



Economic & International Development Department

Mayor

Oscar Leeser

City Council

District 1

Ann Morgan Lilly

District 2

Larry Romero

District 3

Emma Acosta

District 4

Carl L. Robinson

District 5

Dr. Michiel R. Noe

District 6

Eddie Holguin Jr.

District 7

Lily Limón

District 8

Cortney C. Niland

City Manager

Tommy Gonzalez

REVISED

HISTORIC LANDMARK COMMISSION MEETING MINUTES 1st FLOOR, CITY COUNCIL CHAMBERS CITY HALL BUILDING, 300 N. CAMPBELL JULY 7, 2014 4:00 P.M.

The El Paso Historic Landmark Commission held a public hearing in the City Council Chambers, 1st Floor, City Hall Building, July 7, 2014, 4:00 p.m.

The following commissioners were present:

Chairman David Berchelmann
Commissioner Beatriz Lucero
Commissioner Randy Brock
Commissioner Cesar Gomez
Commissioner William C. Helm II

The following commissioners were not present:

Vice-Chairman Edgar Lopez
Commissioner John L. Moses
Commissioner Ricardo Fernandez

The following City staff members were present:

Ms. Providencia Velázquez, Historic Preservation Officer, Economic & International Development
Ms. Karla Nieman, Assistant City Attorney, City Attorney's Office

CALL TO ORDER

Chairman Berchelmann called the meeting to order at 4:10 p.m., quorum present.

CHANGES TO THE AGENDA

Ms. Velázquez requested the following two agenda items be postponed:

1. *Agenda item 2 – PHAP14-00014, 3200 Wheeling Avenue*
2. *Agenda item 6 – Mr. Joe Gudenrath, Chairman, El Paso Downtown Management District*

I. CALL TO THE PUBLIC – PUBLIC COMMENT

Mr. Bernie Sargent, Chairman, El Paso County Historical Commission ("EPCHC"), appeared before commissioners to discuss the Independent Progressive Body presented to commissioners by Dr. Max Grossman, Vice-Chairman, El Paso County Historical Commission at the June 2, 2014 meeting.



Economic & International Development Department

Mayor

Oscar Leeser

City Council

District 1

Ann Morgan Lilly

District 2

Larry Romero

District 3

Emma Acosta

District 4

Carl L. Robinson

District 5

Dr. Michiel R. Noe

District 6

Eddie Holguin Jr.

District 7

Lily Limón

District 8

Cortney C. Niland

City Manager

Tommy Gonzalez

EL PASO COUNTY HISTORICAL COMMISSION

Mr. Sargent explained the El Paso County Historical Commission would like to work in conjunction with the El Paso Historic Landmark Commission on a program that would update the way things are being handled here in the community. Mr. Sargent explained the EPCHC is comprised of two dozen individuals from various parts of the county with various backgrounds, i.e., developers, historians, preservationists, etc., individuals interested in heritage and culture in our community.

EL PASO COUNTY HISTORICAL COMMISSION SUBCOMMITTEE

The El Paso County Historical Society created a subcommittee of 20 to 30 individuals (depending on the date and day) made up of architects, engineers, etc., who are also very much concerned about the direction in which El Paso is going. This subcommittee is based on history around the country – organizations and communities, much like ours, who are struggling to find themselves as they grow. Some communities continue to rebrand themselves; others choose to imitate other communities, i.e., Santa Fe. When communities choose to emulate other communities, after much research it was discovered that, with regard to heritage tourism, more people tend to stay longer and spend more money, which provides more jobs and more tax revenue. For this reason and for reasons Dr. Grossman alluded to the EPCHC is trying to apply as much pressure, so to speak, on individuals to come up with a realistic, common sense approach towards preservation.

