

**CITY OF EL PASO, TEXAS  
REQUEST FOR COUNCIL ACTION**

**DEPARTMENT:** Office of Management & Budget/Insurance & Benefits

**AGENDA DATE:** May 6, 2008

**CONTACT PERSON/PHONE:** David Almonte ; Terrence Freiburg, Purchasing Manager, 541-4313

**DISTRICT(S) AFFECTED:** All

**SUBJECT:**

Approve the award of Solicitation # RFP2008-092R, Worker's Compensation Third Party Administrator to Claims Administrative Services, Inc. (CAS) as recommended by the Office of Management and Budget and the evaluation committee for an estimated three year total of \$3,542,562.00 beginning on August 1, 2008 through July 31, 2011 with an option to renew for two one year renewal options.

**BACKGROUND / DISCUSSION:**

On December 25, 2007 RFP #2008-092R was released for Third Party Administrative Services. Proposals were due back on January 30, 2008. A listing of all the vendors that submitted proposals is attached.

The evaluation committee consisted of eleven employees from different departments and representatives from the different employee associations; The El Paso Municipal Employees Association, El Paso Municipal Police Officers Association and Local 51 Fire Fighters Association, two employees from administration and Rebecca Ramirez, an outside consultant with Risk and Insurance Management Consultants, Inc. The initial rating of all the vendors was done in accordance with Purchasing Policies and Procedures. The committee members rated each of the different providers. One vendor did not include the estimated total cost for medical cost containment and was declared non-responsive. Of the remaining vendors, the vendor with the lowest pricing received the lowest overall scores in the remaining evaluation criteria. The three vendors with the highest scores were invited to presentations held on April 3, 2008. The top three were Claims Administrative Services, Inc., NovaPro Risk Solutions, Inc. and Tristar Risk Management. Attached is the final scoring sheet for all the vendors. The evaluation committee determined that Claims Administrative Services, Inc. provided the best value for the service. There are no citizen concerns.

**PRIOR COUNCIL ACTION:**

N/A

**AMOUNT AND SOURCE OF FUNDING:**

Budgeted item in the Worker's Compensation Fund - #99100255-45122-502200

**BOARD / COMMISSION ACTION:**

N/A

CITY CLERK DEPT.  
08 APR 29 AM 9:23

\*\*\*\*\*REQUIRED AUTHORIZATION\*\*\*\*\*

**LEGAL:** (if required) \_\_\_\_\_ **FINANCE:** (if required) \_\_\_\_\_

**DEPARTMENT HEAD:** David Almonte

Information copy to appropriate Deputy City Manager

**APPROVED FOR AGENDA:**

**CITY MANAGER:** \_\_\_\_\_ **DATE:** \_\_\_\_\_

PROJECT FORM

DATE: APRIL 22, 2008

PROJECT: WORKERS' COMPESATION THIRD PARTY ADMINISTRATOR
RFP NO.: 2008-092R
DEPARTMENT: OMB/INSURANCE AND BENEFITS
BUDGET No.: 99100255-502200 45122
FUNDING SOURCE: OMB BENEFITS ADMINISTRATOR (TBA)
RESPRESENTATIVE DISTRICT(S): ALL

RECOMMENDATION:
VENDOR: CLAIMS ADMINISTRATIVE SERVICES (CAS), INC TYLER, TX
ITEM(S) ALL
TOTAL EST
3 YEAR AWARD: \$3,542,562.00
OPTIONS: TWO YEARS
DISCOUNT: NONE

Financial Services, Purchasing Division and Office of Management & Budget/Insurance and Benefits and staff recommend awards as indicated.

It is requested authorization for City Attorney's Office to review, and the City Manager of the City of El Paso be authorized to sign any contracts or documents required to effectuate this award.

RFPS SOLICITED 25 RFPS LOCALS 07
RFPS RECEIVED 05
RFPS SVCS 06
"NO BIDS" RECEIVED 00

CURRENT TAXES PAID
OUT-OF-TOWN

TOTAL ANNUAL AWARD: \$3,542,562.00
FUNDS: AVAILABLE NOT AVAILABLE COMPTROLLER
COUNCIL: APPROVED REJECTED CITY CLERK

APPROVED: COUNCIL MEETING OF MAY 6, 2008

Handwritten signature of Terrence Freiburg
TERRENCE FREIBURG
PURCHASING MANAGER

		<b>Total Points - Average</b>					
Company		Claims Administrative Services - CAS	TRISTAR Risk Management	TRISTAR Risk Management	1-2-1 Claims, Inc.	NovaPro Risk Solutions	American Administrative Group - AAG
			Option1	Option 2			
Evaluation criteria is as follows:							
Evaluation Criteria	Maximum Points						
Service Capability, Responsiveness to RFP	40	35.60	35.40	32.20	27.40	31.20	Non-responsive*
Administrative Fees, Guarantees	40	34.74	30.08	31.44	40.00	34.35	Non-responsive*
		(\$3,542,562)	(\$4,091,656)	(\$3,914,748)	(\$3,076,687)	(\$3,582,624)	(Non-responsive)
Financial Stability	10	8.80	8.90	8.90	4.50	9.40	Non-responsive*
Quality of Response	10	8.60	8.50	7.70	6.20	6.50	Non-responsive*
<b>Total</b>	<b>100</b>	<b>87.74</b>	<b>82.88</b>	<b>80.24</b>	<b>78.10</b>	<b>81.45</b>	Non-responsive*
*Non-responsive - did not include total cost for medical cost containment							

