

CITY OF EL PASO, TEXAS
AGENDA ITEM
DEPARTMENT HEAD'S SUMMARY FORM

DEPARTMENT: Human Resources

AGENDA DATE: April 10, 2012

CONTACT PERSON/PHONE: Linda Thomas, Human Resources Director, (15)541-4102
Bruce D. Collins, Purchasing Manager, (915) 541-4313

DISTRICT(S) AFFECTED: All

SUBJECT:

Solicitation No. 2012-031R, Benefit Consulting Services

Discussion and action that the Purchasing Manager, Financial Services, Purchasing Division, be authorized to issue a Purchase Order(s) to John D. Williams Insurance dba JDW Insurance and Hay Group, Inc. effective the date of the award for an initial term of five (5) years with two (2), two-year options to renew at the sole discretion of the City. The initial five year total estimated award is \$534,600.00 specifically, \$210,750.00 to John D. Williams Insurance dba JDW Insurance and \$323,850.00 to Hay Group, Inc. The City will assign benefit consulting projects between the two vendor's dependent upon their respective knowledge base and cost of various projects.

BACKGROUND / DISCUSSION:

This RFP #2012-031R was released in October 2011 with a closing date of November 16, 2011. A listing of the vendors that submitted proposals is attached. An evaluation committee comprised of administrative employees met to evaluate the proposals received. The entire process was conducted in accordance with Purchasing Policies and Procedures.

The committee is recommending John D. Williams Insurance dba JDW Insurance, El Paso, Texas and Hay Group, Inc., Dallas, Texas for this award. The RFP included language allowing the City to award consulting services to more than one vendor and assign the specified tasks as it deems appropriate. John D. Williams Insurance dba JDW Insurance and Hay Group, Inc. received the highest scores of the proposals submitted.

The City has assigned benefit consulting projects between the two vendors since 2007 dependent upon their respective knowledge base and cost of various projects. For example, John D. Williams Insurance dba JDW Insurance (previously Crest Benefits Consulting, Inc., now a dba; Crest Benefits Consulting a Division of JDW Insurance) recently provided consulting services for the recently awarded Fully Insured Retiree Group Medical Plans, Medicare Advantage Plans and Medicare Part D Plans. The Hay Group, Inc. is assisting the City with the development of the upcoming Third Party Administrative Services RFP. Other upcoming projects will include, but are not limited to, health plan rate development, actuarial analysis of the health fund, GASB 45 valuation and report, HIPPA training and updating of manuals and forms, vendor contract renewal negotiations, wellness program evaluation, wellness clinic evaluation and review and compliance with the Patient Protection and Affordable Care Act 2010.

SELECTION SUMMARY:

Twenty Seven (27) vendors were solicited for this RFP. This included four (4) local vendors. Seven (7) RFP responses were received for which John D. Williams Insurance dba JDW Insurance and Hay Group, Inc. is recommended for award as indicated above.

PRIOR COUNCIL ACTION:

Yes, City Council awarded 2007-064R Benefit Consulting Services to the Hay Group, Inc. on April 17, 2007, Item 6B.

AMOUNT AND SOURCE OF FUNDING:

Department: Human Resources
Amount: \$534,600.00 (5 years)
Funds Available: Dept # 09100249 – Acct # 502115 – Fund # 45121
Funds Source: Health Benefit Fund

BOARD / COMMISSION ACTION:

N/A

*****AUTHORIZATION*****

DEPARTMENT HEAD:

Linda Ball Thomas, Director, Human Resources

**COUNCIL PROJECT FORM
(RFP OR RFQ)**

*******POSTING LANGUAGE BELOW*******

Please place the following item on the **REGULAR** agenda for the Council Meeting of **APRIL 10, 2012**.

Discussion and action on the award of Solicitation No. 2012-031R Benefit Consulting Services to John D. Williams Insurance dba JDW Insurance and Hay Group, Inc. for a total estimated award of \$534,600.00.