EPCHC SUBCOMMITTEE OBJECTIVES/RECOMMENDATIONS

1. Fund an independent professional commission to review the values of the Downtown Historic District and all designations therein and to re-access the historical/cultural significance of all architecture outside the Downtown Historic District;
2. Reform the City of El Paso Municipal Code, with many loose ends and loop holes which individuals have found ways to work around;
3. The subcommittee requests a nine to twelve month moratorium on all demolitions of buildings, 75 years or older, until the commission comes back with a report on their findings of the architectural/heritage significance of those particular structures;
4. Update an ordinance to mandate that the Historic Landmark Commission have review authority on demolition permit requests for buildings over 75 years of age;

Mr. Sargent explained he is a volunteer and appointee, both by County Commissioners Court and City Representatives, of several various organizations and finds it frustrating when you do your job, expect it to be professional, and advocate to the best of your education and knowledge, only to have someone at the City overturn it because of an emotional tie or bond with an organization or company. The subcommittee is trying to promote this approach to assist the HLC to do your job to the best of your ability and encourage the city leadership to be cognizant of the opportunities available and to encourage people to come to El Paso and share our great architectural heritage, not only Henry Trost but many others as well. Furthermore, the EPCHC is requesting the HLC's assistance in supporting the outreach that the EPCHC is trying to accomplish.

Economic & International Development

City 3 | 801 Texas Avenue | El Paso, Texas 79901 | (915) 212-0094

Dedicated to Outstanding Customer Service for a Better Community



Economic & International Development Department

Mayor

Oscar Leeser

City Council

District 1

Ann Morgan Lilly

District 2

Larry Romero

District 3

Emma Acosta

District 4

Carl L. Robinson

District 5

Dr. Michiel R. Noe

District 6

Eddie Holguin Jr.

District 7

Lily Limón

District 8

Cortney C. Niland

City Manager

Tommy Gonzalez

5. The EPCHC wants to work in concert with developers.

In the past there have been situations where developers have requested assistance from the State of Texas, the Texas Historical Commission. The EPCHC is willing to talk with Mark Wolfe, Executive Director, to discuss a common sense approach regarding the rehabilitation of structures, to assist developers make sense of what they are trying to accomplish without costing an arm and a leg.

COMMISSIONERS COMMENTS/QUESTIONS FOR MR. SARGENT

Chairman Berchelmann thanked Mr. Sargent for taking the time to come and speak to commissioners. He explained the Historic Landmark Commission's jurisdiction is only within the existing historic districts, the sizes of which are ever dwindling. He asked Mr. Sargent what he would like commissioners to review and/or discuss.

Mr. Sargent responded the EPCHC has already reviewed the Municipal Code and has put together some thoughts and ideas for commissioners to review. He hoped these thoughts and ideas would encourage commissioners to support the EPCHC in trying to accomplish its goals and objectives. When it comes to conservation the EPCHC are not naysayers or fanatics, we understand everything cannot be saved; however, there are times when it makes sense to respect preservation, considering the number of recently demolished historic structures downtown.

MR. SARGENT'S COMMENTS REGARDING NEW YORK UTILITY STUDY

Mr. Sargent referred to a New York City buildings/structures utility usage study. The study concluded that, due to the manner in which they were constructed, buildings over 30 years old utilized less electricity, water, etc. The study also found structures less than 30 years old to be harder to heat and cool. This is just one example of the importance of preserving historic structures.

In conclusion, Mr. Sargent asked commissioners for their assistance and support in trying to make El Paso a better place to live, than what is now.

Chairman Berchelmann agreed. He stated commissioners have discussed this issue over the past several weeks; furthermore, he felt that commissioners were in agreement. Regarding the City of El Paso Municipal Code, Chairman Berchelmann asked Mr. Sargent when the EPCHC would be willing to present their reform requests to commissioners so that staff could include that presentation on the agenda.

Mr. Sargent responded he would be happy to do provide that information to staff.



Economic & International Development Department

Mayor

Oscar Leeser

City Council

District 1

Ann Morgan Lilly

District 2

Larry Romero

District 3

Emma Acosta

District 4

Carl L. Robinson

District 5

Dr. Michiel R. Noe

District 6

Eddie Holguin Jr.

District 7

Lily Limón

District 8

Cortney C. Niland

City Manager

Tommy Gonzalez

TEMPORARY RESTRICTION ON DEMOLITION PERMITS FOR BUILDINGS OVER 75 YEARS OLD

Mr. Sargent asked Ms. Velázquez if it was feasible for the Historic Landmark Commission to request temporary restrictions on demolition permits for buildings over 75 years old or does the EPCHC have to go through the City.

