

**CITY OF EL PASO, TEXAS**  
**AGENDA ITEM**  
**DEPARTMENT HEAD'S SUMMARY FORM**

**DEPARTMENT:** Human Resources

**AGENDA DATE:** March 13, 2012

**CONTACT PERSON/PHONE:** Linda Thomas, Human Resources Director, 541-4102  
Bruce D. Collins, Purchasing Manager, (915) 541-4313

**DISTRICT(S) AFFECTED:** All

**SUBJECT:**

Solicitation No. 2012-0649R, Fully Insured Retiree Group Medical and Prescription Drug Plan; Fully Insured Group Medicare Advantage Plans; Fully Insured Medicare Supplement Plan F Plans, Fully Insured Medicare Part D Plans

Discussion and action that the Purchasing Manager, Financial Services, Purchasing Division, be authorized to issue a Purchase Order(s) to Aetna Life Insurance Company and Medco Health Solutions Inc. the most responsive and responsible bidder meeting specifications, for the award of a two year contract with two, 1 year options, for Medical and Pharmacy coverage effective July 1, 2012 for retirees as follows:

- Aetna Life Insurance Company in the estimated amount of \$5,456,886.96 annually for fully insured medical and pharmacy benefits for retirees less than 65 years of age.
- Aetna Life Insurance Company for fully insured group Medicare Advantage Plan for retirees over 65 years of age.
- Medco Health Solutions Inc. for fully insured Medicare Part D Plan in the estimated amount of \$1,673,590.08 annually for pharmacy benefits for retirees over 65 years of age.

The initial two year total estimated award is \$14,260,954.08.

**BACKGROUND / DISCUSSION:**

This RFP #2012-064R was released in October 2011 with a closing date of November 16, 2011. A listing of the vendors that submitted proposals under each different coverage is attached. An evaluation committee comprised of active employees members and a retiree member met to evaluate the proposals received. Ratings were compiled and a best and final round was conducted with the top four vendors in February 2012. The entire process was conducted in accordance with Purchasing Policies and Procedures. Crest Benefits Consulting provided consulting services during this process.

In the under 65 retiree category, fully insured proposals were received from Aetna and Public Employee Benefits Alliance (PEBA). Aetna received the highest committee score of 85.87. The Aetna proposal includes fully insured pharmacy benefit coverage. The Aetna proposal matched the current benefits offered to these retirees. The PEBA proposals offered significant benefit reductions compared to current benefits offered to these retirees. The Aetna rates reflect a 3%-5% increase in rates for the under 65 retirees. The annual savings to the City would be \$198,942.00; the additional cost to the retirees would be \$143,847 due to the increase in premium. There are 350 retirees that are under 65 years of age. As presented during the budget hearing in July 2011, this group of retirees will see an increase in the self-insured rates of 22% to 44% if the City decides to keep this group self-insured. Aetna's proposal includes a rate increase cap of no greater than 13.5% on January 1, 2013, significantly less than the rates that would be effective under the City's self-funded plans.

In the fully insured medical and pharmacy coverages for retirees over 65, proposals were received from Aetna, Extend Health, Inc., PEBA, United Health Insurance Company, Humana, and Medco for Medicare

Advantage Plans, Medicare Supplements Plans F and K, and Medicare Part D Pharmacy coverage. All combinations of Medicare Advantage Plans mixed and matched with Medicare Part D Plans as well as all Medicare Supplement Plans with Medicare Part D Plans were considered by the evaluation committee. After considering all of the different combinations, the committee's recommendation to combine the Aetna Medicare Advantage Plan with the Medco Medicare Part D plan received the highest committee score of 98.30. The Aetna Medicare Advantage Plan has zero cost to the retiree and the City. The cost for the pharmacy coverage thru Medco results in a 40% reduction in the City's contribution for this retiree population and a 40% to 49% reduction in the contributions for the retirees. The annual savings to the City would be \$1.2M; the annual savings to the retirees would be \$ 982,828.00. The Medicare benefits will remain the same. There are 596 over age 65 retirees. As presented during the budget hearing in July 2011, this group of retirees would see an increase in the self-insured rates of 22% to 44% if the City decides to keep this group self-insured. The Medicare medical benefits will remain the same as the current Buy Up Plan, resulting in an increase in benefits for any retirees formerly under the Basic Plan.

In both groups of retirees the deductibles, coinsurance and out-of-pocket costs will roll over into the Aetna fully insured plans. The committee believes that awarding to Aetna would also be a smoother transition for the retirees.

**SELECTION SUMMARY:**

Fifty two (52) vendors were solicited for this RFP. This included eighteen (18) local vendors. Six (6) RFP responses were received for which Aetna Life Insurance Company and Medco Health Solutions Inc. is recommended for award as indicated above.

**PRIOR COUNCIL ACTION:**

None

**AMOUNT AND SOURCE OF FUNDING:**

Department: Human Resources  
Amount: \$14,260,954.08 (2 years)  
Funds Available: Medical Coverage: Dept # 09100248 – Acct # 502111 – Fund # 45121  
Pharmacy Coverage: Dept # 09100248 – Acct # 502138 – Fund # 45121  
Funds Source: Health Benefit Fund

**BOARD / COMMISSION ACTION:**

N/A

---

\*\*\*\*\*AUTHORIZATION\*\*\*\*\*

**DEPARTMENT HEAD:**

---

Linda Ball Thomas, Director, Human Resources

**COUNCIL PROJECT FORM  
(RFP OR RFQ)**

\*\*\*\*\***POSTING LANGUAGE BELOW**\*\*\*\*\*

Please place the following item on the **REGULAR** agenda for the Council Meeting of **MARCH 13, 2012**.

