



**EL PASO HISTORIC LANDMARK COMMISSION MINUTES  
JANUARY 6, 2010  
4:00 P.M.**

The El Paso Historic Landmark Commission held a public hearing in the Mayor's Board Room, 10<sup>th</sup> Floor, City Hall Building, January 6, 2010, 4:00 p.m., with the following members present:

**Commission Members Present:**

Joseph Riccillo, Chair  
Hugo Gardea, Vice-Chair  
Rick Suarez  
Joel G. Guzman  
Randy Brock  
Melissa C. Brandrup  
Ricardo D. Gonzalez (4:07)  
Ricardo D. Gonzalez (left meeting at 5:20)  
Elizabeth Leal  
Jim Booher (4:06)

**Others Present:**

Dr. Troy Ainsworth, Historic Preservation Officer  
Tony De La Cruz, Planner  
Cynthia Osborn, Assistant City Attorney

Chair Riccillo called the meeting to order at 4:04 p.m.

**AGENDA**

**I. CALL TO THE PUBLIC – PUBLIC COMMENT**

There was no call to the public.

-----

Chair Riccillo asked Staff if there were any changes to the agenda.

Dr. Ainsworth responded the agenda stands as presented.

**MOTION:**

Motion made by Chair Riccillo, seconded by Commissioner Suarez and unanimously carried **TO APPROVE THE AGENDA AS PRESENTED.**

No further discussion from the Commissioners. The vote was taken.

**AYES:** Commissioners Suarez, Guzman, Brock, Brandrup, Gardea and Leal

**NAYS:** N/A

**NOT PRESENT FOR THE VOTE:** Commissioners Gonzalez and Booher

Motion passed. (6-0)

## II. REGULAR AGENDA – DISCUSSION AND ACTION

### Certificate of Appropriateness

- HPC09-00201** Being the west 103 feet of Lots 1 through 3, Block 125, Government Hill Addition, City of El Paso, El Paso County, Texas  
Location: 1616 Raynolds Street  
Historic District: Austin Terrace  
Property Owner: Priscillia Fo  
Representative: Priscillia Fo  
Representative District: #2  
Existing Zoning: R-4/H (Residential/Historic)  
Year Built: 1938  
Historic Status: Contributing  
Request: Certificate of Appropriateness for a new side and rear addition.  
Application Filed: 12/23/2009  
45 Day Expiration: 02/06/2010

Dr. Ainsworth gave a PowerPoint presentation.

Mr. De La Cruz explained Staff recommends, at the front façade, the applicant install shutters to match the existing shutters; additionally, on the left elevation, Staff requests the applicant install two large windows. He noted materials from the existing garage will be re-utilized to provide the façade bands around the edges and around the new addition on the windows.

Commissioners Booher and Gonzalez arrived during the PowerPoint presentation.

Commissioners discussed the boundary line of the historic district and the setback (from the street), and extension of the property. Additionally, Commissioners discussed the height, elevation, slope, massing and dimensions and ridgeline of the proposed addition. Commissioners also discussed construction materials to include reutilizing the stone from the existing garage for banding around the entire property and/or leave the rear open, fenestration, color of the stucco and siding, and color and type of shingle and windows.

Ms. Priscillia Fo, property owner, responded to questions and/or comments from Commissioners.

Dr. Ainsworth noted, if Commissioners approve, Staff can administratively approve the stucco and shingle.

Chair Riccillo reiterated because the north elevation faces Columbus Street, Commissioners request lap siding on the left elevation on the gable to match the front of the new addition and stone banding along the base to continue around, at least the rear elevation, if not all the way. Finally, Commissioners request the shingles match the new addition and Staff can approve the colors administratively.

Commissioner Guzman questioned differentiating the existing structure from the new addition. There was much discussion amongst Commissioners and Staff.

Commissioners and Staff discussed differentiating the existing structure from the proposed addition.

Chair Riccillo asked if Commissioners had any further questions of Staff or property owner.

Vice-Chair Gardea asked if Staff received any phone calls in favor of or opposition to the application.

Dr. Ainsworth responded there were no phone calls or emails in favor of or opposed to the request.

