



HISTORIC LANDMARK COMMISSION MEETING MINUTES

AMENDED

**FIRST FLOOR, COUNCIL CHAMBERS
CITY 1 BUILDING, 300 N. CAMPBELL STREET
SEPTEMBER 26, 2016, 4:00 P.M.**

Mayor
Oscar Leeser

City Council

District 1
Peter Svarzbein

District 2
Jim Tolbert

District 3
Emma Acosta

District 4
Carl L. Robinson

District 5
Dr. Michiel R. Noe

District 6
Claudia Ordaz

District 7
Lily Limón

District 8
Cortney C. Niland

City Manager
Tommy Gonzalez

The El Paso Historic Landmark Commission held a public hearing in the Council Chambers, City 1 Building, 300 N. Campbell Street, September 26, 2016, 4:00 p.m.

The following commissioners were present:

Chairman William Helm

Commissioner Joseph Longo

Commissioner Randy Brock

Commissioner Edgar Lopez

Commissioner Charles Stapler

Commissioner Kelly Blough

Commissioner Daniel Carey-Whalen (*left meeting at 5:30 p.m.*)

The following City staff members were present:

Ms. Providencia Velázquez, Historic Preservation Officer, Economic & International Development

Mr. Omar DeLaRosa, Assistant City Attorney, City Attorney's Office

Mr. Adam Train, Planner, Historic Preservation Office, Economic & International Development

CALL TO ORDER

Chairman Helm called the meeting to order at 4:10 p.m., quorum present.

INTRODUCTION OF NEW COMMISSIONERS

New commissioners Kelly Blough and Daniel Carey-Whalen introduced themselves. Chairman Helm and Ms. Velázquez welcomed the new commissioners.

PUBLIC COMMENT

Chairman Helm asked if anyone present would like to address the Commission on issues not posted on the agenda. There was no response.

CHANGES TO THE AGENDA

Ms. Velázquez noted the following changes to the agenda:

1. Items 1. and 2. will be discussed concurrently, and
2. Item 3. was withdrawn per the applicant's request



Mayor

Oscar Leeser

City Council

District 1

Peter Svarzbein

District 2

Jim Tolbert

District 3

Emma Acosta

District 4

Carl L. Robinson

District 5

Dr. Michiel R. Noe

District 6

Claudia Ordaz

District 7

Lily Limón

District 8

Cortney C. Niland

City Manager

Tommy Gonzalez

Items 1 and 2 to be discussed concurrently

- 1. PHDM16-00003:** 46 Ysleta Tr 10-C-2, City of El Paso, El Paso County, Texas
Location: 9129 Valdiviez Street
Historic District: Ysleta
Property Owner: Imelda and Carlos Christensen
Representative: Sotero Ramirez
Representative District: 6
Existing Zoning: R-4/H (Residential/Historic)
Year Built: 1943
Historic Status: Non-Contributing
Request: Certificate of Demolition for the *demolition* of the existing structure

Application Filed: 7.25.16
45 Day Expiration: 9.8.16

Items 1 and 2 to be discussed concurrently

- 2. PHAP16-00021:** 46 Ysleta, Tr 10-C-2, City of El Paso, El Paso County, Texas
Location: 9129 Valdiviez Street
Historic District: Ysleta
Property Owner: Imelda and Carlos Christensen
Representative: Sotero Ramirez
Representative District: 6
Existing Zoning: R-4/H (Residential/Historic)
Year Built: 1943
Historic Status: Non-Contributing
Request: Certificate of Appropriateness for the *construction* of a one-story dwelling

Application Filed: 7.25.16
45 Day Expiration: 9.8.16

Ms. Velázquez gave a presentation and explained the property owners are requesting Certificate of Demolition for the *demolition* of the existing structure and Certificate of Appropriateness for the *construction* of a one-story dwelling.



Mayor
Oscar Leeser

City Council

District 1
Peter Svarzbein

District 2
Jim Tolbert

District 3
Emma Acosta

District 4
Carl L. Robinson

District 5
Dr. Michiel R. Noe

District 6
Claudia Ordaz

District 7
Lily Limón

District 8
Cortney C. Niland

City Manager
Tommy Gonzalez

Ms. Velázquez gave background information regarding the structure and read the following letter from Rey Engineering, Inc. into the record.

Chairman Helm and Commissioners Lopez, Daniel Carey-Whalen and Joseph Longo made comments and asked questions.

Ms. Velázquez and Mr. Sotero Ramirez, Community & Human Development, Housing Construction Specialist, responded to comments and questions from commissioners.

Chairman Helm asked if there was anyone from the neighborhood who wished to speak concerning this item. There were no responses.

Chairman Helm asked commissioners if they had any comments and/or questions for property owner and/or representative. No response from commissioners.

