

CITY OF EL PASO, TEXAS

AGENDA ITEM DEPARTMENT HEAD'S SUMMARY FORM

DEPARTMENT: ENGINEERING AND CONSTRUCTION MANAGER

AGENDA DATE: MAY 29, 2012

CONTACT PERSON/PHONE: ALAN SHUBERT, CITY ENGINEER, 541-4428
BRUCE D. COLLINS, PURCHASING MANAGER, 541-4313

DISTRICT (S) AFFECTED: ALL

SUBJECT:

Engineering and Construction Management requests the Award of Solicitation 2012-121R Real Estate Management Services to TVO Management Services, LLC. The Solicitation and recommended award is broken into two components, Item I – Brokerage Services and Item II Consulting and Support Services. The Brokerage Services and commissions that will be incurred on a case by case basis as the transaction need arises for acquisitions and dispositions of real property or substantive leases. The Consulting and Support Services, some currently done by City staff that will also be incurred on an as needed basis (hourly), not to exceed the recommended annual amount of \$300,000.00 plus 4 percent commission per Real Estate Transaction. The initial term award amount shall not exceed \$900,000.00 (3 years) plus 4 percent commission per real estate transaction.

BACKGROUND / DISCUSSION:

Engineering and Construction Management has reviewed solicitation 2012-121R and recommends the contract to be awarded to TVO Management Services, LLC for the entire 3 year term.

The City of El Paso has a real estate portfolio consisting of approximately 4,562 properties associated with the wide range of services provided by the municipal organization. The City of El Paso was seeking assistance in managing this portfolio with the exceptions of City owned properties managed by the El Paso International Airport and the El Paso Water Utilities.

Common property types include land, building structures, and the acquisition and sale of real property to support the City's strategic interests. Included in this portfolio are approximately 104 leases in which the City is either the lessee or the lessor.

Six companies submitted offers to become the City's contract for Real Estate Management Services, and four (4) companies were selected for the submission of Best and Final Offers. These companies were evaluated by an Evaluation Committee comprised of members from the Engineering and Construction Management and City Manager's Office. A member of the Purchasing Division oversaw the solicitation process. TVO Management Services, LLC received the highest score from the Evaluation Committee.

SELECTION SUMMARY:

Solicitation was advertised on 12/20/2011 and 12/27/2011. The postcards were mailed out on 12/20/2011. The solicitation was posted on City website on 12/20/2011. The email (Purmail) notification was sent out on 12/20/2011. Six proposals were received and they are all local vendors.

PRIOR COUNCIL ACTION:

None

AMOUNT AND SOURCE OF FUNDING:

City General Funds, Certificates of Obligation, City Enterprise Department Funds, City Grant Sources

COUNCIL PROJECT FORM

(RFP OR RFQ)

*******POSTING LANGUAGE BELOW*******

Please place the following item on the **REGULAR** agenda for the Council Meeting of **MAY 29, 2012**.

Discussion and action on the award of Solicitation No. 2012-121R (Real Estate Management Services) to TVO Management Services, LLC for an initial term estimated award of \$900,000.00 plus 4 percent commission per real estate transaction.

Department: Engineering and Construction Management
Award to: TVO Management Services, LLC
El Paso, TX
Items: All
Item I. Brokerage Services – Commission Based Per Transaction
Item II. Consulting and Support Services – Annual Estimated Amount of \$300,000.00
Option: 1 year
Annual Estimated Amount: Item I. 4 percent commission per Real Estate Transaction
Item II. \$300,000.00 Consulting and Support Services
Initial Term Estimated Award: Item I. 4 percent commission per Real Estate Transaction
Item II. \$900,000.00 (3 years) Consulting and Support Services
Total Estimated Award: \$1,200,000.00 (4 years) Consulting and Support Services plus cost incurred 4 percent commission per Real Estate Transaction
Account No.: City General Funds, Certificates of Obligation, City Enterprise Department Funds, City Grant Sources
Funding Source: City General Funds, Certificates of Obligation, City Enterprise Department Funds, City Grant Sources
District(s): All

This is an RFP, hourly rate and commissioned based service contract.

The Financial Services - Purchasing Division and Engineering and Construction Management Departments recommends award as indicated to TVO Management Services, LLC, the highest ranked proposer based on evaluation factors established for this procurement.