Ms. Karla Nieman, Assistant City Attorney, stated that City Council would determine whether to initiate a moratorium, or not. Furthermore, the process for moratoriums is very lengthy; for example, the City would have to make various findings, hold numerous public hearings, etc., as to what circumstances exist to allow the city to issue a moratorium on those demolition permits. In the past, she explained, city moratoriums were mostly for residential developments. To conclude, Ms. Nieman stated that moratoriums were beyond the purview of the Historic Landmark Commission.

Mr. Sargent responded he had recently heard of a plan whereby all demolition permits would be free, until the year 2020. He felt that the city was sending a message to the developers encouraging them to demolish and urged the city to stay away from that kind of mentality and motivation. Following Ms. Nieman's explanation, Mr. Sargent asked what his options were.

Chairman Berchelmann replied a City Council Representative would have to place an item on the agenda to allow City Council to discuss and/or take action.

Ms. Velázquez suggested Mr. Sargent, as well as each of the Historic Landmark Commissioners, speak to the City Council Representatives regarding these concerns/ideas/issues and request their support.

Mr. Sargent noted that the EPCHC is eligible for the State of Texas, Texas Historical Commission's *Main Street* program. This program has created many jobs through renovation/rehabilitation buildings in downtown areas. In addition to the concerns/ideas/issues presented, Mr. Sargent will explain the *Main Street* program to City Council Representatives, especially, as this program offers incentives and motivation for cities to consider renovation/rehabilitation, as opposed to demolition.

Chairman Berchelmann concurred with Mr. Sargent. He then asked staff it would be permissible for commissioners to compose a letter of support for the EPCHC. Chairman Berchelmann commented on commissioners reviewing/redrawing the existing boundaries for the Downtown Historic District.

Ms. Velázquez replied a letter of support from the commission would be permissible.

Economic & International Development

City 3 | 801 Texas Avenue | El Paso, Texas 79901 | (915) 212-0094

Dedicated to Outstanding Customer Service for a Better Community



Economic & International Development Department

Mayor

Oscar Leeser

City Council

District 1

Ann Morgan Lilly

District 2

Larry Romero

District 3

Emma Acosta

District 4

Carl L. Robinson

District 5

Dr. Michiel R. Noe

District 6

Eddie Holguin Jr.

District 7

Lily Limón

District 8

Cortney C. Niland

City Manager

Tommy Gonzalez

Regarding Dr. Grossman coming before the commission at the previous meeting, Chairman Berchelmann explained, commissioners took no action at that time pending Mr. Sargent’s presentation today and another presentation from Dr. Grossman.

Mr. Sargent suggested commissioners wait until Dr. Grossman’s return before placing an item on the HLC agenda and requested discussions continue to move forward. He agreed that speaking to each of the City Council Representatives was important. He explained he had recently read a quote in the newspaper that was upsetting to him, he stated they do not understand what it is the EPCHC is trying to accomplish.

TEXAS HISTORICAL COMMISSION – VISIONARIES IN PRESERVATION PROGRAM

Mr. Sargent commented that the City had spent monies on the Texas Historical Commission’s *Visionaries in Preservation program*, which took place over the course of an entire year; however, nothing ever came from that. In our presentation to City Council Representatives, EPCHC would resurrect that information.

Chairman Berchelmann noted Dr. Grossman stated it was not feasible to save everything; however, for posterity, it is important to identify historic structures we would like not to be demolished.

II. REGULAR AGENDA – DISCUSSION AND ACTION

Certificate of Appropriateness

- PHAP14-00013:** Being 12 Manhattan Heights All of Block (7500 Sq. Ft.), City of El Paso, El Paso County, Texas

Location: 3200 Wheeling Avenue

Historic District: Manhattan Heights

Property Owner: El Paso Independent School District

Representative: New Republic Architecture

Representative District: 2

Existing Zoning: R-3/H (Residential/Historic)

Year Built: 1920

Historic Status: Landmark

Request: Certificate of Appropriateness for demolition and reconstruction of an existing exterior ramp and construction of a new ramp in the courtyard

Application Filed: 6/19/14

45 Day Expiration: 8/3/14



Economic & International Development Department

Mayor

Oscar Leeser

City Council

District 1

Ann Morgan Lilly

District 2

Larry Romero

District 3

Emma Acosta

District 4

Carl L. Robinson

District 5

Dr. Michiel R. Noe

District 6

Eddie Holguin Jr.