Discussion and action on the award of Solicitation No. 2012-064R Fully Insured Retiree Group Medical and Prescription Drug Plan; Fully Insured Group Medicare Advantage Plans; Fully Insured Medicare Supplement Plan F Plans, Fully Insured Medicare Part D Plans to Aetna Life Insurance Company for fully insured medical and pharmacy benefits for retirees less than 65 years of age (Part 1) and for fully insured group Medicare Advantage Plan for retirees over 65 years of age (Part 2), and Medco Health Solutions Inc. for fully insured Medicare Part D Plan for retirees over 65 years of age (Part 4) for a total estimated award of \$14,260,954.08.

Department:	Human Resources
Award to: (Vendor#1)	Aetna Life Insurance Company Hartford, CT
Item(s):	Part 1 and Part 2
Option:	Two, 1 Year options
Payment Terms:	Net 30
Annual Estimated Amount:	\$5,456,886.96
Total Estimated Award:	\$10,913,773.92 (2 years)
Award to: (Vendor #2)	Medco Health Solutions Inc. Franklin Lake, NJ
Item(s):	Part 4
Option:	Two, 1 Year options
Payment Terms:	Net 30
Annual Estimated Amount:	\$1,673,590.08
Total Estimated Award:	\$3,347,180.16 (2 years)
Total Estimated Award:	\$14,260,954.08 (2 years)
Account No.:	09100248 – 502111 – 45121 09100248 – 502138 – 45121
Funding Source:	Health Benefit Fund
District(s):	All

This is an RFP, services contract.

The Financial Services - Purchasing Division and Human Resources recommend award as indicated to Aetna Life Insurance Company and Medco Health Solutions Inc., the highest ranked proposers based on evaluation factors established for this procurement.

\*\*\*\*\***ADDITIONAL INFO BELOW**\*\*\*\*\*

Part 3, Fully Insured Medicare Supplement Plan F Plans, was not awarded.

RATER SCORE SHEET - PRE 65 OFFERS ONLY  
Request for Proposals

SOLICITATION TITLE: FULLY INSURED RETIREE GROUP MEDICAL AND PRESCRIPTION DRUG PLAN; FULLY INSURED GROUP MEDICARE ADVANTAGE PLANS;  
SOLICITATION NO: 2012-064R

All Raters

	Aetna Life Insurance Company	Public Employee Benefits Alliance (TML Intergovernmental Employee Benefits Pool)	Public Employee Benefits Alliance (TML Intergovernmental Employee Benefits Pool)	Public Employee Benefits Alliance (TML Intergovernmental Employee Benefits Pool)	Public Employee Benefits Alliance (TML Intergovernmental Employee Benefits Pool)	
	Hartford, CT	Platinum Austin, TX	Gold Austin, TX	Silver Austin, TX	Bronze Austin, TX	Average
<b>Fee Proposal:</b>						
40 (# points max)	27.67	30.29	32.77	35.55	40.00	33.26
Total Annual Cost	\$ 5,456,586.96	\$ 4,984,545.84	\$ 4,607,330.64	\$ 4,247,621.88	\$ 3,774,815.76	
City Annual Cost	\$ 2,792,105.64	\$ 2,691,652.08	\$ 2,487,961.92	\$ 2,293,719.12	\$ 2,038,411.20	
Retiree Annual Cost	\$ 2,664,481.32	\$ 2,292,893.76	\$ 2,119,368.72	\$ 1,953,902.76	\$ 1,736,404.56	
Provide detailed information on cost submitted and performance guarantees offered						
<b>Technical Solution:</b>						
35 (# points max)	34.20	23.00	19.20	16.00	13.20	21.12
<b>Quality of Response to Specification:</b>						
15 (# points max)	13.60	0.60	0.60	0.60	0.60	3.20
<b>Financial Stability:</b>						
10 (# points max)	10.40	0.80	2.00	0.80	0.80	2.96
<b>GRAND TOTAL</b>	<b>85.87</b>	<b>54.69</b>	<b>54.57</b>	<b>52.95</b>	<b>54.60</b>	<b>60.54</b>
(Maximum 100 points)						

**RATER SCORE SHEET - MEDICARE ADVANTAGE  
MEDICAL PLANS WITH PART D OFFERS**  
Request for Proposals

SOLICITATION TITLE: FULLY INSURED RETIREE GROUP MEDICAL AND PRESCRIPTION DRUG PLAN; FULLY INSURED GROUP MEDICARE ADVANTAGE PLANS;  
SOLICITATION NO: 2012-064R