MOTION:

Motion made by Chairman Helm, seconded by Commissioner Stapler ***AND UNANIMOUSLY CARRIED TO APPROVE THE CERTIFICATE OF DEMOLITION AND REQUEST THAT MR. RAMIREZ RETURN FOR AN APPROVAL ON THE CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS FOR NEW CONSTRUCTIONS WITH SOME REQUESTED REVISIONS:***

- 1. CHANGING THE GABLE ROOF TO SINGLE, LOW-SLOPED FLAT ROOF, TO THE BACK, WITH A PARAPET FACING THE STREET;***
- 2. REMOVING THE DIVISIONS WITHIN THE WINDOWS, MAKING THEM SIMPLE ONE-OVER-ONE;***
- 3. RAISE THE FINISH FLOOR, PER THE FINAL DESIGN, ABOVE THE FLOOD PLAIN; AND***
- 4. DESIGN OF THE PORCH BE SIMPLIFIED TO SOMETHING CONSISTENT WITH THE HISTORIC HOUSES IN THE NEIGHBORHOOD; FLAT ROOF OR FLAT ROOF WITH PARAPET.***



Mayor
Oscar Leeser

City Council

District 1
Peter Svarzbein

District 2
Jim Tolbert

District 3
Emma Acosta

District 4
Carl L. Robinson

District 5
Dr. Michiel R. Noe

District 6
Claudia Ordaz

District 7
Lily Limón

District 8
Cortney C. Niland

City Manager
Tommy Gonzalez

The following item was withdrawn. (see Changes to the Agenda)

3. **PHAP16-00024:** 5 Satterwaite, 24 to 26, City of El Paso, El Paso County, Texas
- Location: 220 W. Yandell Drive
Historic District: Sunset Heights
Property Owner: PilaP LLC
Representative: Stefanie Uribarri
Representative District: 9
Existing Zoning: A-3 (Apartment/Historic)
Year Built: 1949
Historic Status: Contributing
Request: Certificate of Appropriateness for the installation of a mural on the secondary façade
- Application Filed: 08.23.16
45 Day Expiration: 10.7.16
4. **PHAP16-00025:** 30 Manhattan Heights Lot 3, City of El Paso, El Paso County, Texas
- Location: 2816 Copper Avenue
Historic District: Manhattan Heights
Property Owner: Sara Priddy
Representative: Sara Priddy
Representative District: 2
Existing Zoning: R-3/H (Residential/Historic)
Year Built: 1918
Historic Status: Contributing
Request: Certificate of Appropriateness for re-roofing with metal panels in "Galvalume Plus."
- Application Filed: 9.19.16
45 Day Expiration: 11.3.16

Ms. Velázquez, Historic Preservation Officer, gave a presentation and explained the property owner is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for re-roofing with metal panels in "Galvalume Plus."



Mayor
Oscar Leeser

City Council

District 1
Peter Svarzbein

District 2
Jim Tolbert

District 3
Emma Acosta

District 4
Carl L. Robinson

District 5
Dr. Michiel R. Noe

District 6
Claudia Ordaz

District 7
Lily Limón

District 8
Cortney C. Niland

City Manager
Tommy Gonzalez

Chairman Helm and Commissioners Lopez, Daniel Carey-Whalen, Charles Stapler and Joseph Longo commented and asked questions.

Ms. Velázquez responded to comments and questions from commissioners. She also read into the record a letter from a representative of the Manhattan Heights Neighborhood Association. The representative concurs with recommendations by Ms. Velázquez, Historic Preservation Officer.

The Historic Preservation Office recommends DENIAL of the proposed scope of work based on the following recommendations:

The Design Guidelines for El Paso’s Historic Districts, Sites and Properties recommend the following:

- The distinctive features of each roof type should be retained as they are character-defining elements.
- If a roof requires repair, the replacement materials must match the original or existing materials as closely as possible. Do not change the style or construction of the roof.

The Secretary of the Interior’s Standards for Rehabilitation recommend the following:

- The historic character of the property will be retained and preserved.
- Exterior alterations will not destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property.

Ms. Sara Priddy, property owner, made remarks and responded to comments and questions from commissioners.

Chairman Helm asked if there was anyone from the neighborhood who wished to speak concerning this item. There were no responses.

Chairman Helm asked commissioners if they had any comments and/or questions for property owner and/or representative. No response from commissioners.

MOTION:

Motion made by Chairman Helm, seconded by Commissioner Stapler **AND UNANIMOUSLY CARRIED TO APPROVE WITH MODIFICATIONS:**

ALLOW A ROOF IN A FIVE-V CRIMP PROFILE, OR A METAL SHINGLE, IN THE COLOR PROPOSED OR IN A COLOR CONSISTENT WITH THE ROOF CURRENTLY.

NAY: Commissioner Carey-Whalen



Mayor
Oscar Leeser

City Council

District 1
Peter Svarzbein

District 2
Jim Tolbert

District 3
Emma Acosta

District 4
Carl L. Robinson

District 5
Dr. Michiel R. Noe

District 6
Claudia Ordaz

District 7
Lily Limón

District 8
Cortney C. Niland

City Manager
Tommy Gonzalez

- Addresses of property HLC commissioners have requested that HLC staff review or investigate and provide a report to the HLC. If no addresses are submitted in advance and listed under this agenda item, commissioners may announce such addresses under this agenda item. Discussion on property announced at this meeting will take place during the next regularly scheduled meeting. September 26, 2016 deadline for HLC members to request for agenda items to be scheduled for the October 10, 2016 meeting. October 10, 2016 deadline for HLC members to request for agenda items to be scheduled for the October 24, 2016 meeting.

