

OSCAR LEESER
MAYOR



JOYCE WILSON
CITY MANAGER

CITY COUNCIL
ANN MORGAN LILLY, DISTRICT 1
LARRY ROMERO, DISTRICT 2
EMMA ACOSTA, DISTRICT 3
CARL ROBINSON, DISTRICT 4
MICHEL NOE, DISTRICT 5
EDDIE HOLGUIN JR., DISTRICT 6
LILY LIMÓN, DISTRICT 7
CORTNEY NILAND, DISTRICT 8

SPECIAL MEETING OF THE CITY COUNCIL MINUTES
COUNCIL CHAMBERS
November 18, 2013

The City Council met at the above place and date. Meeting was called to order at 10:02 a.m. Mayor Oscar Leeser, present and presiding and the following Council Members answered roll call: Cortney Niland, Larry Romero, Emma Acosta, Carl Robinson, Michiel Noe, Lily Limón and Ann Morgan Lilly. Late arrival: Eddie Holguin, Jr. at 10:10 a.m.

-
1. Presentation, discussion and action regarding the procedure for the recruitment and hiring of a City Manager to replace the current City Manager upon the effective date of her resignation and expiration of her employment contract on September 30, 2014.

Ms. Linda Ball Thomas, Director of Human Resources, gave a brief Powerpoint presentation (on file in the City Clerk's office).

Representative Acosta asked Ms. Thomas how the firms were narrowed down.

Representative Lilly questioned, "How will the selected company narrow down the finalists for the position?" She also questioned, "How many search firms do they choose?"

Ms. Linda Thomas responded, "One."

Representative Limón asked if any of the three firms was the firm who selected our current City Manager.

Ms. Thomas responded, "No."

-
2. Discussion and action regarding the selection of an executive search firm to recruit a new City Manager for the City of El Paso and presentations by the following firms:

- a) Affion Public, LLC.
- b) Strategic Government Resources (SGR)
- c) The Waters Consulting Group, Inc.

Mr. Scott Riley, Affion Public LLC, presented himself and his company's proposal. There was no Powerpoint presentation. (Council members had hard copies.)

Mayor Leeser asked Mr. Riley, "What number of candidates would be best to put forward?"

Mr. Riley responded, "Eight to ten, narrowed down to four or five."

Representative Lilly asked Mr. Riley about San Antonio's City Manager recruitment.

Mr. Riley responded he had recruited City Managers for Austin and San Antonio.

Mayor Leeser asked Mr. Riley (a) "What length of time Affion has been in business and Mr. Riley's experience? (b) What are some of the challenges they need to be prepared for? (c) Current City employees and City residents, does the firm treat them the same as outsiders?"

Mr. Riley replied that big cities are hard to manage so the fishing hole for candidates is a lot smaller. Texas is an attractive state, but El Paso's geography and climate can be a challenge. There is not one stitch of difference in how Affion treats current city employees, city residents and outsiders.

Representative Robinson asked Mr. Riley, "What is the optimum time frame for a City Manager?"

Mr. Riley responded that ICMA says five to seven years. If a City wants a cultural change, it is four to five years.

Representative Robinson then asked, "How about the unsuccessful placements?"

Mr. Riley responded one Council wanted a nontraditional candidate and he last only 1 ½ years.

Representative Robinson asked, "If Affion operates primarily in Texas?"

Mr. Riley replied, "Lately in Texas, but in other states as well." He said Texas and California have the strongest City Manager climates/systems.

Representative Robinson asked, "What challenges do we have in recruiting?"

Mr. Riley responded that both Phoenix and Dallas are recruiting, but other than that, no big challenges.

Representative Robinson asked, "If salary is an issue?"

Mr. Riley responded that salary is always an issue.

Representative Robinson asked Mr. Riley to name successes from cities of comparable size.

Mr. Riley named San Antonio and Austin.

Representative Niland commented that she is impressed by Affion's stakeholders meetings and asked Mr. Riley to explain stakeholders meetings.