*******ADDITIONAL INFO BELOW*******

COMMITTEE SCORE SHEET

Request for Proposals

SOLICITATION TITLE: REAL ESTATE MANAGEMENT SERVICES

SOLICITATION NO: 2012-121R

EVALUATION FACTORS B-E	MAX POINTS	CBRE, INC.	LEWIS REALTY GROUP, INC	TVO MANAGEMENT SERVICES, LLC	WRIGHT DEVELOPMENT SERVICES, LLC
		EL PASO, TX	EL PASO, TX	EL PASO, TX	AUSTIN, TX
B: EXPERIENCE AND QUALIFICATIONS					
A. Qualifications in performance in real estate planning, lease evaluation, portfolio management, and evaluation of surplus real property	12.50	11.88	9.63	10.13	9.63
B. Experience within the past three (3) years in marketing, promoting, and selling commercial properties, multi-lot transactions, and/or complex commercial transactions similar in scope	12.50	11.88	9.25	11.13	9.50
SUBTOTAL EVALUATION FACTOR B:	25	23.76	18.88	21.26	19.13
C: CORPORATE EXPERIENCE					
Provide experience in last 10 years experience in each of the following: General consulting and strategic planning services for both public and private real estate owners, Quantitative and qualitative analysis of real estate decision-making, Financing of real estate transactions, Property valuation, Property management, Facilities management and Real Estate project management.		19.00	16.75	17.00	15.25
SUBTOTAL EVALUATION FACTOR C:	20	19.00	16.75	17.00	15.25
D: KEY PERSONNEL					
A. The resumes of key personnel and staff who work on this transaction, including the experience of such key personnel and staff in managing and performing services of similar complexity and scope.	7.50	5.75	6.25	5.75	7.25
B. Licenses and Designations. Respondent must have a current Texas real estate broker's license and be in good standing under same with the Texas Real Estate Commission. Respondent (and key personnel) must demonstrate that they are in good standing in the State of Texas under all other relevant professional licenses and designations.	7.50	7.50	7.50	7.50	7.50
SUBTOTAL EVALUATION FACTOR D:	15	5.75	6.25	5.75	7.25
E: REFERENCES					
A. Complete projects on-time, within budget	5.00	3.33	3.33	3.00	5.00
B. Communications and interacts with all staff levels and produces high-quality results	5.00	5.00	3.33	3.00	5.00
SUBTOTAL EVALUATION FACTOR E:	10	8.33	6.66	6.00	10.00
TOTAL POINTS (B-E)	70	56.84	48.54	50.01	51.63
Fee Proposal (A) (See Attached)	30	18.89	21.79	26.25	24.55
TOTAL POINTS (A-E)	100	75.73	70.33	76.26	76.18



CITY OF EL PASO REQUEST FOR PROPOSAL TABULATION FORM



Bid Opening Date: February 1, 2012
Project Name: Real Estate Management Services

Solicitation #: 2012-121R
Department: Engineering And Construction Management

BUILDING SOLUTIONS, LLC	EL PASO, TX
CBRE, INC.	EL PASO, TX
LEWIS REALTY GROUP, INC.	EL PASO, TX
RIO GRANDE BASIN REALTY LP dba NAI EL PASO	EL PASO, TX
TVO MANAGEMENT SERVICES, LLC	EL PASO, TX
WRIGHT DEVELOPMENT SERVICES, LLC	EL PASO, TX
RFPs SOLICITED: 15	RFPs RECEIVED: 6
RFPs LOCAL: 13	NO RFPs: 0

NOTE: The information contained in this rfp tabulation is for information only and does not constitute actual award/execution of contract.

APPROVED: Isl

DATE: 2/9/12

MR. SERGIO TINAJERO
7598 N. MESA AVE. STE B1
EL PASO, TEXAS 79912

MR. CHRISTIAN PEREZ GIESE
CBRE, INC.
WELLS FARGO TOWER
221 NORTH KANSAS, STE 2100
EL PASO, TEXAS 79901

MR. JIM HEBERT
URIBE MANAGEMENT, LLC
7598 N. MESA AVE. STE. B1
EL PASO, TX 79912

MS. ROSALINDA GUTIERREZ
GCA REAL ESTATE & INVESTORS
1058 WHIRLAWAY DR.
EL PASO, TEXAS 79936

MR. ADRIAN SLATER
CUSHMAN & WAKEFIELD
201 E. AMIN STREET, STE 1516
EL PASO, TEXAS 79901

MR. RUSSELL VANDENBURG
TWO NORTH AMERICA
221 NORTH KANSAS ST. 16TH FLOOR
EL PASO, TEXAS 79901

*AU-001
UAA*

MR. DAVID KARAM, CCIM
JAXON TEXAS
4025 ROADSIDE CT
EL PASO, TEXAS 79922

MR. MAX PRESTRIDGE
NAI EL PASO
12350 MONTWOOD #100
EL PASO, TX 79928

BRETT C. PRESTON, CCIM
RJL REAL ESTATE CONSULTANTS
725 S. MESA HILLS, BLDG 1, STE 1
EL PASO, TX 79912

CURTIS R. SELLERS
RALPH SELLERS & ASSOCIATES
8020-A ARTCRAFT ROAD
EL PASO, TX 79932

TOMMY LEWIS
COLDWELL BANKER COMMERCIAL
LEWIS REALTY GROUP, INC.
7338 REMCON CIRCLE SUITE 100
EL PASO, TX 79912

THE GILBERT LAW FIRM
201 E. MAIN, SUITE 1501
EL PASO, TX 79901

M.D. WEBB & ASSOCIATES INC.
ATTN: MELANIE COLTON
1500 QUAIL STREET, SUITE 300
NEWPORT BEACH, CA 92660

No Bid

W.F. KARAM, INC.
12912 HILL COUNTRY BLVD
BLDG. F SUITE 215
AUSTIN, TX 78738

BUILDING SOLUTIONS LLC
404 W. OVERLAND
EL PASO, TX 79901