District 7

Lily Limón

District 8

Cortney C. Niland

City Manager

Tommy Gonzalez

Ms. Velázquez gave a presentation and noted the property owner sought approval for a Certificate of Appropriateness for demolition and reconstruction of an existing exterior ramp and construction of a new ramp in the courtyard. The property, Crockett Elementary School, is located at 3200 Wheeling Avenue in the Manhattan Heights Historic District. The proposed demolition and reconstruction will take place in two locations on campus:

1. Positioned near the campus border, a steep ramp, situated between two stucco covered rock walls with chain link fencing; and
2. Inside the school campus, a courtyard ramp, not readily visible from the right-of-way

NOTE

Per the presentation photos, Ms. Velázquez elaborated on:

1. The ramp leading into *Crockett Elementary School*; and
2. The ramp leading into *the new school*

Ms. Velázquez then explained the property owner's proposal and process for each ramp, as follows:

- a. Steep ramp:
 - a. Demolish the existing ramp and a portion of the area enclosed by chain link
 - b. Construct a much bigger ramp, with three landings;
 - c. The remaining area to be enclosed by chain link again;
 - d. No landscaping proposed;
 - e. Reconstructed steep ramp will consist of:
 1. concrete masonry units (to be scored);
 2. masonry copings on top; and
 3. visible from public right-of-way.
- b. Courtyard ramp:
 - a. Proposed ramp will be adjacent the existing ramp;
 - b. Existing courtyard area (trees, sunflowers, potted plants, grass, etc.) to be removed; and
 - c. A portion(s) of the original fabric to be removed to accommodate the new ramp.

NECESSITY OF/FOR THE PROPOSED INTERIOR RAMP – EXISTING ACCESSIBILITY

While conducting the site visit, Ms. Velázquez and the project architect discussed the necessity of/for the new interior ramp. The existing ramp provides access to the auditorium and a classroom. Although it might be somewhat inconvenient, access to the auditorium and classroom is available via the existing ramp.



Economic & International Development Department

Mayor

Oscar Leeser

City Council

District 1

Ann Morgan Lilly

District 2

Larry Romero

District 3

Emma Acosta

District 4

Carl L. Robinson

District 5

Dr. Michiel R. Noe

District 6

Eddie Holguin Jr.

District 7

Lily Limón

District 8

Cortney C. Niland

City Manager

Tommy Gonzalez

The Historic Preservation Office recommends **APPROVAL WITH MODIFICATIONS*** of the proposed scope of work based on the following recommendations:

The Design Guidelines for El Paso’s Historic Districts, Sites, and Properties recommend the following:

- *Introduce fire exits, stairs, landings, and ramps on rear or inconspicuous side locations.*
- *Construct fire exits, stairs, landings, and ramps in such a manner that they do not damage historic materials and features. Construct them so that they can be removed in the future with minimal damage to the historic structure.*
- *Design and construct new fire exits, stairs, and landings to be compatible with the scale, materials, details, and finish of the historic structure.*
- *Features added to assist persons with disabilities should be designed and constructed so that the original design of the entrance or porch is not diminished and historic materials or features are not damaged.*

The Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation recommend the following:

- *New construction will not destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property.*
- *The new work shall be differentiated from the old and will be compatible with the historic materials, features, size, scale, and proportion, and massing to protect the integrity of the property and its environment.*
- *New construction will be undertaken in such a manner that, if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.*

***THE MODIFICATIONS ARE:**

1. **THAT THE CHAIN LINK FENCE BE REMOVED AND REPLACED WITH DARK METAL PICKET FENCING;**
2. **THAT THE CEMENT COVERED ROCK WALL AT THE MAIN FAÇADE BE REPLACED WITH A NEW STUCCO WALL; AND**
3. **THAT THE RAMP AT THE INTERIOR COURTYARD BE ELIMINATED BECAUSE ACCESS TO THE WING HAS BEEN PROVIDED BY VIRTURE OF AN EXISTING RAMP.**

PUBLIC COMMENT/SUGGESTION

Ms. Julie Rutledge, Manhattan Heights Neighbor Association Board Member/property owner within the Manhattan Heights Historic District, concurred with the modifications proposed by Ms. Velázquez. However, Ms. Rutledge proposed:

STEEP RAMP

1. The larger retaining wall (site of proposed ramp) be concrete stucco to match the existing color and materials, rather than introducing the CMU;
2. Eliminating chain link fence, in rectangular area; and
3. Rather than wrought iron, railing to match (color and materials) existing railing in front of the school.

