



**EL PASO HISTORIC LANDMARK COMMISSION MINUTES
AUGUST 23, 2010
4:00 P.M.**

The El Paso Historic Landmark Commission held a public hearing in Council Chambers, 2nd Floor, City Hall Building, August 23, 2010, 4:00 p.m., with the following members present:

Commission Members Present:

Joe Riccillo, Chair
Hugo Gardea, Vice-Chair (5:25 p.m.)
Randy Brock
Ricardo Gonzalez (4:14 p.m.)
Ernesto Villanueva, Jr.
Jim Booher

Others Present:

Tony De La Cruz, Planner
Cynthia Osborn, Assistant City Attorney

Chair Riccillo called the meeting to order at 4:05 p.m.

AGENDA

I. CALL TO THE PUBLIC – PUBLIC COMMENT

There was none.

Chair Riccillo asked Staff if there were any changes to the agenda.

Mr. De La Cruz responded no changes, the agenda stands as presented.

MOTION:

Motion made by Chair Riccillo, seconded by Commissioner Villanueva, Jr. and unanimously carried
TO APPROVE THE AGENDA AS IT STANDS.

No further discussion from the Commissioners. The vote was taken.

AYES: Commissioners Brock, Villanueva, Jr. and Booher

NAYS: N/A

Motion passed. (3-0)

II. REGULAR AGENDA – DISCUSSION AND ACTION

Certificate of Appropriateness

NOTE: Commissioner Gonzalez arrived during the discussion of HPC10-00152.

- | | |
|-----------------------|--|
| 1. HPC10-00152 | Tract 11, Block 49, Ysleta Grant, City of El Paso, El Paso County, Texas |
| Location: | 9180 Socorro Road |
| Historic District: | Mission Trail |
| Property Owner: | Ysleta Del Sur Pueblo |
| Representative: | CEA Group |

Representative District: #6
 Existing Zoning: S-D/H (Special Development/Historic) and S-D (Special Development)
 Year Built: 1962
 Historic Status: Non-Contributing
 Request: Certificate of appropriateness for exterior façade and site improvements and additions to existing structure
 Application Filed: 8/3/2010
 45 Day Expiration: 9/17/2010

Mr. De La Cruz gave a PowerPoint presentation and explained the historic portion of the property for consideration consists of the first 150 feet fronting Socorro Road. The applicants are requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for the exterior façade, site improvements and some additions to the existing structure. The proposed modifications are in keeping with the Mission Trail Historic District Guidelines, Staff recommends approval. The existing parking will be retained; however, will be minimized due to the proposed landscaping. Mr. De La Cruz briefly commented on future developments pertaining to the property.

MOTION:

Motion made by Chair Riccillo, seconded by Commissioner Villanueva, Jr. and unanimously carried to **APPROVE THE CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS FOR THE YSLETA DEL SUR PUEBLO.**

AYES: Commissioners Brock, Villanueva, Jr. and Booher

NAYS: N/A

ABSTAIN: Commissioner Gonzalez

Motion passed (3-0)

- 2. HPC10-00154** Lots 28 and 29 and the south 20 feet of lot 27, Block 3, Sunset Heights Addition, City of El Paso, El Paso County, Texas
- Location: 113 – 119 W. Rio Grande
 Historic District: Sunset Heights
 Property Owner: El Paso Community College
 Representative: Dimensions Architecture
 Representative District: #8
 Existing Zoning: A-3/H (Apartment/Historic)
 Year Built: N/A
 Historic Status: N/A
 Request: Certificate of appropriateness for a new ADA parking lot.
 Application Filed: 8/3/2010
 45 Day Expiration: 9/17/2010

Mr. De La Cruz gave a PowerPoint presentation and explained the applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for the construction of a new ADA parking lot. Mr. De La Cruz responded to questions and/or comments from Commissioners.

Ms. Osborn, Chair Riccillo and Commissioners discussed whether or not a parking lot could be approved for A-3 (Apartment) zoned property and what the purview of the Commission is.

Mr. Al Loya, representing El Paso Community College, responded to questions and/or comments from Commissioners.

No further discussion from the Commission. The vote was taken.

