robinson

District 5

Dr. Michiel R. Noe

District 6

Eddie Holguin Jr.

District 7

Steve Ortega

District 8

Cortney Carlisle Niland

City Manager

Joyce A. Wilson



- *New additions, exterior alterations, or new construction will not destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and will be compatible with the historic materials, features, size, scale and proportion, and massing to protect the integrity of the property and its environment.*

Mr. David Holguin of EPG Planning Consultants, representative and parishioner, was present and responded to questions and comments from commissioners and staff references to landscaping. Grass will not be part of the landscaping due to the water requirements which causes an increase in the water bill. Also, Mr. Holguin informed commissioners that when the parking lot is completed there will be landscaping in the islands as seen on the Master Plan. There is landscaping throughout the parking lot area. The stage presently is an existing covered parking space. However, it will be renovated as a permanent stage. One of the issues being addressed is the aging community, which has caused a decrease of volunteers. The festival is one of the main sources of revenue for the parish, which assists in the maintenance.

MOTION:

Motion made by Chairman Berchelmann, seconded by Commissioner Lopez AND UNANIMOUSLY CARRIED TO APPROVE AS PER STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION.

3. Addresses of property HLC commissioners have requested that HLC staff review or investigate and provide a report to the HLC. If no addresses are submitted in advance and listed under this agenda item, commissioners may announce such addresses under this agenda item. Discussion on property announced at this meeting will take place during the next regularly scheduled meeting. May 6, 2013 deadline for HLC members to request for agenda items to be scheduled for the May 20, 2013 meeting. May 20, 2013 deadline for HLC members to request for agenda items to be scheduled for the June 10, 2013 meeting.

Ms. Velázquez informed commissioners there is no status report at this time in reference to Commissioner Gomez's request at the April 8, 2013 meeting regarding 620 Prospect. However, staff will review, investigate and provide a report to commissioners of the HLC.

City Development Department
P.O. Box 1890 · El Paso, Texas 79950-1890
Phone (915) 541-4027 · Fax (915) 541-4725

Mayor

John F. Cook

City Council

District 1

Ann Morgan Lilly

District 2

Susie Byrd

District 3

Emma Acosta

District 4

Carl L. Robinson

District 5

Dr. Michiel R. Noe

District 6

Eddie Holguin Jr.

District 7

Steve Ortega

District 8

Cortney Carlisle Niland

City Manager

Joyce A. Wilson



HLC Staff Report

4. Update on Administrative Review Cases since the last HLC meeting for the properties listed on the attachment posted with this agenda.
(See Attachment "A")

Ms. Velázquez informed commissioners that the Hotel Paso Del Norte, Inc., on 101 El Paso Street, informed staff that a company from Chicago was hired to remove, repair, clean and reinstall two art glass panels in the stained glass dome. It was also added that there is a constant problem with dust accumulating very easily, of which the manager of the hotel was notified.

MOTION:

Motion made by Chairman Berchermann, seconded by Commissioner Lucero AND UNANIMOUSLY CARRIED TO APPROVE THE ADMINISTRATIVE REVIEW REPORT.

Other Business

5. Approval of Regular Meeting Minutes for April 22, 2013.

Ms. Velázquez informed commissioners the minutes of April 22, 2013 are not available. However, they will be available at the next HLC meeting.

6. Update on potential historic district located in the Five Points West area.

Ms. Velázquez informed commissioners of results of the neighborhood meeting, which was held on April 29, 2013, at the Zion Lutheran Church on 2800 Pershing with property owners of the Five Points West area regarding the criteria for designation. The meeting was very successful. Out of 140 property owners from the neighborhood, 25 to 30 attended. Staff received positive feedback and lots of interest in support of the designation. Only one property owner opposed the designation. The next step is to mail out postcards to the neighborhood asking whether or not they would like to be El Paso's next historic district.

7. Update on the appeal of PHAP12-00049 – 2817 Wheeling Avenue.

Mayor

John F. Cook

City Council

District 1

Ann Morgan Lilly

District 2

Susie Byrd

District 3

Emma Acosta

District 4

Carl L. Robinson

District 5

Dr. Michiel R. Noe

District 6

Eddie Holguin Jr.

District 7

Steve Ortega

District 8

Cortney Carlisle Niland

City Manager

Joyce A. Wilson

City Development Department
P.O. Box 1890 · El Paso, Texas 79950-1890
Phone (915) 541-4027 · Fax (915) 541-4725



Ms. Velázquez updated the commissioners with regard to the appeal of the HLC's decision to deny the Certificate of Appropriateness for the partial enclosure of the front porch, after the fact. The appeal was denied and the HLC's decision was upheld by City Council based on the City finding the applicant some help with an addition that will be more compatible. The City did have several people out at the applicant's home including the Builders Association and an architect to assist with the addition.

Ms. Velázquez announced that the next HLC meeting location is tentatively scheduled to be held at the new Council Chambers first floor in the new City Hall building located at 300 N. Campbell. However, commissioners will be notified if there are any changes to the meeting location.

Motion made by Commissioner Lucero, seconded by Commissioner Brock **AND UNANIMOUSLY CARRIED TO ADJOURN THE MEETING AT 4:33 P.M.**

Mayor

John F. Cook

City Council

District 1

Ann Morgan Lilly

District 2

Susie Byrd

District 3

Emma Acosta

District 4

Carl L. Robinson

District 5

Dr. Michiel R. Noe

District 6

Eddie Holguin Jr.

District 7

Steve Ortega

District 8

Cortney Carlisle Niland

City Manager

Joyce A. Wilson

City Development Department

P.O. Box 1890 · El Paso, Texas 79950-1890

Phone (915) 541-4027 · Fax (915) 541-4725