All Raters

	Aetna Life Insurance Company Hartford, CT Aetna Aetna	Aetna Life Insurance Company Hartford, CT Aetna Medco	Aetna Life Insurance Company Hartford, CT Aetna PEBA	Aetna Life Insurance Company Hartford, CT Aetna UHC 1	Aetna Life Insurance Company Hartford, CT Aetna UHC 2
<b>Medicare Advantage Company Part D Company</b>					
<b>Fee Proposal:</b>					
<b>40 (# points max)</b>	<b>38.59</b>	<b>39.70</b>	<b>40.00</b>	<b>27.80</b>	<b>30.89</b>
<b>Total Annual Cost</b>	<b>\$ 1,721,575.68</b>	<b>\$ 1,673,590.08</b>	<b>\$ 1,660,947.72</b>	<b>\$ 2,389,590.60</b>	<b>\$ 2,150,585.40</b>
<b>City Annual Cost</b>	<b>\$ 929,628.72</b>	<b>\$ 836,795.04</b>	<b>\$ 896,869.32</b>	<b>\$ 1,194,841.44</b>	<b>\$ 1,075,338.84</b>
<b>Retiree Annual Cost</b>	<b>\$ 791,946.96</b>	<b>\$ 836,795.04</b>	<b>\$ 764,078.40</b>	<b>\$ 1,194,749.16</b>	<b>\$ 1,075,246.56</b>
Provide detailed information on cost submitted and performance guarantees offered					
<b>Technical Solution:</b>					
<b>35 (# points max)</b>	<b>33.20</b>	<b>34.60</b>	<b>18.80</b>	<b>28.00</b>	<b>24.20</b>
<b>Quality of Response to Specification:</b>					
<b>15 (# points max)</b>	<b>14.80</b>	<b>15.00</b>	<b>13.20</b>	<b>14.80</b>	<b>14.80</b>
<b>Financial Stability:</b>					
<b>10 (# points max)</b>	<b>9.40</b>	<b>9.00</b>	<b>8.40</b>	<b>9.40</b>	<b>9.40</b>
<b>GRAND TOTAL</b>	<b>95.99</b>	<b>98.30</b>	<b>80.40</b>	<b>80.00</b>	<b>79.29</b>
<b>(Maximum 100 points)</b>					

**RATER SCORE SHEET - MEDICARE ADVANTAGE  
MEDICAL PLANS WITH PART D OFFERS**

Request for Proposals

SOLICITATION TITLE: FULLY INSURED RETIREE GROUP MEDICAL AND F  
SOLICITATION NO: 2012-064R

Page 1 of 2

All Raters

	Extend Health, Inc. San Mateo, CA	Humana Insurance Company San Antonio, TX Humana Humana	UnitedHealth Insurance Company Hartford, CT UHC UHC 1	UnitedHealth Insurance Company Hartford, CT UHC UHC 2	UnitedHealth Insurance Company Hartford, CT UHC Aetna
<b>Medicare Advantage Company</b> <b>Part D Company</b>					
<b>Fee Proposal:</b>					
<b>40 (# points max)</b>		40.68	22.97	25.37	27.42
<b>Total Annual Cost</b>		\$ 1,633,356.00	\$ 2,892,978.00	\$ 2,618,445.00	\$ 2,422,903.68
<b>City Annual Cost</b>		\$ 816,678.00	\$ 1,446,489.00	\$ 1,309,268.64	\$ 1,211,451.84
<b>Retiree Annual Cost</b>		\$ 816,678.00	\$ 1,446,489.00	\$ 1,309,176.36	\$ 1,211,451.84
Provide detailed information on cost submitted and performance guarantees offered					
<b>Technical Solution:</b>					
<b>35 (# points max)</b>	0.40	31.00	25.80	23.40	28.80
<b>Quality of Response to Specification:</b>					
<b>15 (# points max)</b>	0.40	8.80	8.20	8.40	8.60
<b>Financial Stability:</b>					
<b>10 (# points max)</b>	1.20	6.40	6.20	6.40	6.40
<b>GRAND TOTAL</b>	<b>2.00</b>	<b>86.88</b>	<b>63.17</b>	<b>63.57</b>	<b>71.22</b>
<b>(Maximum 100 points)</b>					

**RATER SCORE SHEET - MEDICARE ADVANTAGE  
MEDICAL PLANS WITH PART D OFFERS**

Request for Proposals

SOLICITATION TITLE: FULLY INSURED RETIREE GROUP MEDICAL AND F  
SOLICITATION NO: 2012-064R

Page 2 of 2

All Raters

	UnitedHealth Insurance Company Hartford, CT UHC Medco	UnitedHealth Insurance Company Hartford, CT UHC PEBA	Averages
Medicare Advantage Company Part D Company			
<b>Fee Proposal:</b>			
<b>40 (# points max)</b>	<b>27.97</b>	<b>28.12</b>	<b>31.77</b>
Total Annual Cost	\$ 2,374,918.08	\$ 2,362,275.72	
City Annual Cost	\$ 1,187,459.04	\$ 1,181,184.00	
Retiree Annual Cost	\$ 1,187,459.04	\$ 1,181,091.72	
Provide detailed information on cost submitted and performance guarantees offered			
<b>Technical Solution:</b>			
<b>35 (# points max)</b>	<b>28.80</b>	<b>19.40</b>	<b>24.70</b>
<b>Quality of Response to Specification:</b>			
<b>15 (# points max)</b>	<b>8.80</b>	<b>6.80</b>	<b>10.22</b>
<b>Financial Stability:</b>			
<b>10 (# points max)</b>	<b>6.20</b>	<b>5.80</b>	<b>7.02</b>
<b>GRAND TOTAL</b>	<b>71.77</b>	<b>60.12</b>	<b>71.06</b>
<b>(Maximum 100 points)</b>			