Department: Human Resources

Award to: (Vendor#1) John D. Williams Insurance dba JDW Insurance
El Paso, TX

Item(s): All
Option: Two, 2 Year options
Payment Terms: Net 30
Annual Estimated Amount: \$42,150.00
Total Estimated Award: \$210,750.00 (5 years)

Award to: (Vendor #2) Hay Group, Inc.
Dallas, TX

Item(s): All
Option: Two, 2 Year options
Payment Terms: Net 30
Annual Estimated Amount: \$64,770.00
Total Estimated Award: \$323,850.00 (5 years)

Total Estimated Award: \$534,600.00 (5 years)
Account No.: 09100249 – 502115 – 45121
Funding Source: Health Benefit Fund
District(s): All

This is an RFP, services contract.

The Financial Services - Purchasing Division and Human Resources recommend award as indicated to John D. Williams Insurance dba JDW Insurance and Hay Group, Inc., the highest ranked proposers based on evaluation factors established for this procurement.

*******ADDITIONAL INFO BELOW*******

COMMITTEE SCORE SHEET
Request for Proposals

SOLICITATION TITLE: BENEFIT CONSULTING SERVICES
SOLICITATION NO: 2012-031R
All Raters

AVERAGES

	Aon Risk Insurance Services West, Inc.	Crest Benefits Consulting A Division of JDW Insurance	Gallagher Benefit Services, Inc.	Hay Group, Inc.	Holmes Murphy & Associates, Inc.	The Segal Company (Western States) Inc.	Wells Fargo Insurance Services USA, Inc.
	Albuquerque, NM	El Paso, TX	Greenwood Village, CO	Dallas, TX	Dallas, TX	Tempe, AZ	El Paso, TX
Proposal Cost:							
30 (# points max)	18.88	19.22	22.13	12.51	30.00	14.52	13.87
Provide detailed information on cost submitted and performance guarantees offered							
Experience and Qualifications:							
30 (# points max)	28.33	27.00	22.33	30.00	17.00	27.67	26.67
Respondents evaluated on experience and qualifications (15 pts) - A. Qualifications in performing specific job requirements stated (15 pts) - B. Experience in management, technology, accounting, etc.							
Response of References:							
30 (# points max)	24.00	30.00	30.00	30.00	30.00	30.00	30.00
Quality and presentation of response to RFP including: (15 pts) - A. Complete projects on-time, within budget. (15 pts) - B. Communicates and interacts with all staff levels and produces high-quality results.							
Quality of Response and Presentation:							
10 (# points max)	7.33	9.00	4.33	9.33	4.00	4.67	5.33
(5pts) - A. Readability, completeness, understanding of project scope. (5pts) - B. Adherence to response format requirements.							
Average	78.55	85.22	78.80	81.84	81.00	76.85	75.87
(Maximum 100 points)							
RANK	5	1	4	2	3	6	7



**CITY OF EL PASO
REQUEST FOR PROPOSAL TABULATION FORM**



Bid Opening Date: November 16, 2011
Project Name: Benefit Consulting Services

Solicitation #: 2012-031R
Department: Human Resources

AON RISK INSURANCE SERVICES WEST, INC	ALBUQUERQUE, NM
CREST BENEFITS CONSULTING A DIVISION OF JDW INSURANCE	EL PASO, TX
GALLAGHER BENEFIT SERVICES, INC.	GREENWOOD VILLAGE, CO
HAY GROUP, INC.	DALLAS, TX
HOLMES MURPHY & ASSOCIATES, INC	DALLAS, TX
THE SEGAL COMPANY (WESTERN STATES) INC.	TEMPE, AZ
WELLS FARGO INSURANCE SERVICES USA, INC,	EL PASO, TX
RFPs SOLICITED: 27	RFPs RECEIVED: 7
RFPs LOCAL: 4	NO RFPs: 0

NOTE: The information contained in this rfp tabulation is for information only and does not constitute actual award/execution of contract.