MOTION:

Motion made by Chair Riccillo, seconded by Commissioner Gonzalez and carried **THAT THE CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS BE DENIED BASED ON THE DETRIMENTAL IMPACT ON THE SURROUNDING HISTORIC PROPERTIES AND THE EXISTING ZONING DOES NOT MATCH THE DESIGN THAT WAS SUBMITTED FOR APPROVAL.**

AYES: Commissioners Gonzalez, Booher and Chair Riccillo (to break the tie vote)

NAYS: Commissioners Brock and Villanueva, Jr.

Motion passed (3-2)

NOTE: Vice-Chair Gardea arrived immediately following the vote.

- 3. **HPC10-000162** The West ½ of Lot 14, and all of Lots 15 and 16, and the East ½ of Lot 17, Block 9, Manhattan Heights Addition, City of El Paso, El Paso County, Texas
- Location: 2915 Wheeling Avenue
- Historic District: Manhattan Heights
- Property Owner: Marc Medina
- Representative: Marc Medina
- Representative District: #2
- Existing Zoning: R-3/H (Residential/Historic)
- Year Built: 1928
- Historic Status: Contributing
- Request: Certificate of Appropriateness for the extension of an existing carport
- Application Filed: 8/11/2010
- 45 Day Expiration: 9/25/2010

Mr. De La Cruz gave a PowerPoint presentation and explained the applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for the extension of an existing carport. He explained the survey of the property was a little off; per the survey, the carport is shown towards the front of the home. The applicant will use existing brick for the new relocated carport columns; additionally, the applicant will replicate the existing rafter tail detail around the entire rim of carport. Staff recommends approval of the expansion request based on the submitted plans. The zoning ordinance allows for a side yard encroachment on homes built prior to 1979, the side yard encroachment is three feet into the required side setback, a special exception would not be required.

Chair Riccillo and Commissioner Gonzalez commented on the proposed carport look and location and rock wall.

Chair Riccillo asked if Commissioners had additional questions for Staff or the property owner/representative. No further discussion from Commissioners.

MOTION:

Motion made by Chair Riccillo, seconded by Commissioner Booher and unanimously carried to **APPROVE THE CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS FOR 2915 WHEELING AVENUE.**

AYES: Commissioners Brock, Gonzalez, Gardea, Villanueva, Jr. and Booher

NAYS: N/A

Motion passed. (5-0)

Certificate of Demolition

4. **HPC10-00153** North 129 feet of Lot 7 & North 129 feet of West 17 feet of Lot 8, Block 5, Home Improvement Addition #2, City of El Paso, El Paso County, Texas
- Location: 9040 Mount Carmel
Historic District: Ysleta
Property Owner: Guadalupe and Arturo Trejo
Representative: Conde, Inc.
Representative District: #6
Existing Zoning: R-3/H (Residential/Historic)
Year Built: 1927
Historic Status: Non-Contributing
Request: Certificate of Demolition for the demolition of an existing residence
Application Filed: 8/03/2010
45 Day Expiration: 9/17/2010
60 Day Expiration: 10/02/2010

Mr. De La Cruz gave a PowerPoint presentation and explained the applicants are seeking approval for the demolition of an existing non-contributing residence. He elaborated on the significant deterioration of the structure and explained Certificates of Demolition are generally only granted where a significant threat to public health and safety exists. The property is under a trust and given the structural condition, investment necessary to bring the structure up to code and whether or not the property owners would recuperate that investment, Staff recommends approval of the demolition. Through researching the property, Mr. De La noted, the structure was probably built in the 1930's. There were no letters, phone calls or emails in opposition or in favor of the proposed request. The representative has notified City Council, Neighborhood Association and County Historical Commissions of the proposed demolition. Mr. De La Cruz noted the property has been maintained within the family since its initial construction. A plot plan, prepared by a surveyor, was submitted; however, Staff did not have approval of the property owner and did not enter into the structure. Staff was unsure whether or not the foundation was concrete; however, per the application, the applicant proposed construction of a single-family residence in the future.

Mr. Francisco Campa, Conde, Inc., representing the applicant, was not opposed to allowing Staff access to the interior of the structure to document dimensions, floor plan, etc., for historical purposes. He requested Staff wear a hard hat for safety concerns.

FOR THE RECORD – Chair Riccillo requested the record reflect that there is definitely a safety concern with the property.

Chair Riccillo stated he really hated to see an adobe structure demolished due to neglect. He referred to the Ysleta Historic District Guidelines and stated the guidelines discuss the need to preserve and rehabilitate rather than destroy. He cautioned Commissioners do not want to get into the habit of demolishing historic structures due to neglect.