Mr. Riley stated he facilitates conversation and tries to get as many of the 20% involved citizens in the room as possible. He would start with each City Council member.

Representative Niland asked Mr. Riley to explain how he works with Council to put together a competitive package.

Mr. Riley replied, "Benchmarking. You get what you pay for. You may be able to get a good candidate who has all the attributes, but does not have the wealth of experience." He would also cautioned against taking an unproven talent.

Representative Niland asked, "What top three qualities are most important to the successful candidate?"

Mr. Riley responded, "Humbleness and fiscally smart."

Mayor Leeser agrees we do not want to talk about pay first.

Representative Limón asked, “Are you familiar with the history of El Paso and the turmoil that we’ve gone through over the last two years, and what affect will it have on the pool of applicants?”

Mr. Riley responded, “On the right applicants, not much affect. It does not scare me.”

Representative Lilly asked, “Is he bidding for Dallas and Phoenix?”

Mr. Riley replied those cities’ contacts have been awarded and Affion is not doing any of those.

Representative Acosta stated that page 14 lists a guarantee of 24 months to re-recruit if a person does not work out.

Mr. Riley responded that he never had to fulfill a guarantee.

.....
Cindy Brown, Strategic Government Resources (SGR), gave their company’s presentation. There was no power point.

SGR conducted both, MPO Director and Communications Director search here. Clients in 41 states recent City Manager searches 50% in State and 50% out of state.

Mr. Ron Hallerfield is a previous City Manager in Garland, Fort Worth, Plano, Amarillo, and Irving, Texas. Mr. Hallerfield was among the 2011 Survey City Manager professionals.

Mayor Leeser asked in the last 24 months, “How many recruitments have they conducted?”

Ms. Cindy Brown responded, “24 to 30 on going each month.”

Representative Acosta replied she does not see the timeline. February 6, 15 weeks, 26 million, guarantee of 24 months they will redo the search. Three times, SGR has had to make good on the guarantee in 14 years. The next two times the same person took a job in two different cities.

Mayor Leeser asked, “Based on knowledge of El Paso, “What are the toughest obstacles?”

Ms. Brown responded timeline is four months.

Representative Limon questioned, “Recruitment of female and executive minority candidates?”

Ms. Brown responded it’s part of their advertising process to recruit for female and minority candidates.

.....
Mr. Chuck Roar, The Waters Consulting Group, Inc., gave an overview of their presentation.

National network of potential candidates with recruitments as large as El Paso. Right now we are doing a recruitment in Irving, Texas. Career navigator tool looks at 17 different dimensions regarding the candidate in three broad categories. “How they think, how they work, and how they relate to others.”

On line survey web-based allows employees to provide input on what they would like in the new City Manager and allows the public to give that same input. Offers a triple guarantee: two years no poaching; continue to work until we are satisfied.

“Team building session to bring in 60 to 90 days after new City Manager is in place to see if the performance and expectations are aligned. We will conduct a 360 performance review at the twelve month period. We will meet with Council and ask for five most desired skills out of seventeen, then match up candidates.”

“Returned search firm, do not have any contractual relationships with any individual candidates. They work for the entity only.”

Once selected the timeline is 50 days. The new City Manager will be here in the office by early spring. Cost is \$23,500 plus travel costs for the candidates to come here to interview.

Mayor Leeser asked, “How many candidates as final interview for candidates?”

Mr. Roar replied four to seven but he is most comfortable with five or six.

Representative Robinson asked “Success in Cleveland?” and “Success rate overall?”

Mr. Roar replied very good, only had to implement the guarantee twice in 20 years.

Representative Robinson asked Mr. Roar to explain the triple guarantee. Mr. Roar explained it.

Representative Robinson wants a monetary penalty.

Mr. Roar said he would check with his corporate office on that.

Representative Robinson asked, “Commitment to diversity?”