RATER SCORE SHEET - MEDICARE ADVANTAGE  
 MEDICAL STAND ALONE OFFERS ONLY  
 Request for Proposals

SOLICITATION TITLE: FULLY INSURED RETIREE GROUP MEDICAL AND PRESCRIPTION DRUG PLAN; FULLY INSURED GROUP MEDICARE ADVANTAGE PLANS;  
 SOLICITATION NO: 2012-064R

All Raters

	Aetna Life Insurance Company Hartford, CT	Extend Health, Inc. San Mateo, CA	UnitedHealth Insurance Company Hartford, CT		Average
<b>Fee Proposal:</b>					
40 (# points max)	40.00	40.00	0.00		26.67
Total Annual Cost	\$ -		\$ 701,328.00		
City Annual Cost	\$ -		\$ 385,730.40		
Retiree Annual Cost	\$ -		\$ 315,597.60		
Provide detailed information on cost submitted and performance guarantees offered					
<b>Technical Solution:</b>					
35 (# points max)	25.60	4.00	27.00		18.87
<b>Quality of Response to Specification:</b>					
15 (# points max)	11.00	0.40	12.00		7.80
<b>Financial Stability:</b>					
10 (# points max)	9.40	0.20	7.60		5.73
<b>GRAND TOTAL</b> (Maximum 100 points)	86.00	44.60	46.60		59.07

RATER SCORE SHEET - MEDICARE SUPPLEMENT  
STAND ALONE OFFERS ONLY

Request for Proposals

SOLICITATION TITLE: FULLY INSURED RETIREE GROUP MEDICAL AND PRESCRIPTION DRUG PLAN; FULLY INSURED GROUP MEDICARE ADVANTAGE PLANS;

SOLICITATION NO: 2012-064R

All Raters

	Aetna Life Insurance Company	Extend Health, Inc.	Medco (United American)	Public Employee Benefits Alliance (TML Intergovernmental Employee Benefits Pool)	Public Employee Benefits Alliance (TML Intergovernmental Employee Benefits Pool)	UnitedHealth Insurance Company	Average
	Hartford, CT Plan F	San Mateo, CA	Franklin Lake, NJ Plan F	Austin, TX Plan F	Austin, TX Plan K	Hartford, CT Plan K	
<b>Fee Proposal:</b>							
40 (# points max)	32.05	0.00	24.64	22.86	40.00	35.06	26.77
Total Annual Cost	\$ 1,259,437.44		\$ 1,637,970.00	\$ 1,765,870.08	\$ 1,008,989.52	\$ 1,151,008.44	
City Annual Cost	\$ 680,103.60		\$ 818,985.00	\$ 953,529.24	\$ 544,821.12	\$ 633,040.80	
Retiree Annual Cost	\$ 579,333.84		\$ 818,985.00	\$ 812,340.84	\$ 464,168.40	\$ 517,967.64	
Provide detailed information on cost submitted and performance guarantees offered							
<b>Technical Solution:</b>							
35 (# points max)	32.40	5.00	30.20	8.00	7.00	16.00	16.43
<b>Quality of Response to Specification:</b>							
15 (# points max)	13.60	0.40	12.40	1.20	0.80	8.80	6.20
<b>Financial Stability:</b>							
10 (# points max)	9.40	0.20	7.00	3.00	1.00	6.00	4.43
<b>GRAND TOTAL</b> (Maximum 100 points)	87.45	5.60	74.24	35.06	48.80	65.86	52.83

RATER SCORE SHEET - PHARMACY PART D STAND ALONE OFFERS ONLY

Request for Proposals

SOLICITATION TITLE: FULLY INSURED RETIREE GROUP MEDICAL AND PRESCRIPTION DRUG PLAN; FULLY INSURED GROUP MEDICARE ADVANTAGE PLANS;  
 SOLICITATION NO: 2012-064R

All Raters

	Aetna Life Insurance Company	Extend Health, Inc.	Medco Health Solutions, Inc.	Public Employee Benefits Alliance (TML Intergovernmental Employee Benefits Pool)	UnitedHealth Insurance Company	UnitedHealth Insurance Company	
	Hartford, CT	San Mateo, CA	Franklin Lake, NJ	Austin, TX	Hartford, CT Option 1	Hartford, CT Option 2	Averages
<b>Fee Proposal:</b>							
<b>40 (# points max)</b>	38.59	0.00	39.70	40.00	27.80	30.89	29.50
<b>Total Annual Cost</b>	\$ 1,721,575.68		\$ 1,673,590.08	\$ 1,660,947.72	\$ 2,389,590.60	\$ 2,150,585.40	
<b>City Annual Cost</b>	\$ 860,787.84		\$ 836,795.04	\$ 896,869.32	\$ 1,194,841.44	\$ 1,075,338.84	
<b>Retiree Annual Cost</b>	\$ 860,787.84		\$ 836,795.04	\$ 764,078.40	\$ 1,194,749.16	\$ 1,075,246.56	
Provide detailed information on cost submitted and performance guarantees offered							
<b>Technical Solution:</b>							
<b>35 (# points max)</b>	33.00	2.00	34.00	8.00	18.60	17.00	18.77
<b>Quality of Response to Specification:</b>							
<b>15 (# points max)</b>	13.20	0.80	12.60	0.20	8.60	8.60	7.33
<b>Financial Stability:</b>							
<b>10 (# points max)</b>	9.40	1.60	7.00	1.20	4.60	4.60	4.73
<b>GRAND TOTAL</b>	<b>94.19</b>	<b>4.40</b>	<b>93.30</b>	<b>49.40</b>	<b>59.60</b>	<b>61.09</b>	<b>50.33</b>
<b>(Maximum 100 points)</b>							