**1<sup>st</sup> MOTION:**

Motion made by Commissioner Brandrup, seconded by Commissioner Leal **TO APPROVE CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS FOR HPC09-00201 WITH THE FOLLOWING:**

- 1. LAP SIDING ON THE LEFT ELEVATION TO MATCH THE FRONT ELEVATION;**
- 2. SAME BANDING TO CONTINUE AROUND THE ENTIRE PROPERTY TO THE EXISTENT THAT MATERIALS ARE AVAILABLE; AND**
- 3. COLORS TO BE APPROVED ADMINISTRATIVELY**

Prior to the vote, Commissioner Suarez questioned if the siding would be on the right as well.

Commissioner Booher added in lieu of stucco.

**1<sup>ST</sup> MOTION AMENDED:**

Motion made by Commissioner Brandrup, seconded by Commissioner Leal and carried **TO APPROVE CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS FOR HPC09-00201 WITH THE FOLLOWING:**

- 1. LAP SIDING ON ANY GABLE OF THE HOUSE TO MATCH THE FRONT ELEVATION RIGHT AND LEFT ELEVATIONS OF THE HOUSE;**
- 2. SAME BANDING TO CONTINUE AROUND THE ENTIRE PROPERTY TO THE EXISTENT THAT MATERIALS ARE AVAILABLE; AND**
- 3. COLORS TO BE APPROVED ADMINISTRATIVELY**

Chair Riccillo asked if Commissioners had any further questions of Staff or property owner.

Vice-Chair Gardea commented on the addition consuming the original house and suggested extending the roof higher or lower and/or constructing a different roof pitch. Commissioners and Staff discussed the details regarding the proposed roof.

No further discussion from the Commissioners. The vote was taken.

**AYES:** Commissioners Booher, Suarez, Gonzalez, Leal, Brock and Guzman

**NAYS:** Commissioners Gardea and Brandrup

Motion passed. (6-2)

After the vote, Commissioner Brandrup had concerns regarding the roof elevation.

Commissioners and Staff discussed details regarding the roof.

-----

Chair Riccillo read the following into the record:

January 6, 2010 deadline for HLC members to request for agenda items to be scheduled for the January 20, 2010 meeting. January 20, 2010 deadline for HLC members to request for agenda items to be scheduled for the February 3, 2010 meeting.

Commissioner Gonzalez would like Magoffin Villas be continually posted on HLC agendas.

Chair Riccillo requested Alamo Elementary School and subsequent EPISD report be on the next HLC agenda.

2. Addresses of property HLC Commissioners have requested that HLC staff review or investigate and provide a report to the HLC. If no addresses are submitted in advance and listed under this agenda item, Commissioners may announce such addresses under this agenda item. Discussion on property announced at this meeting will take place during the next regularly scheduled meeting. January 6, 2010 deadline for HLC members to request for agenda items to be scheduled for the January 20, 2010 meeting. January 20, 2010 deadline for HLC members to request for agenda items to be scheduled for the February 3, 2010 meeting.

**A. 2731 Portland Avenue**

Dr. Ainsworth read into the record an email he received from Mr. Ray Rutledge, El Paso Preservation Alliance, regarding the status of 2731 Portland Avenue. (copy of email on file)

Chair Riccillo requested the item continue to be posted on future HLC agendas for regular updates.

**B. Alamo Elementary School**

Dr. Ainsworth explained Alamo Elementary School has become the center of interest amongst the public, EPISD, HLC and other entities. He noted Bond monies for the *reconstruction of Alamo Elementary School* were approved in 2005 and until recently there had not been any opposition to the proposed project.

-----

**MOTION:**

Motion made by Commissioner Leal to **MOVE ITEM 6B. DISCUSSION AND ACTION REGARDING PHOTOGRAPHY PROJECT PRIOR TO AGENDA ITEM 3. HLC STAFF REPORTS.**

*Please see discussion on page 7.*

-----

**HLC Staff Reports**

3. **A. Administrative Review Design Guidelines – Protected Interiors**

Dr. Ainsworth requested the item be postponed to the next HLC meeting.

- B. Discussion and training regarding Secretary of Interior Standards**

Dr. Ainsworth requested the item be postponed to the next HLC meeting.

**C. Discussion and action regarding EPISD Board of Trustee letters**

Dr. Ainsworth explained approximately two months ago, letters regarding Alamo Elementary School were mailed to EPISD Board of Trustees at EPISD offices on Boeing. He added Staff has reprinted those letters; however, due to the holidays, the letters were not mailed. Dr. Ainsworth was unaware if a member of the public had received the information she had requested from EPISD, via Open Records Act.