APPROVED: /s/

DATE: 11/21/11

BBVA COMPASS
ATTN: JIM VOLK
690 SUNLAND PARK DRIVE
EL PASO, TX 79912

HEWITT ASSOCIATES
2201 WEST ROYAL LANE SUITE 100
IRVING, TX 75063

MILLIMAN CONSULTANTS AND ACTUARIES
ATTN: DONALD M. SIMS
3000 BAYPORT DRIVE, SUITE 880
TAMPA, FL 33607

HEROD CONSULTING, INC.
ATTN: DEB HEROD
3320 PURDUE
DALLAS, TX 75225

THE ABE PEINADO INSURANCE GROUP
ATTN: ABE PEINADO
801 MYRTLE AVE 105
EL PASO, TX 79901

AON RISK SOLUTIONS - EMP. BENEFITS
CONSULTING GROUP
ATTN: REBECCA ELLIS - ACCT. EXECUTIVE
6000 UPTOWN BLVD. NE SUITE 400
ALBUQUERQUE, NM 87110

McGRIFF, SEIBELS & WILLIAMS
ATTN: JARRAD A. WILLIS
5949 SHERRY LANE SUITE 1300
DALLAS, TX 75225
(NOT DELIVERABLE AS ADDRESSED - UTF)

SEGAL COMPANY
6375 WEST LOOP SOUTH SUITE 610
BELLAIRE, TX 77401
(NOT DELIVERABLE AS ADDRESSED)
(UNABLE TO FORWARD)

ERNST & YOUNG LLP
2121 SAN JACINTO #1500
DALLAS, TX 75201
(ATTEMPTED - NOT KNOWN)
(UNABLE TO FORWARD)

MERCER HUMAN RESOURCES CONSULTANTS
1225 17TH STREET SUITE 1300
DENVER, CO 80202

EICHLITZ, DENNIS, WRAY & WESTHEIMER
AGENCY, INC.
131 INTERPARK BLVD
SAN ANTONIO, TEXAS 78216

RWL GROUP
300 N. COIT ROAD #810
RICHARDSON, TX 75080

ICAUGHT INCORPORATED
ATTN: KIM J. KUYKENDALL
3616 FAR WEST BLVD. SUITE 117, PMB 309
AUSTIN, TX 78731

MARKETING DEPARTMENT
VITECH SYSTEMS GROUP, INC.
401 PARK AVENUE SOUTH
NEW YORK, NY 10016

GALLAGER BENEFIT SERVICES INC
6399 SOUTH FIDDLER'S GREEN CIRCLE
SUITE 200
GREENWOOD VILLAGE, CO 80111-4949

HAY GROUP
ATTN: SHELLI ROGERS
8350 NORTH CENTRAL EXPRESSWAY STE 825
DALLAS, TX 75206
(ATTEMPTED - NOT KNOWN - UTF)

WATSON WYATT CONSULTING SERVICES
2001 ROSS AVENUE SUITE 4200
DALLAS, TX 75201-2989
(ATTEMPTED - NOT KNOWN)
(UNABLE TO FORWARD)

REDOAK CONSULTING
ATTN: HY POMERANCE
1902 WRIGHT PLACE SUITE 180
CARLSBAD, CA 92008-6528
(NOT DELIVERABLE AS ADDRESSED-UTF)

WELLS FARGO INSURANCE SERVICES
ATTN: DEBORAH FALKNOR
2505 E. MISSOURI
EL PASO, TX 79903

HOLMES MURPHY & ASSOCIATES
3333 LEE PARKWAY
SUITE 900
DALLAS, TX 75219

SEGAL
ATTN: GARY L PETERSEN
1230 WEST WASHINGTON STREET, SUITE
501
TEMPE, ARIZONA 85281-1248

SMITH & ASSOCIATES CONSULTING
P.O. BOX 92398
SOUTHLAKE, TX 76092

REDOAK CONSULTING
DIV OF MALCOLM PIRBIE INC
100 CONGRESS AVENUE SUITE 225
AUSTIN, TX 78701

BUCK CONSULTANTS (AN ACS COMPANY)
ATTN: ROBYN BAYNE OR TIMOTHY D.
OLIVER
14911 QUORUM DRIVE SUITE 200
DALLAS, TEXAS 75254

CREST BENEFITS
JDW INSURANCE
415 E YANDELL
EL PASO, TX 79901
(ATTEMPTED - NOT KNOWN - UTF)

TOWERS & PERRIN
12377 MERIT DRIVE SUITE 1200
DALLAS, TX 75251-3234
(INSUFFICIENT ADDRESS)
(UNABLE TO FORWARD)

RUSTEBERG & ASSOCIATES
1010 EAST TYLER
HARLINGEN, TX 78550
(NOT DELIVERABLE AS ADDRESSED)
(UNABLE TO FORWARD)