RATER SCORE SHEET - MEDICARE SUPPLEMENT WITH PART D OFFERS

Request for Proposals

SOLICITATION TITLE: FULLY INSURED RETIREE GROUP MEDICAL AND PRESCRIPTION DRUG PLAN; FULLY INSURED GROUP MEDICARE ADVANTAGE PLANS;  
 SOLICITATION NO: 2012-064R  
 All Raters

Page 1 of 4

	Aetna Life Insurance Company	Aetna Life Insurance Company	Aetna Life Insurance Company	Aetna Life Insurance Company	Aetna Life Insurance Company	Extend Health, Inc.	Medco (United American)
Medicare Supplement Company Part D Company	Hartford, CT Aetna Plan F Aetna	Hartford, CT Aetna Plan F Medco	Hartford, CT Aetna Plan F PEBA	Hartford, CT Aetna Plan F UHC 1	Hartford, CT Aetna Plan F UHC 2	San Mateo, CA	Franklin Lake, NJ Plan F Aetna
<b>Fee Proposal:</b>							
<b>40 (# points max)</b>	35.83	36.41	36.57	29.27	31.32	0.00	31.79
Total Annual Cost	\$ 2,981,013.12	\$ 2,933,027.52	\$ 2,920,385.16	\$ 3,649,028.04	\$ 3,410,022.84	\$ -	\$ 3,359,545.68
City Annual Cost	\$ 1,490,506.56	\$ 1,466,513.76	\$ 1,576,972.92	\$ 1,824,560.16	\$ 1,705,057.56	\$ -	\$ 1,679,772.84
Retiree Annual Cost	\$ 1,490,506.56	\$ 1,466,513.76	\$ 1,343,412.24	\$ 1,824,467.88	\$ 1,704,965.28	\$ -	\$ 1,679,772.84
Provide detailed information on cost submitted and performance guarantees offered							
<b>Technical Solution:</b>							
<b>35 (# points max)</b>	32.60	34.60	25.60	27.00	26.20	0.20	30.20
<b>Quality of Response to Specification:</b>							
<b>15 (# points max)</b>	14.80	14.80	12.40	14.20	14.40	0.20	12.40
<b>Financial Stability:</b>							
<b>10 (# points max)</b>	9.40	8.20	8.20	8.80	8.80	0.40	7.00
<b>GRAND TOTAL (Maximum 100 points)</b>	92.63	94.01	82.77	79.27	80.72	0.80	81.39

**RATER SCORE SHEET - MEDICARE SUPPLEMENT WITH PART D OFFERS**

Request for Proposals

SOLICITATION TITLE: FULLY INSURED RETIREE GROUP MEDICAL AND F  
 SOLICITATION NO: 2012-064R  
 All Raters

	Medco (United American)	Medco (United American)	Medco (United American)	Medco (United American)	Public Employee Benefits Alliance (TML Intergovernmental Employee Benefits Pool)	Public Employee Benefits Alliance (TML Intergovernmental Employee Benefits Pool)	Public Employee Benefits Alliance (TML Intergovernmental Employee Benefits Pool)
Medicare Supplement Company	Franklin Lake, NJ Plan F Medco	Franklin Lake, NJ Plan F PEBA	Franklin Lake, NJ Plan F UHC 1	Franklin Lake, NJ Plan F UHC 2	Austin, TX PEBA Plan F Aetna	Austin, TX PEBA Plan F Medco	Austin, TX PEBA Plan F PEBA
Part D Company							
Fee Proposal:							
40 (# points max)	32.25	32.37	26.52	28.19	30.62	31.05	31.17
Total Annual Cost	\$ 3,311,560.08	\$ 3,298,917.72	\$ 4,027,560.60	\$ 3,788,555.40	\$ 3,487,445.76	\$ 3,439,460.16	\$ 3,426,817.80
City Annual Cost	\$ 1,655,780.04	\$ 1,649,505.00	\$ 2,013,826.44	\$ 1,894,323.84	\$ 1,883,157.96	\$ 1,719,730.08	\$ 1,850,398.56
Retiree Annual Cost	\$ 1,655,780.04	\$ 1,649,412.72	\$ 2,013,734.16	\$ 1,894,231.56	\$ 1,604,287.80	\$ 1,719,730.08	\$ 1,576,419.24
Provide detailed information on cost submitted and performance guarantees offered							
Technical Solution:							
35 (# points max)	30.20	30.20	30.20	30.20	15.60	16.40	16.00
Quality of Response to Specification:							
15 (# points max)	12.40	12.40	12.40	12.40	2.20	2.60	0.80
Financial Stability:							
10 (# points max)	7.00	7.00	7.00	7.00	1.80	1.80	0.80
<b>GRAND TOTAL</b>	<b>81.85</b>	<b>81.97</b>	<b>76.12</b>	<b>77.79</b>	<b>50.22</b>	<b>51.85</b>	<b>48.77</b>
(Maximum 100 points)							