Chair Riccillo asked if Commissioners had any further comments. There were none.

MOTION:

Motion made by Chair Riccillo, seconded by Commissioner Villanueva, Jr. and unanimously carried to approve the Certificate of Demolition for 9040 Mount Carmel.

AMENDED MOTION:

Motion made by Chair Riccillo, seconded by Commissioner Villanueva, Jr. and unanimously carried **TO APPROVE THE CERTIFICATE OF DEMOLITION FOR 9040 MOUNT CARMEL AND INCLUDE THE SITE VISIT FOR DOCUMENTATION PURPOSES.**

AYES: Commissioners Brock, Gonzalez, Gardea, Villanueva, Jr. and Booher
NAYS: N/A

Motion passed. (5-0)

Prior to the following discussion, Chair Riccillo explained, today was the deadline for Commissioners to submit address requests for HLC Staff to review or investigate and report to Commissioners for the September 13, 2010 HLC meeting. Additionally, September 13th will be the deadline to submit requests for the September 27th HLC meeting.

5. Addresses of property HLC Commissioners have requested that HLC staff review or investigate and provide a report to the HLC. If no addresses are submitted in advance and listed under this agenda item, Commissioners may announce such addresses under this agenda item. Discussion on property announced at this meeting will take place during the next regularly scheduled meeting. August 23, 2010 deadline for HLC members to request agenda items to be scheduled for the September 13, 2010 meeting. September 13, 2010 deadline for HLC members to request agenda items to be scheduled for the September 27, 2010 meeting.

A. Magoffin Villas at 915, 917, 1001 Magoffin Avenue and 1000, 1008, 1010 Myrtle Avenue

Mr. De La Cruz explained permits were issued earlier this month; Staff will provide the permit issuance date to Commissioners at the next HLC meeting. He has seen the landscape plans submitted for review by the landscape reviewer. On those plans was a notation which states *the landscape requirements at the streets had been waived*. Mr. De La Cruz explained the parking landscape requirements were approved by City Council via the Detailed Site Plan; therefore, must be installed per Council's direction. The applicant will be required to remove that notation. At this time, groundbreaking has not occurred.

B. Alamo Elementary School at 500 South Hills Street

Mr. De La Cruz noted he received the signed application from the City Manager this morning. Staff will confer with Legal regarding posting of the rezoning request on the City Council agenda. Initially, Mr. De La Cruz was preparing the drawing to show the portion of the property on which Alamo Elementary School sits; however, per the direction of the Deputy Director of the Planning Division, he has been directed to include the whole property as part of the historic overlay, including the 1954 construction. Should Council approve the H-Overlay designation, any future additions would be in keeping with the existing structure.

C. 2630 Richmond Avenue

Mr. De La Cruz gave a PowerPoint presentation of documentation provided by the new property owners, Mr. and Mrs. Mata. The presentation included the 1921 floor plan drawings of the residence and photographs of the property as it was originally constructed. A meeting between Mr. De La Cruz and the property owners has been scheduled to discuss renovating the interior, per Administrative Review guidelines.

HLC Staff Reports

6. A. Design Guidelines regarding Manhattan Heights and Old San Francisco Historic Districts

At this point, Mr. De La Cruz will finalize the design guidelines and, per Representative Byrd's request, post the design guidelines on the Planning Legislative Review Committee agenda for review and/or comment. Additionally, Mr. De La Cruz will schedule a final meeting with Manhattan Heights Historic District Neighborhood Association for their final review and/or comment of the guidelines. Following those meetings and City Council approval of the Manhattan Heights Historic District guidelines, Mr. De La Cruz will have a template for the Old San Francisco and Austin Terrace Historic District guidelines.

- B.** Update on Administrative Review Cases since last HLC meeting for the properties listed on the attachment posted with this agenda. (See Attachment "A")

Mr. De La Cruz updated Commissioners regarding re-roofing, window replacement, HVAC installation and/or replacement, painting and minor landscaping requests.

There were no comments from Commissioners.

- C.** Discussion and action regarding rezoning the property at 1701 N. Stanton Street with a Historic Overlay.

Mr. De La Cruz explained Staff and Commissioners discussed this property in detail at the last HLC meeting.