Chair Riccillo suggested Commissioners ask Staff to contact EPISD and request a tour, and possibly take photos, of the school. Following the tour, Staff could report back to Commissioners whether or not there may be structural damage to the building. This would be a good indication whether or not EPISD is willing to work with us; additionally, what steps Commissioners should take to protect the building.

Commissioner Leal asked if Commissioners would like Staff to mail the letters to EPISD Board of Trustee's residences.

**MOTION:**

Motion made by Commissioner Gonzalez, seconded by Commissioner Brandrup and unanimously carried that **STAFF MAIL THE LETTERS TO EPISD BOARD OF TRUSTEE'S RESIDENCES.**

No further discussion from the Commissioners. The vote was taken.

**AYES:** Commissioners Suarez, Guzman, Brock, Brandrup, Gonzalez, Gardea, Leal and Booher

**NAYS:** N/A

Motion passed. (8-0)

**FOR THE RECORD** – Dr. Ainsworth explained, per the Code, Commissioners have the right to raise interest and awareness and support the process in El Paso so long as the Commission does not take any position on behalf of the City.

Commissioner Leal requested Alamo Elementary School be on the next HLC agenda.

Chair Riccillo commented on EPISD officials allowing Staff access to tour the school.

Dr. Ainsworth and Commissioners Leal, Booher, Gonzalez and Brandrup made remarks.

**MOTION:**

Motion made by Commissioner Gonzalez, seconded by Commissioner Brandrup and unanimously carried **THAT THE HISTORIC PRESERVATION OFFICER REQUEST A TOUR/ACCESS OF ALAMO ELEMENTARY SCHOOL FOR THE PURPOSE OF DETERMINING SHAPE, CONDITION, VISUAL EFFECT AND THAT THE HISTORIC PRESERVATION OFFICER REPORT BACK TO THE COMMISSION AT THE NEXT MEETING, THE RESULTS OF THAT REQUEST.**

No further discussion from the Commissioners. The vote was taken.

**AYES:** Commissioners Suarez, Guzman, Brock, Brandrup, Gonzalez, Gardea, Leal and Booher

**NAYS:** N/A

Motion passed. (8-0)

-----

**Development Services Department Report**

4. Discussion and action on recommending an H-Overlay designation for the property located at 200 N. Clark Street.

Mr. De La Cruz gave a PowerPoint presentation and noted the building was built between 1937 and 1939. He read into the record an email from Ms. Quana Childs, Texas Historic Commission, regarding what impact a local designation would have on a State building. (copy of email on file)

Commissioners Booher, Leal, Gardea and Gonzalez commented.

Dr. Ainsworth commented on the Dewitt C. Greer State Highway Building in Austin, Texas and wondered whether the 200 N. Clark Street and Greet building were designed by the same architect. He would contact Ms. Mary Telles-Goines, Texas Department of Transportation, and ask if he could peruse their archives for further information.

No action was taken.

**Visionaries in Preservation Report**

5. A. VIP Manager Presentation

There was no presentation.

- B. Discussion and action regarding VIP issues

Mr. De La Cruz noted the Ordinance will be presented to the City Plan Commission at the January 28<sup>th</sup> meeting. Following their approval, the Ordinance will then be presented to the City Council for approval.

**Other Business**

6. A. Approval of Revised Historic Landmark Commission Meeting Minutes.  
December 21, 2009

Revisions of the December 21, 2009 meeting minutes were distributed to Commissioners. Minutes show Dr. Ainsworth present; however, he was not.

No other corrections were noted.

No further discussion from the Commissioners. The vote was taken.

**MOTION:**

Motion made by Chair Riccillo, seconded by Commissioner Brandrup and unanimously carried  
**TO APPROVE THE REVISED HISTORIC LANDMARK COMMISSIONER MEETING MINUTES FOR DECEMBER 21, 2009.**

**AYES:** Commissioners Suarez, Guzman, Brandrup, Gonzalez, Gardea and Leal

**NAYS:** N/A

**ABSTAIN:** Commissioners Booher and Brock

Motion passed. (6-0)

**B. Discussion and action regarding photography project**

At the December 21<sup>st</sup> HLC meeting Mr. Ben Leal suggested Commissioners solicit public photographers to volunteer their time to take photos of all historic properties, preserving the properties as they are currently, adding historic comments for each of those properties then organizing it all into a book.