Mr. Roar explained their history with minority recruitment. They look at two things: 1) Are their placements diverse with individuals of protocol chosen? 2) Does their pool of candidates reflect diversity?

Representative Robinson also asked Mr. Roar to name the current and previous clients.

Mr. Roar replied, “Irving, Texas for City Manager; Denton, Texas for Engineering Director; and Copeland, Texas for EPPD Police Chief.”

Representative Lilly asked, “Fort Worth recruitments?”

Mr. Roar responded, “Three Assistant City Managers recently; City Manager six years ago.”

Representative Lilly asked “Would they be willing to talk with community group stake holders, such as Chamber of Commerce?”

Representative Acosta asked, “How often has the company used the guarantee?”

Representative Holguin asked Mr. Roar, “Guarantee?” Mr. Roar replied, “Two he personally knows of.”

Representative Holguin asked “How about for the whole company?”

Mr. Roar replied, "Maybe one or two others."

Mayor Leeser asked City Attorney Sylvia Firth if we have sent City Manager Joyce Wilson her letter accepting her resignation effective September 30, 2013. Ms. Firth replied she has been waiting for Council to act on that.

Representative Niland said she was impressed with Affion.

Representative Holguin asked, "How did we select the finalists and who was involved in determining the finalists?"

Ms. Linda Thomas, Human Resources Director, replied that she selected the finalists.

Representative Holguin asked, "Did City Manager have any say so?"

Ms. Thomas replied, "No."

Mayor Leeser had asked Ms. Thomas to select the firms. She explained.

Representative Holguin asked Ms. Wilson, "Did you have any influence?"

Ms. Wilson replied, "No, I did not. Ms. Thomas did research and selected the finalists."

Ms. Wilson explained SGR did MPO and Fire Chief Recruitments. She did work with Waters.

Mayor Leeser asked for a citizens committee with everyone on Council appointing one person.

Representative Niland wants to get feedback from Affion representative and does not want to give the impression that the committee would be making the selection.

Mayor Leeser responded they would not be.

Representative Holguin stated he liked the committee idea.

Representative Acosta said she does not understand the concept of a committee.

Ms. Sylvia Firth responded there will be multiple panels to vet and interview the finalists.

Mayor Leeser explained the utility of the committee as advisory.

Representative Acosta believes the Council would be replaced by the committee in selecting the candidate.

Mayor Leeser explained the committee would not replace Council's decision making power.

Representative Acosta does not want this committee to take the place of Council. She wants to see all the candidates, herself, to select. She said she does not want to see only the short list of candidates.

Mayor Leeser responded this is one more way of allowing citizens to be involved in the working of the City and to show transparency.

1ST MOTION

Motion made by Mayor Pro Tempore Niland, seconded by Representative Romero, and carried to **HIRE** the executive firm Affion to recruit a new City Manager.

AYES: Representatives Lilly, Romero, Acosta, Robinson, Noe, Holguin, and Niland

NAYS: Representative Limón

2ND MOTION

Motion made by Representative Holguin, seconded by Representative Robinson, and unanimously carried to **APPROVE** a citizen’s advisory committee with each Council member appointing one person to the group.

3RD MOTION

Motion made by Representative Holguin, seconded by Representative Acosta, and unanimously carried to **ACCEPT** Ms. Wilson’s letter of resignation and give Ms. Wilson the letter of notice that her contract will not be renewed past the September 30, 2013 date.

Ms. Joyce Wilson explained the role of the citizens’ committee in the first City Manager recruitment.

Representative Niland asked for more explanation as to how a citizens committee operates.

Ms. Wilson explained again how it worked when she was hired.

Representative Robinson responded, “The more people engaged, the better the process. Why are we being afraid to engage more people?”

.....
Motion made by Mayor Pro Tempore Niland, seconded by Representative Romero, and unanimously carried to **ADJOURN** this meeting at 1:49 p.m.

.....
APPROVED AS TO CONTENT:

Richarda Duffy Momsen, City Clerk