RATER SCORE SHEET - MEDICARE SUPPLEMENT WITH PART D OFFERS

Request for Proposals

SOLICITATION TITLE: FULLY INSURED RETIREE GROUP MEDICAL AND F  
SOLICITATION NO: 2012-064R

All Raters

	Public Employee Benefits Alliance (TML Intergovernmental Employee Benefits Pool)	Public Employee Benefits Alliance (TML Intergovernmental Employee Benefits Pool)	Public Employee Benefits Alliance (TML Intergovernmental Employee Benefits Pool)	Public Employee Benefits Alliance (TML Intergovernmental Employee Benefits Pool)	Public Employee Benefits Alliance (TML Intergovernmental Employee Benefits Pool)	Public Employee Benefits Alliance (TML Intergovernmental Employee Benefits Pool)	Public Employee Benefits Alliance (TML Intergovernmental Employee Benefits Pool)
Medicare Supplement Company Part D Company	Austin, TX PEBA Plan F UHC 1	Austin, TX PEBA Plan F UHC 2	Austin, TX PEBA Plan K Aetna	Austin, TX PEBA Plan K Medco	Austin, TX PEBA Plan K PEBA	Austin, TX PEBA Plan K UHC 1	Austin, TX PEBA Plan K UHC 2
<b>Fee Proposal:</b>							
<b>40 (# points max)</b>	25.70	27.27	39.11	39.81	40.00	31.42	33.80
Total Annual Cost	\$ 4,155,460.68	\$ 3,916,455.48	\$ 2,730,565.20	\$ 2,682,579.60	\$ 2,669,937.24	\$ 3,398,580.12	\$ 3,159,574.92
City Annual Cost	\$ 2,077,776.48	\$ 1,958,273.88	\$ 1,365,282.60	\$ 1,341,289.80	\$ 1,441,690.44	\$ 1,699,336.20	\$ 1,579,833.60
Retiree Annual Cost	\$ 2,077,684.20	\$ 1,958,181.60	\$ 1,365,282.60	\$ 1,341,289.80	\$ 1,228,246.80	\$ 1,699,243.92	\$ 1,579,741.32
Provide detailed information on cost submitted and performance guarantees offered							
<b>Technical Solution:</b>							
<b>35 (# points max)</b>	12.80	13.20	12.00	13.00	11.80	11.20	11.40
<b>Quality of Response to Specification:</b>							
<b>15 (# points max)</b>	0.20	0.40	0.00	2.40	0.00	2.00	2.00
<b>Financial Stability:</b>							
<b>10 (# points max)</b>	1.80	2.00	1.80	1.40	0.60	1.80	1.80
<b>GRAND TOTAL</b>	40.50	42.87	52.91	56.61	52.40	46.42	49.00
<b>(Maximum 100 points)</b>							

RATER SCORE SHEET - MEDICARE SUPPLEMENT WITH PART D OFFERS

Request for Proposals

SOLICITATION TITLE: FULLY INSURED RETIREE GROUP MEDICAL AND F  
 SOLICITATION NO: 2012-064R  
 All Raters

	UnitedHealth Insurance Company	UnitedHealth Insurance Company	UnitedHealth Insurance Company	UnitedHealth Insurance Company	UnitedHealth Insurance Company	Averages
Medicare Supplement Company Part D Company	Hartford, CT UHC Plan K Aetna	Hartford, CT UHC Plan K Medco	Hartford, CT UHC Plan K PEBA	Hartford, CT UHC Plan K UHC 1	Hartford, CT UHC Plan K UHC 2	
<b>Fee Proposal:</b>						
<b>40 (# points max)</b>	37.94	38.60	38.77	30.66	32.92	31.90
Total Annual Cost	\$ 2,815,093.68	\$ 2,767,108.08	\$ 2,754,465.72	\$ 3,483,108.60	\$ 3,244,103.40	
City Annual Cost	\$ 1,407,546.84	\$ 1,383,554.04	\$ 1,377,279.00	\$ 1,741,600.44	\$ 1,622,097.84	
Retiree Annual Cost	\$ 1,407,546.84	\$ 1,383,554.04	\$ 1,377,186.72	\$ 1,741,508.16	\$ 1,622,005.56	
Provide detailed information on cost submitted and performance guarantees offered						
<b>Technical Solution:</b>						
<b>35 (# points max)</b>	14.00	14.00	12.40	13.40	11.20	19.06
<b>Quality of Response to Specification:</b>						
<b>15 (# points max)</b>	6.80	6.60	6.20	6.20	6.60	6.84
<b>Financial Stability:</b>						
<b>10 (# points max)</b>	4.40	4.40	4.00	4.00	4.40	4.46
<b>GRAND TOTAL</b>	<b>63.14</b>	<b>63.60</b>	<b>61.37</b>	<b>54.26</b>	<b>55.12</b>	<b>62.24</b>
<b>(Maximum 100 points)</b>						