CRAWFORD & COMPANY  
ATTN: BOB MINNIE  
6044 GATEWAY EAST STE. 600  
EL PASO, TEXAS 79905

*change of address*  
*4120 Rio Bravo St Ste 303*  
*El Paso, TX 79905*

CSI RISK SERVICES  
ATTN: ADAM COOK  
11490 WESTHEIMER STE. 500  
HOUSTON, TEXAS 77077

*UTF*

GENEX SERVICES INC.  
ATTN: ERNEST GALVAN  
11118 WURZBACH RD STE. 301  
SAN ANTONIO, TEXAS 78230

LINDSEY MORDEN CLAIMS  
MANAGEMENT  
LOS ARCOS BLDG #105  
4141 PINNACLE STREET  
EL PASO, TEXAS 79902

*UTF*

ATTN: KATHLEEN BECKER  
NOVAPRO  
300 E MAIN STE 740  
EL PASO TX 79901

SOUTHWEST ADJUSTING  
SERVICES, INC.  
1326 E. YANDELL DR.  
EL PASO, TEXAS 79902

STINSON & SON INSURANCE  
AGENCY  
ATTN: MELANIE STINSON  
9900 MONTANA AVE. 200N.  
EL PASO, TEXAS 79925

*change of address*  
*LETTERS step*

ATTN: JACQUE SMITH  
HEALTHWATCH, INC.  
5580 HARVEST HILL RD. #1004  
DALLAS, TX 75230

*UTF*

TRI STAR RISK MANAGEMENT  
100 OCEANGATE STE 700  
LONG BEACH CA 90802

ATTN: JIM BRUNDAGE  
ROGERS & BELDING  
INSURANCE AGENCY, INC.  
2505 EAST MISSOURI  
EL PASO, TX 79903

DELOITTE & TOUCHE  
ATTN: JAN CHAPMAN  
3300 CLAY STREET STE. 2300  
HOUSTON, TEXAS 77002

*UTF*

FORTE MANAGED CARE  
ATTN: MUNDY HEBERT  
7600 CHEVY CHASE DR. STE. 400  
AUSTIN, TEXAS 78752

ATTN: TERRY TURON  
CRAWFORD & COMPANY  
3100 SO. GESSNER, SUITE 518  
HOUSTON, TX 77063

ATTN: KAREN READING  
GALLAGHER BASSET SERVICES INC.  
6504 INTERNATIONAL PARKWAY  
SUITE 2100  
PLANO, TX 75093

ATTN: FRANK CHAVEZ  
CONCENTRA MEDICAL CENTERS  
6320 GATEWAY EAST  
EL PASO, TX 79905

ATTN: JOHNNY ROGERS  
ARGUS SERVICES CORPORATION  
9500 FOREST LANE STE. 300 LB-16  
DALLAS, TEXAS 75243

*UTF*

ATTN: SHELLY BORDONARO  
REVIEW MED  
10300 N. CENTRAL EXPRESSWAY  
SUITE 450  
DALLAS, TX 75231

ATTN: ROBYN C. TYDELSKI  
HAMMERMAN & GAINER, INC.  
800 W. AIRPORT FREEWAY,  
SUITE 314  
DALLAS, TX 75062

ATTN: BART GRIFFIN  
BARRON RISK MANAGEMENT  
SERVICES  
5815 CALLAGHAN ROAD  
SAN ANTONIO, TX 78228

*UTF*

ATTN: BART GRIFFIN  
BARRON RISK MANAGEMENT  
SERVICES  
3445 EXECUTIVE CENTER STE 201  
AUSTIN, TX 78731

ALTERNATIVE SERVICE CONCEPTS  
ATTN: DWIGHT ARPIN VP  
293 FOREST BROOK BLVD.  
MANDEVILLE, LA 70448

ATTN: KATHERINE BENEVIDES  
IMO INC.  
4100 MIDWAY RD  
SUITE 1145  
CARROLLTON, TX 75007

MCM SOLUTIONS  
ATTN: LINDA DAVIDSON JOHNSON  
212 COLINA ALTA  
EL PASO, TEXAS 79912

KIM JONES  
631 BURNING TREE LANE  
COPPELL, TX 75019

ATTN: SHERYL M. ROBERTS  
CCS CONSULTING, LP  
PROGRAM MANAGEMENT &  
CONSULTATION SERVICES  
6301 E. CAMPUS CIRCLE DR. STE 100  
IRVING, TX 75063

*UTF*