Economic & International Development

City 3 | 801 Texas Avenue | El Paso, Texas 79901 | (915) 212-0094

Dedicated to Outstanding Customer Service for a Better Community



Economic & International Development Department

Mayor

Oscar Leeser

Chairman Berchelmann asked Ms. Velázquez if commissioners could include Ms. Rutledge’s suggested modification, eliminating chain link fence in the rectangular area (steep ramp).

Ms. Velázquez replied yes.

City Council

District 1

Ann Morgan Lilly

COMMENTS/SUGGESTIONS FROM COMMISSIONERS

District 2

Larry Romero

ADA NON-COMPLIANCE

Commissioner Helm explained due to non-compliance per ADA regulations, liability insurance, egress via IBC, etc., the property owner is taking steps to remedy these concerns now.

District 3

Emma Acosta

Ms. Velázquez explained staff is not asking the property owner to remove the existing ramp leading into the corridor between the auditorium and classroom. In case of fire, or other emergencies, the ramp will be available for students to exit the building safely. She clarified the issue is not egress but ingress, which has been met due to the other existing ramp.

District 4

Carl L. Robinson

Mr. Angel Ramos, New Republic Architects, responded he would modify the drawings to accommodate commissioners’ requests. Because of an inspection by the State of Texas, EPISD is required to provide access at these two locations. Additionally, due to funding restrictions, the District instructed New Republic Architects to accomplish the accessibility requirements mandated by the State of Texas within budget.

District 5

Dr. Michiel R. Noe

District 6

Eddie Holguin Jr.

1. Ramp (Steep) – Location was selected so as not to hinder the historical look of the building;
2. Furthermore, the ramp (steep) does not have a landing in front of the doors;
3. Wrought iron rather than chain link fence (security)– must be approved by property owner;
4. Ramp (courtyard) – Per Texas Accessibility Standards;
 - a. access through the auditorium does not comply;
 - b. the auditorium ramps are too steep for individuals in wheelchairs;
 - c. cannot segregate individuals in wheelchairs to use a different route than other students; and
 - d. Mr. Ramos agreed the courtyard area would become quite cluttered with the additional ramp

District 7

Lily Limón

District 8

Cortney C. Niland

City Manager

Tommy Gonzalez

STATE OF TEXAS VARIANCE PROCESS

Mr. Ramos explained, per the advice of the State of Texas Accessibility Specialist, there is a possibility the courtyard ramp would not be constructed; however, New Republic Architects must initiate the variance process, via the State of Texas, requesting this section of the building not be wheelchair accessible. Mr. Ramos stated, regardless of the historic status, the building must be wheelchair accessible.



Economic & International Development Department

Mayor

Oscar Leeser

City Council

District 1

Ann Morgan Lilly

District 2

Larry Romero

District 3

Emma Acosta

District 4

Carl L. Robinson

District 5

Dr. Michiel R. Noe

District 6

Eddie Holguin Jr.

District 7

Lily Limón

District 8

Cortney C. Niland

City Manager

Tommy Gonzalez

Commissioner Helm noted the request for a variance is quite a lengthy process. He felt it was beyond the purview of the commission to eliminate the courtyard ramp from the scope of work due to the non-compliance violations from the State.

Mr. Ramos stated he could speak to the property owner regarding the commission's concerns and possibly revise the proposed plans.

Chairman Berchelmann concurred with most of the proposed modifications except doing away with the courtyard ramp.

Ms. Velázquez clarified the small courtyard area will be removed in its entirety. She wondered, if the same means of ingress/egress access must be provided to all students why not use the front entrance to the school. Additionally, would it be possible to provide a wheelchair lift where the existing ramp is now.

Mr. Ramos explained the idea to place an accessible ramp in front of the building would affect the aesthetics of the building greater; additionally, per the property owner, ramps are the preferred method as wheelchair lifts require heavy maintenance and are not reliable.