# CITY OF EL PASO REQUEST FOR PROPOSAL TABULATION FORM



**Bid Opening Date:** November 16, 2011

**Solicitation #:** 2012-064R

**Project Name:** Fully Insured Retiree Group Medical And Prescription Drug Plan....

**Department:** Human Resources

<b>AETNA LIFE INSURANCE COMPANY</b>	<b>HARTFORD, CT</b>
<b>EXTEND HEALTH, INC.</b>	<b>SAN MATEO, CA</b>
<b>HUMANA INSURANCE COMPANY</b>	<b>SAN ANTONIO, TX</b>
<b>MEDCO HEALTH SOLUTIONS, INC.</b>	<b>FRANKLIN LAKE, NJ</b>
<b>PUBLIC EMPLOYEE BENEFITS ALLIANCE (TML INTERGOVERNMENTAL EMPLOYEE BENEFITS POOL)</b>	<b>AUSTIN, TX</b>
<b>UNITEDHEALTH INSURANCE COMPANY</b>	<b>HARTFORD, CT</b>
<b>RFPs SOLICITED: 52</b>	<b>RFPs RECEIVED: 6</b>
<b>RFPs LOCAL: 18</b>	<b>NO RFPs: 0</b>

**NOTE:** The information contained in this rfp tabulation is for information only and does not constitute actual award/execution of contract.