No address requests from commissioners.

HLC Staff Report

- Update on Administrative Review Cases since last HLC meeting for the properties listed on the attachment posted with this agenda. (See Attachment "A.")

Ms. Velázquez responded to comments from Chairman Helm regarding the property located at 2139 King James Place.

MOTION:

Motion made by Chairman Helm, seconded by Commissioner Carey-Whalen **AND UNANIMOUSLY CARRIED TO APPROVE STAFF REPORT.**

Other Business – Discussion and Action

- Discussion on revisions to the ordinance (Chapter 20.20).

Ms. Velázquez stated a Special Work Session meeting to discuss revisions to the ordinance, Chapter 20.20, was to be held for Monday, October 10th; however, the Special Work Session meeting agenda was not posted in a timely manner according to Open Meetings Act.

MOTION:

Motion made by Chairman Helm, seconded by Commissioner Longo **AND UNANIMOUSLY CARRIED TO POST A MEETING, MONDAY, OCTOBER 17TH, CITY 3, 801 TEXAS AVENUE, 4:00 P.M.**



Mayor
Oscar Leeser

City Council

District 1
Peter Svarzbein

District 2
Jim Tolbert

District 3
Emma Acosta

District 4
Carl L. Robinson

District 5
Dr. Michiel R. Noe

District 6
Claudia Ordaz

District 7
Lily Limón

District 8
Cortney C. Niland

City Manager
Tommy Gonzalez

8. 1401 Randolph – update and discussion.

Ms. Velázquez updated commissioners regarding the small masonry accessory structure in the rear of the property. The property owner demolished the small masonry accessory structure and constructed a six foot high rock wall. The small masonry accessory structure was demolished without approval or permit. The property owner did come before commissioners for approval of a rock wall *over six foot high*. Commissioners approved, with modification, the request for the rock wall; the modification was that the rock wall be reduced to six feet.

At the same time, the property owner requested commissioners approve the demolition of the masonry accessory structure; however, commissioners denied the certificate of demolition, “for the demolition of a rear yard structure, after-the-fact, the applicant has been asked to return to the Historic Landmark Commission, either the next session or within 30 days, with an estimate in hand to reconstruct the demolished structure in the applicant’s preference either to reconstruct or be fined.”

The applicant did return to the Historic Landmark Commission meeting and stated that he would rather reconstruct the masonry accessory structure that he demolished. He brought with him the estimated cost to reconstruct. Ms. Velázquez presented a copy of the estimated cost to reconstruct to commissioners. She presented the proposed reconstruction plans to commissioners for their review and approval.

She responded to comments and questions from Chairman Helm and Commissioner Lopez.

At this time, Commissioner Daniel Carey-Whalen excused himself from the meeting. He noted he would not be available for the October 10th HLC meeting; however, he would be present for the October 17th Special Work Session.

NO ACTION WAS TAKEN.



Mayor
Oscar Leeser

City Council

District 1
Peter Svarzbein

District 2
Jim Tolbert

District 3
Emma Acosta

District 4
Carl L. Robinson

District 5
Dr. Michiel R. Noe

District 6
Claudia Ordaz

District 7
Lily Limón

District 8
Cortney C. Niland

City Manager
Tommy Gonzalez

9. District 8 vacancy

Ms. Velázquez noted due to the vacancy created by Commissioner Skillern, District 8 City Council Representative Cortney C. Niland appointed ~~Daniel Carey Whalen~~ Kelly Blough. District 1 City Council Representative Peter Svarzbein appointed Daniel Carey-Whalen. She stated there is a vacancy for District 6 City Council Representative Claudia Ordaz and Commissioner Brock’s term will expire in October.

NO ACTION WAS TAKEN.

10. Approval of Regular Meeting Minutes for August 22, 2016.

MOTION:

Motion made by Chairman Helm, seconded by Commissioner Brock **AND UNANIMOUSLY CARRIED TO APPROVE THE REGULAR MEETING MINUTES FOR AUGUST 22, 2016.**

NOT PRESENT FOR THE VOTE: Commissioner Carey-Whalen

11. Approval of Work Session Minutes for August 19, 2016.

MOTION:

Motion made by Chairman Helm, seconded by Commissioner Brock **AND UNANIMOUSLY CARRIED TO APPROVE THE WORK SESSION MINUTES FOR AUGUST 19, 2016.**

NOT PRESENT FOR THE VOTE: Commissioner Carey-Whalen

MOTION:

Motion made by Chairman Helm, seconded by Commissioner Brock and Commissioner Stapler **AND UNANIMOUSLY CARRIED TO ADJOURN THE MEETING AT 5:36 P.M.**