Development Services Department Report

- 7.** N/A

Visionaries in Preservation Report

- 8.** VIP Manager Presentation

N/A

- 9.** Discussion and action regarding VIP issues

No changes in status. Mr. De La Cruz noted the City has been conducting interviews for the Historic Preservation Officer position; however, he was unaware of the status. Currently, Mr. De La Cruz is focusing on preparing design guidelines for Manhattan Heights and Old San Francisco Historic Districts and keeping abreast of any rezoning/zoning issues.

- 10.** Update on City Department VIP goals

N/A

Other Business

- 11. A.** Discussion and action regarding the review and approval of the Historic Overlay Rezoning Application.

There was no discussion or action.

- B.** Discussion and action on nomination of new member to Historic Landmark Designation subcommittee.

There was no discussion or action.

- C.** Discussion and action regarding Section 20.20.070 – Historic landmark recognition

For the Commissioners, Mr. De La Cruz received an email from a San Antonio company regarding the cost of duplicating the plaques, approximately \$500.00 per bronze plaque. Staff is researching grant funding opportunities for these plaques. Mr. Bernie Sargeant, County Historical Society, would provide Mr. De La Cruz information regarding historical markers. Commissioners requested Mr. De La Cruz inquire what the cost would be for brass and aluminum plaques.

Commissioner Gonzalez recommended Staff contact Mr. Gary Williams, El Paso Community Foundation, regarding historical marker information. Staff will contact Mr. Williams.

D. Discussion and action regarding NCO (Neighborhood Conservancy Overlay)

Mr. De La Cruz gave a PowerPoint presentation regarding the Rim-University NCO Guidelines. The perspective of the neighborhood was to preserve and conserve the integrity of the Kern Place area. Any scope of work that requires a building permit or modifications to the exterior is reviewed by the City Review Committee.

The City Review Committee is comprised of three Staff members – the planning director representative, a representative from Building Permits & Inspections and a designee of the Historic Preservation Officer. The current designee of the Historic Preservation Officer is Mr. Philip Etiwe, Planning Division, Development Review Manager. Interestingly, the NCO guidelines address modifications to the exterior – landscape, painting – per the design guidelines and standards. Design guidelines are recommendations, which do not have to be adhered to. Design Standards are mandatory requirements.

As far as demolition, other than the City Review Committee, there is no other level of protection. The City Review Committee will hear the proposed demolition case; however, demolition requirements are not stringent. Any item placed on the City Review Committee agenda requires notification to property owners within 300 square feet, as well as, the Rim-University Area Neighborhood Association. Additionally, there is an appeal process for demolition cases.

Due to time constraints, Chair Riccillo requested the item be posted on the September 13th Historic Landmark Commission agenda.

**E. Approval of Historic Landmark Commission Meeting Minutes.
August 9, 2010**

Chair Riccillo asked if Commissioners had any additions/corrections/revisions.

CORRECTION, Page 8, Third Paragraph

Commissioner Gonzalez revised the sentence:

From - *“Regarding National Register Historic Districts, Vice-Chair Gardea was concerned with recipients purchasing a plaque; yet they are not a part of the Historic Landmark Commission ...”*

To - *...” they are not part of an H-Overlay Designation ...”*

MOTION:

Motion made by Chair Riccillo, seconded by Commissioner Villanueva, Jr. and unanimously carried **TO APPROVE THE AUGUST 9, 2010 MEETING MINUTES WITH THE CAVEAT THAT THE THIRD PARAGRAPH ON PAGE EIGHT “PART OF THE HISTORIC LANDMARK COMMISSION” BE REPLACED WITH “PART OF AN H-OVERLAY DESIGNATION”.**

No further discussion from the Commissioners. The vote was taken.

AYES: Commissioners Gardea, Gonzalez, Brock and Villanueva, Jr.

NAYS: N/A

ABSTAIN: Commissioner Booher

Motion passed. (4-0)

No further business.

MOTION:

Motion made by Chair Riccillo, seconded by Commissioner Brock and unanimously carried **TO ADJOURN THE HISTORIC LANDMARK COMMISSION MEETING AT 6:08 P.M.**

No further discussion from the Commissioners. The vote was taken.

AYES: Commissioners Brock, Gonzalez, Gardea, Villanueva, Jr. and Booher

NAYS: N/A

Motion passed. (5-0)