Commissioner Leal asked if Commissioners would be interested in pursuing a project of this type. An outline of the Evangelism and Awareness Project was distributed to Commissioners prior to the meeting. (copy of outline on file)

Chair Riccillo and Commissioners Gonzalez, Gardea and Brandrup commented.  
Mr. M. B. Gross, owner, MiCasaTours.com, commented.

Chair Riccillo asked Staff to continue posting the item on future HLC agendas and suggested creating a sub-committee for the proposed project.

Commissioners discussed possibly creating a partnership with the El Paso Preservation Alliance to promote historic preservation and awareness.

Dr. Ainsworth commented and Ms. Osborn provided legal guidance.

Commissioner Gonzalez, speaking as Board President of the El Paso Preservation Alliance, explained the El Paso Preservation Alliance is a non-profit organization and would be happy to assist in any effort to further historic preservation so long as it stays within the law and El Paso Preservation Alliance mandate.

**MOTION:**

Motion made by Chair Riccillo, seconded by Commissioner Leal and unanimously carried  
**THAT COMMISSIONERS DEVELOP A SUB-COMMITTEE AT THE NEXT MEETING TO EXPLORE THE DETAILS AND POSSIBILITIES OF THE PHOTOGRAPHY PROJECT OF HISTORIC DISTRICTS TO PROMOTE HISTORIC AWARENESS.**

No further discussion from the Commissioners. The vote was taken.

**AYES:** Commissioners Suarez, Guzman, Brock, Brandrup, Gonzalez, Gardea, Leal and Booher

**NAYS:** N/A

Motion passed. (8-0)

*Following the vote, Commissioner Gonzalez left the meeting at 5:20 p.m.*

-----

- C. Discussion and action regarding the Texas Historical Commission's statewide preservation plan survey.

Prior to the discussion, Dr. Ainsworth distributed a one-page document regarding the 2010 Comprehensive Statewide Preservation Plan.

Vice-Chair Gardea referred to the document and explained every 10 years the Texas Historical Commission must provide a Statewide Preservation Plan. The Texas Historical Commission has asked Vice-Chair Gardea be a member of the Advisory Council. He urged Commissioners and Staff to go the website address listed in the document and complete the survey; the deadline to complete the survey is January 15, 2010. Additionally, the Texas Historical Commission will be traveling to larger Texas cities to meet with local community members. In conclusion, Vice-Chair Gardea noted the 2002 Preservation Plan is also posted on the webpage.

Dr. Ainsworth will provide Commissioners an electronic copy of the document.

Commissioners and Staff discussed the upcoming Preservation Texas Summit in Austin, Texas.

**ADDITION TO THE AGENDA  
FOR THE EL PASO HISTORIC LANDMARK COMMISSION**

**I. REGULAR AGENDA – DISCUSSION AND ACTION**

- 1. Addresses of property HLC Commissioners have requested that HLC staff review or investigate and provide a report to the HLC. If no addresses are submitted in advance and listed under this agenda item, Commissioners may announce such addresses under this agenda item. Discussion on property announced at this meeting will take place during the next regularly scheduled meeting. January 6, 2010 deadline for HLC members to request for agenda items to be scheduled for the January 20, 2010 meeting. January 20, 2010 deadline for HLC members to request for agenda items to be scheduled for the February 3, 2010 meeting.

Magoffin Villas at 915, 917 and 1001 Magoffin and 1000, 1008 and 1010 Myrtle

There was no discussion.

-----

Prior to adjourning the meeting, Commissioners requested the following be on the January 20, Historic Landmark Commission agenda:

- 1. Update regarding the El Paso Street inventory;
- 2. Segundo Barrio Historic District designation;
- 3. 2010 Historic Landmark Commission meeting schedule; and
- 4. Minimum requirements for Certificate of Appropriateness application.

-----

**MOTION:**

Motion made by Chair Riccillo, seconded by Commissioner Suarez and unanimously carried **TO ADJOURN THE MEETING AT 5:53 P.M.**

No further discussion from the Commissioners. The vote was taken.

**AYES:** Commissioners Suarez, Guzman, Brock, Brandrup, Gardea, Leal and Booher  
**NAYS:** N/A

Motion passed. (6-0)