APPROVE DEMOLITION AND RECONSTRUCTION OF EXISTING EXTERIOR RAMP (STEEP)

Mr. Ramos suggested commissioners approve the demolition and reconstruction of the exterior (steep ramp) and allow him time to speak with the District regarding the commissions suggested revisions.

Ms. Velázquez explained commissioners must make a decision prior to the 45-day expiration day, August 3, 2014. Per legal advice, it is permissible approve the Certificate of Appropriateness, postponing the construction of a new ramp in the courtyard to a future agenda.

Mr. Ramos thought the property owner would like to proceed with the demolition/reconstruction portion.

ADDITIONAL PUBLIC COMMENT

Mr. Sergio Martinez, member of the public, explained his three daughters attended Crockett Elementary School. While attending Crockett, one of his daughters was diagnosed with cancer, which required her to be wheelchair bound most of her fifth grade year. Mr. Martinez stated his daughter experienced great difficulty accessing her classrooms due to the varying levels of topography in addition to the school's three stories. Mr. Martinez felt the courtyard area was not historic whatsoever; additionally, the courtyard railing (round pipe) does not match the existing brick and stone.

Economic & International Development

City 3 | 801 Texas Avenue | El Paso, Texas 79901 | (915) 212-0094

Dedicated to Outstanding Customer Service for a Better Community



Economic & International Development Department

Mayor

Oscar Leeser

City Council

District 1

Ann Morgan Lilly

District 2

Larry Romero

District 3

Emma Acosta

District 4

Carl L. Robinson

District 5

Dr. Michiel R. Noe

District 6

Eddie Holguin Jr.

District 7

Lily Limón

District 8

Cortney C. Niland

City Manager

Tommy Gonzalez

Ms. Rutledge stated she was in favor of approving the demolition and reconstruction of an existing exterior ramp and was not opposed to postponing the Certificate of Appropriateness for the construction of a new ramp in the courtyard to allow further discussion/proposals.

Chairman Helm asked Ms. Velázquez when construction of the first (courtyard) ramp occurred.

Ms. Velázquez was not sure when construction was approved but it had to have come before the commission. The ramp may have been grandfathered as the Historic District was designated in 1989; furthermore, the original Administrative Guidelines did allow for the construction of ramps as long as they were not readily visible from the right-of-way. The current Administrative Guidelines require ramps be placed where they are least visible, will do the least amount of damage and less likely to lose historic value. Additionally, as this is a public project using public funds, the project is being brought before commissioners today. Per an agreement with the former City Council Representative for this District, projects of this kind and scope would be brought before the commission.

Commissioner Helm stated, regarding the two existing courtyard ramps, the previous commission should have required brick on the fascia.

Chairman Berchelman and Commissioners Lucero and Helm were in favor of providing the architect additional time to discuss the proposed suggestions with the property owner.

Mr. Ramos reiterated the property owner has tasked New Republic Architects to stay within the budget and that the proposed construction be as aesthetically pleasing as possible.

MOTION:

Motion made by Chairman Berchelman, seconded by Commissioner Helm AND UNANIMOUSLY CARRIED TO APPROVE THE CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS FOR THE DEMOLITION AND RECONSTRUCTION OF THE EXISTING EXTERIOR RAMP WITH THE FOLLOWING MODIFICATIONS:

1. **THAT ALL CHAIN LINK FENCE BE REMOVED AND REPLACED WITH A DARK METAL PICKET FENCING;**
2. **THAT THE CEMENT COVERED ROCK WALL BENEATH THE FAÇADE BE REPLACED WITH THE NEW STUCCO WALL; AND**
3. **THAT THE CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS FOR THE CONSTRUCTION OF A NEW RAMP IN THE COURTYARD BE POSTPONED TO THE NEXT HLC MEETING.**



Economic & International Development Department

Mayor

Oscar Leeser

City Council

District 1

Ann Morgan Lilly

District 2

Larry Romero

District 3

Emma Acosta

District 4

Carl L. Robinson

District 5

Dr. Michiel R. Noe

District 6

Eddie Holguin Jr.