**APPROVED:**   IsI  

**DATE:**   11/21/11

TEXAS MUNICIPAL LEAGUE  
ATTN: JOANNA BENAVIDEZ  
1821 RUTHERFORD LAND, STE. 300  
AUSTIN, TX 78754

THE HARTFORD, ATTN: JILL COOKE  
7670 S CHESTER ST. 3<sup>RD</sup> FLOOR  
ENGLEWOOD, CO 80112

BBVA COMPASS  
ATTN: JIM VOLK  
690 SUNLAND PARK DRIVE  
EL PASO, TX 79912

HEALTH ADMINSTATION SVS, INC.  
ATTN: GLENN HILLYER  
100 GLENBOROUGH DR., SUITE 450  
HOUSTON, TX 77067-3614

AETNA  
ATTN: LOUIE HEERWAGEN  
2777 STEMMONS FREEWAY, STE 300  
DALLAS, TX 75207-2509

BLUE CROSS BLUE SHIELD TEXAS  
ATTN: DINDEE SOZA  
118 MESA PARK DR.  
EL PASO, TX 79912

EL PASO FIRST GROUP HEALTH  
ATTN: MANUEL MARQUEZ  
2501 N MESA  
EL PASO, TX 79902

ALLSTATE WORKPLACE DIVISION  
ATTN: STACIE HAMPTON  
5525 N MACARTHUR #610  
IRVING, TX 75038

HUMANA-ATTN: JAY CONDRY OR  
TOM SILLIMAN  
8111 LBJ FREEWAY SUITE 200  
DALLAS, TX 75251

ZOE HOLMES-MARSH USA INC.  
4400 BANK ONE CENTER  
1717 MAIN STREET  
DALLAS, TX 75201-7357

AMERICAN INSURNET  
ATTN: CHUCK EBERLE  
644 LINN STREET, SUITE 430  
CINCINNATI, OH 45203

WAGEWORKS, INC.  
1100 PARK PLACE  
SAN MATEO, CA 94403

ATTN: RALPH CAMPBELL  
MCKINLEY FINANCIAL SERVICES  
545 NORTH ANDREWS AVENUE  
FORT LAUDERDALE, FL 33301

COLONIAL SUPPLEMENTAL  
ATTN: SHEILA PETTY  
1201 AVERYT AVENUE  
COLUMBIA, SC 29210

SENIOR DIRECTOR PUBLIC SECTOR  
ATTN: EDMUNDO GAMBOA JR.  
1900 PUEBLO CORONA  
EL PASO, TX 79936

AFLAC  
ATTN: STEVEN TENWICK  
809 CLOUDBURST DRIVE  
EL PASO, TX 79912

COMBINED  
ATTN: CRISTINA M. RODRIGUEZ  
2701 BERT YANCEY  
EL PASO, TX 79936

COMBINED  
P O BOX 370371  
EL PASO, TX 79937

ATTN: IRENE ESTALA  
MARNELL & ASSOCIATES  
702 WYOMING AVENUE  
EL PASO, TX 79902

INTEGRITY EMPLOYEE ASSISTANCE  
ATTN: DEBORAH M. ONTIVEROS  
1600 N LEE TREVINO, SUITE C-7  
EL PASO, TX 79936

AFLAC  
ATTN: LISA A. ALMANZA  
6006 N MESA, SUITE 1009  
EL PASO, TX 79912

STAR ROBBINS & CO.  
ATTN: WALTER KUSIAK  
853 E 4<sup>TH</sup> ST.  
LONDON, KY 40741

ATTN: LISA M. SPREDEMANN  
ING EMPLOYEE BENEFITS  
7720 N. 16<sup>TH</sup> STREET, SUITE 150  
PHOENIX, AZ 85020

ATTN: TINA SAUNDERS  
METLIFE INSURANCE COMPANY  
5400 LBJ FREEWAY  
SUITE 1460, LOCKBOX 30  
DALLAS, TX 75240

MAYNARD & ASSOCIATES  
ATTN: ANNA MAYNARD  
6201 ESCONDIDO, STE. 15A  
EL PASO, TX 79912

JACK CARR, INC.  
1600 N. E. LOOP 410 SUITE 100  
SAN ANTONIO, TX 78209

KYLE GILLS  
1308 RUSTIC TIMBER  
FLOWER MOUND, TX 75028

ATTN: PATRICIA DELANEY  
WM. RIGG CO.  
2001 BRYAN STREET SUITE 800  
DALLAS, TX 75201-3031

ATTN: JEANNE SIMS  
FIRSTIER  
270 OAK TRAIL DRIVE  
DOUBLE OAK, TX 75077

UNITEDHEALTHCARE  
ATTN: JOHN D. BASS  
5959 NORTHWEST PARKWAY STE 107  
SAN ANTONIO, TX 78249

ANNA MAYNARD  
6201 ESCONDIDO SUITE 15A  
EL PASO, TX 79912

HEALTHSMART PREFERRED CARE  
ATTN: RAY HILL  
2002 WEST LOOP 289, SUITE 103  
LUBBOCK, TX 79453

ATTN: BRANDON MILLER  
HAYS COMPANIES  
80 SOUTH 8<sup>TH</sup> STREET #700  
MINNEAPOLIS, MN 55402

ING EMPLOYEE BENEFITS  
ATTN: LISA M. SPREDEMAN  
7720 N 16<sup>TH</sup> STREET, STE. 150  
PHOENIX, AZ 85020

VISUAL ACCENTS OPTICAL BOUTIQUE  
ATTN: ANGIE MOEHLIG  
1220 N OREGON  
EL PASO, TX 79902

PRUDENTIAL  
ATTN: ALAN REX  
8117 PRESTON RD., STE. 600  
DALLAS, TX 75225  
(NOT DELIVERABLE AS ADDRESSED UTF)

SPECTERA  
ATTN: NELSON ARMSTRONG  
1225 N LOOP WEST STE. 900  
HOUSTON, TX 77008  
(NOT DELIVERABLE AS ADDRESSED)  
(UNABLE TO FORWARD)

JEFFERSON PILOT FINANCIAL  
ATTN: KATHRYN PHILLIPS  
9001 AIRPORT FREEWAY, SUITE 600  
NORTH RICHLAND HILLS, TX 76180  
(NOT DELIVERABLE AS ADDRESSED - UTF)

ATTN: SHARON WILLBANKS  
COLONIAL SUPPLEMENTAL INSURANCE  
P.O. BOX 222  
MANSFIELD, TX 76063-0222  
(ATTEMPTED - NOT KNOWN - UTF)

ATTN: LISA A. JUAREZ  
J & G PROCUREMENT SERVICES  
734 S. MESA HILLS, #113  
EL PASO, TX 79912  
(ATTEMPTED - NOT KNOWN - UTF)

THE GUARDIAN  
ATTN: MARK BURNSIDE  
3131 E CAMELBACK ROAD, STE. 135  
PHOENIX, AZ 85016  
(ATTEMPTED - NOT KNOWN - UTF)

HARTFORD LIFE - GROUP SALES  
ATTN: TERRY GAUNT  
17855 DALLAS PARWAY, STE. 100  
DALLAS, TX 75287  
(NOT DELIVERABLE AS ADDRESSED - UTF)

METLIFE  
ATTN: ANGELA HUDGENS  
16301 QUORUM DR., SUITE 120 B  
ADDISON, TX 75001  
(NOT DELIVERABLE AS ADDRESSED -  
WARD SERVICES

TEXAS TRUE CHOICE  
ATTN: ILONA LYDE  
5000 LEGACY DR., SUITE 190  
PLANO, TX 75024  
(NOT DELIVERABLE AS ADDRESSED - UTF)

PLANS FOR LIFE, LLC  
ATTN: JESUS H. BUSTILLOS, FIC  
6044 GATEWAY EAST #450  
EL PASO, TX 79905  
(NOT DELIVERABLE AS ADDRESSED - UTF)

ATTN: SHANE CAMPBELL  
3800 FOREST DRIVE, SUITE B101  
COLUMBIA, SC 29204  
(UNDELIVERABLE AS ADDRESSED)  
(UNABLE TO FORWARD)

UNICARE  
ATTN: CHARLES ANDOLINA  
3820 AMERICAN DRIVE, MS 104  
PLANO, TX 75075  
(NOT DELIVERABLE AS ADDRESSED)  
(UNABLE TO FORWARD)

GREAT WEST  
ATTN: GENE WEDGEWORTH  
120 S BROADWAY STE. #216  
TYLER, TX 75702  
(ATTEMPTED - NOT KNOWN)  
(UNABLE TO FORWARD)

COLONIAL INSURANCE  
ATTN: GEORGE GOMEZ  
10935 BEN CRENSHAW  
EL PASO, TX 79936  
(ATTEMPTED - NOT KNOWN)  
(UNABLE TO FORWARD)

ATTN: SHANE CAMPBELL  
WARD SERVICES  
3800 FOREST DRIVE SUITE B101  
COLUMBIA, SC 29204  
(ATTEMPTED - NOT KNOWN)  
(UNABLE TO FORWARD)

ASSURED BENEFITS ADMINISTRATORS  
ATTN: SUE AUSTIN  
4100 RIO BRAVO, 211  
EL PASO, TX 79902  
(NOT DELIVERABLE AS ADDRESSED UTF)

ACCESS ADMINISTRATORS  
ATTN: DAVID WYSONG  
7100 WESTWIND  
EL PASO, TX 79912  
(NOT DELIVERABLE AS ADDRESSED)