District 7

Lily Limón

District 8

Cortney C. Niland

City Manager

Tommy Gonzalez

- 2. **PHAP14-00014:** Being 12 Manhattan heights All of Block (7500 Sq. Ft.), City of El Paso, El Paso County, Texas
 - Location: 3200 Wheeling Avenue
 - Historic District: Manhattan Heights
 - Property Owner: El Paso Independent School District
 - Representative: ASA Architecture
 - Representative District: 2
 - Existing Zoning: R-3/H (Residential/Historic)
 - Year Built: 1920
 - Historic Status: Landmark
 - Request: Certificate of Appropriateness for changes to previously approved building
 - Application Filed: 6/23/14
 - 45 Day Expiration: 8/7/14

POSTPONED

The property owner asked that this item be postponed so that the neighborhood association has time to review the changes.

Commissioner Helm asked Ms. Velázquez why this item is being postponed.

Ms. Velázquez explained the representative requested the postponement as they have not had time to discuss the changes with the Manhattan Heights Neighborhood Association. Ms. Velázquez clarified ~~that Commissioner Helm was the architect for the multi-purpose room. should recuse himself from discussing and voting as the Commissioner's firm were the architects for the multi-purpose room.~~

Commissioner Helm responded he was not appointed to the commission when the project was presented to the HLC initially. ~~replied he recused himself from the discussion and vote at the time the project was originally placed on the HLC agenda;~~ Furthermore, he does not work for the architectural firm and no longer has a financial interest in the matter.

Commissioner Helm remembered numerous and lengthy discussions with the community regarding this project. He noticed the design has changed significantly since previously submitted, possibly due to budget constraints. He asked Ms. Velázquez if he could get a copy of the actual drawing submitted.

Ms. Velázquez would provide those copies for the commissioner.

- 3. **PHAP14-00015:** Being 110 Government Hill all of Block, City of El Paso, El Paso County, Texas
 - Location: 4601 Hastings Drive
 - Historic District: Austin Terrace
 - Property Owner: Franciscan Fathers of Texas



Economic & International Development Department

Mayor

Oscar Leeser

City Council

District 1

Ann Morgan Lilly

District 2

Larry Romero

District 3

Emma Acosta

District 4

Carl L. Robinson

District 5

Dr. Michiel R. Noe

District 6

Eddie Holguin Jr.

District 7

Lily Limón

District 8

Cortney C. Niland

City Manager

Tommy Gonzalez

Representative:	Alfredo Villagran Herrera
Representative District:	2
Existing Zoning:	R-4/H (Residential/Historic)
Year Built:	c. 1916-1917
Historic Status:	Landmark
Request:	Certificate of Appropriateness for the construction of a pergola at the rear of the property after-the-fact.
Application Filed:	6/26/14
45 Day Expiration:	8/10/14

Ms. Velázquez gave a presentation and noted the applicant sought approval of a Certificate of Appropriateness for the construction of a pergola at the rear of the property, St. Anthony’s Seminary, after-the-fact. Each year the seminary hosts festivities with pre-constructed booths along the perimeter. The plan was to remove the pre-constructed booths and construct a pergola and U-shaped courtyard. The pergola is not attached to any building on the property and is not visible from Hastings Drive. However, from the rear on Crescent, the pergola is somewhat visible.

The Historic Preservation Office recommends **APPROVAL** of the proposed scope of work based on the following recommendations:

The Design Guidelines for El Paso’s Historic Districts, Sites, and Properties recommend the following:

- *Place non-traditional site features such as swimming pools, playground equipment, concrete pads and basketball goals, tree houses, dumpsters, and trash receptacles only in areas such as rear yards, where they are not visible from the street.*
- *Construction of new fences, stairs, or sidewalk rails and replacement of older existing fences is allowed on historic properties provided that the proposed site feature is of a compatible material and scale.*

The Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation recommend the following:

- *New construction will not destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property.*
- *The new work shall be differentiated from the old and will be compatible with the historic materials, features, size, scale, and proportion, and massing to protect the integrity of the property and its environment.*
- *New construction will be undertaken in such a manner that, if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.*

Mr. Sergio Martinez, not project architect, member of San Jose Brotherhood, Brotherhood helps Diocese with projects via volunteer work. He was notified by the Franciscans of the situation involving Code Enforcement staff. Mr. Martinez cautioned the Franciscans to follow proper procedure, drawings, etc., the next time they want to do some construction. The bazaar is their yearly fundraising; however, the Franciscans are tired of building/demolishing the booths every year. He has recommended the Franciscans stain the concrete to hide the cooking oil that spills;



Economic & International Development Department

Mayor

Oscar Leeser

City Council

District 1

Ann Morgan Lilly

District 2

Larry Romero

District 3

Emma Acosta

District 4

Carl L. Robinson

District 5

Dr. Michiel R. Noe

District 6

Eddie Holguin Jr.

District 7

Lily Limón

District 8

Cortney C. Niland

City Manager

Tommy Gonzalez

additionally, per the 16" x 16" columns, he has suggested a 12" base to make the columns more presentable.

Ms. Velázquez stated that, had the Franciscans been brought to her initially, she would have recommended something smaller unfortunately the Franciscans have completed quite a bit of the construction. She explained commissioners have approved pergolas in the past. Additionally, she would have recommended the design be compatible with the existing structure.

Mr. Martinez explained the proposed roof covering is a 30 pound felt with 60 pounds on top. The Franciscans will be removing the existing roof.

Commissioner Helm asked how the underside of the pergola would be treated.

Mr. Martinez explained the underside will not be painted/stained but left as is; however, the columns will extend to the bottom of the structure. He proposed that, sometime in the future, the Franciscans would submit the proper demolition and construction plans for the structures are the rear of the property to construct something similar.

Chairman Berchermann requested Mr. Martinez work with Ms. Velázquez regarding the stained concrete color.

Mr. Martinez explained the stucco will be painted to match the existing.

Commissioner Gomez asked Mr. Martinez if the support brackets would be stained.

Mr. Martinez responded the plan is to leave them as is as the Franciscans are running out of monies.

MOTION:

Motion made by Chairman Berchermann, seconded by Commissioner Gomez AND UNANIMOUSLY CARRIED TO APPROVE AND THAT THE HISTORIC PRESERVATION OFFICER HAVE FINAL APPROVAL FOR THE STAINED CONCRETE.

- Addresses of property HLC commissioners have requested that HLC staff review or investigate and provide a report to the HLC. If no addresses are submitted in advance and listed under this agenda item, commissioners may announce such addresses under this agenda item. Discussion on property announced at this meeting will take place during the next regularly scheduled meeting. July 7, 2014 deadline for HLC members to request for agenda items to be scheduled for the July 21, 2014 meeting. July 21, 2014 deadline for HLC members to request for agenda items to be scheduled for the August 4, 2014 meeting.



Economic & International Development Department

Mayor

Oscar Leeser

City Council

District 1

Ann Morgan Lilly

District 2

Larry Romero

District 3

Emma Acosta

District 4

Carl L. Robinson

District 5

Dr. Michiel R. Noe

District 6

Eddie Holguin Jr.

District 7

Lily Limón

District 8

Cortney C. Niland

City Manager

Tommy Gonzalez

UPDATE REGARDING THE PROPERTY LOCATED AT 1033 UPSON

Ms. Velázquez noted the paint on the bricks has not been removed; however, when the appeal was presented to City Council in 2011, she informed City Council and the applicant that until the paint is removed there will be no further permits processed by her office for this property. Since that time, she has received one application for this property; however, the request was denied until the paint is removed.

Ms. Velázquez understood Code Enforcement staff has tried to take the applicant to court; however, due to the applicant's attorney, no progress has taken place. She will contact Code Enforcement staff for an update.

HLC Staff Report

5. Update on Administrative Review Cases since the last HLC meeting for the properties listed on the attachment posted with this agenda.

Chairman Berchelmann asked commissioners if they had any comments and/or questions for staff. *There were none.*

MOTION:

Motion made by Chairman Berchelmann, seconded by Commissioner Gomez AND UNANIMOUSLY CARRIED TO APPROVE THE HLC STAFF REPORT.

Other Business – Discussion and Action

6. Mr. Joe Gudenrath, Chairman, El Paso Downtown Management District

Item postponed to the July 21, 2014 meeting.

7. Comment/Discussion on Downtown Historic District and issues related to outside properties.

See pages 1 – 5

8. Approval of Regular Meeting Minutes for June 2 and June 16, 2014

There were no minutes to review.

MOTION:

Motion made by Chairman Berchelmann, seconded by Commissioner Brock AND UNANIMOUSLY CARRIED TO ADJOURN THE MEETING AT 5:22 P.M.